

Scheduled for consideration by the Beaches, Parks and Recreation Commission at its regular meeting on June 8, 2021.



**CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE  
DRAFT MINUTES OF THE  
BEACHES, PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION  
REGULAR MEETING  
TUESDAY, APRIL 13, 2021 6:00 P.M.**

Chair Streger called the Regular Meeting of the Beaches, Parks and Recreation Commission of the City of San Clemente to order on Tuesday, April 13, 2021, at 6:02 p.m. via teleconference. Chair Pro Tem Bandaruk led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**PRESENT** Commissioners Richard Ayer, John Dorey, Bernie Wohlfarth, Chair Pro Tem John Bandaruk, Chair Steven Streger, Commissioner Charlie Smith arrived at 6:04pm during item 3.

**ABSENT** None

**STAFF PRESENT** Samantha Wylie, Recreation Manager  
Maile Stivers, Sr. Administrative Assistant

**1. SPECIAL PRESENTATIONS**

None.

**2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**A. February 9, 2021**

MOTION BY CHAIR PRO TEM BANDARUK, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER DOREY, AND CARRIED 4-0-1, WITH COMMISSIONER AYER ABSTAINING, to approve the Beaches, Parks and Recreation Commission meeting minutes of February 9, 2021.

**3. CURRENT COMMUNITY ACTIVITIES AND EVENTS**

**A. Recreation Division Update**

None.

**4. OLD BUSINESS**

**A. Consideration of Dog Access to Beaches and Parks**

Samantha Wylie, Recreation Manager, summarized the contents of the administrative report and responded to Commission inquiries.

Cynthia Mallett, Environmental Programs Supervisor, summarized the contents of the report attachment and responded to Commission inquiries regarding water quality, bacteria testing, Clean Ocean Program, testing practices in other cities, bacteria exceedances, and testing locations.

Recreation staff read the following communications which are on file with the City Clerk:

Ellie (no last name provided), communication dated April 13, 2021

Gloria Sinclair, communication dated April 13, 2021

Christine M. Lampert, communication dated April 13, 2021

Brian Baker, communication dated April 13, 2021

Emily Corbitt, communication dated April 13, 2021

Dina Jadallah, communication dated April 13, 2021

Raymond Eugene Flood, communication dated April 13, 2021

Hector Hernandez, communication dated April 13, 2021

Bill Kreutinger, communication dated April 13, 2021

Chris (no last name provided), communication dated April 13, 2021

Megan Rogers, communication dated April 13, 2021

Wendy Morris, communication dated April 13, 2021

Helen McCue, communication dated April 13, 2021

Emma Freer, communication dated April 13, 2021

Kathleen Ferry, communication dated April 13, 2021

Kaete Daum, communication dated April 13, 2021

David K, communication dated April 13, 2021

Bret Frohlich, communication dated April 13, 2021

Kelly Roemer, communication dated April 13, 2021

Commissioners either individually or in agreement provided the following comments:

- Local dog beaches are very large and can handle bacteria related to dog access.
- San Clemente beaches are small and shrinking.
- Improved dog amenities throughout the City are needed.
- Park areas could be fenced to accommodate off-leash dog access.
- Dog access to beaches could be addressed after sand replenishment.
- Clean ocean water attracts tourism.
- Comments were received that people may be less likely to support the Clean Ocean Fee if dog access is permitted.
- Off-leash dog access to beaches is not recommended.
- On-leash dog access to beaches would have limited benefit to dog owners.
- Marine Safety staff's priority is watching the water.
- Licensed dog owners are a small number of San Clemente residents.
- Dog access to beaches would not likely bring revenue to the City.
- There will be additional costs for water quality sampling.
- The City should identify opportunities for dog amenities.
- Dogs can be walked on-leash on the trails.
- Dog access to beaches could be restricted by time of year and/or time of day.
- Dog access to beaches could be supported if additional funding was allocated for enforcement and water testing.
- Dogs should not be allowed on the beach during the summer months.

- At high tide, Dije/204 beach does not exist.
- The beaches are busy at all times.
- North Beach is a location with sufficient parking.
- North Beach has a history of bacteria exceedances.
- The Beach Trail is an alternative to on-leash beach access.
- Beach Trail users are in motion.
- Action is needed for improved dog amenities in the City.
- Vista Hermosa Sports Park is a potential site for a temporary off-leash dog amenity.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER WOHLFARTH, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER AYER, AND FAILED 3-3, WITH COMMISSIONERS DOREY, SMITH, AND CHAIR STREGER OPPOSED, to recommend the City Council uphold the existing prohibition of dogs on beaches.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER SMITH to recommend no location for dogs on the beach. COMMISSIONER SMITH WITHDREW THE MOTION.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER WOHLFARTH, SECOND BY CHAIR PRO TEM BANDARUK, AND CARRIED 6-0, to recommend the City Council uphold current rules and regulations surrounding dog access to San Clemente beaches, and do not recommend any location for on-leash or off-leash dog access to City beaches.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER WOHLFARTH, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, AND CARRIED 6-0, to recommend the City Council earmark funding during this fiscal year process for increased and improved off-leash dog amenities as it would relate to our site specific park master plans and/or immediate funding for a temporary solution while we plan for more permanent amenities.

**5. NEW BUSINESS**

None.

**6. PUBLIC INPUT**

Recreation staff read the following communication which is on file with the City Clerk: Lara Buros, communication dated April 13, 2021 regarding a proposal to develop a Mental Health Access Permit for beaches.

**7. COMMUNICATIONS**

**A. Recreation Manager Report**

Samantha Wylie, Recreation Manager, communicated staff is currently working with SWA on the site specific park master plan updates project, and provided details on upcoming community workshops and survey; and communicated the City Council has extended the terms of Commissioners until August 30, 2021 to allow for review of Commission and Committee structures.

**B. Ad Hoc Water Quality Committee**

None.

**8. ITEMS FROM COMMISSION**

**A. Subcommittee Reports**

None.

**B. Items from Commissioners**

1. Friends of San Clemente Foundation – Commissioner Dorey reported the Foundation will not be holding the Sports Wall of Fame event this year, but will plan for the event in 2022; reported an upcoming golf tournament in June; and reported the Carnival is planned for October.
2. Courtney’s Sandcastle Charitable Foundation (CSC) – None.
3. PierPride – Chair Pro Tem Bandaruk reported the pier restroom improvements were completed; reported pier lighting will occur in October; and reported an upcoming fundraising auction for snack shack improvements.

**9. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no other business before the Commission, Chair Streger adjourned at 8:39 p.m. to a regular meeting on Tuesday, June 8, 2021 at 6:00 p.m. via teleconference.

---

Chairperson and Commissioner of the  
Beaches, Parks & Recreation Commission

---

Beaches, Parks & Recreation Director