



Design Review Subcommittee (DRSC)

Meeting Date: January 27, 2021

PLANNER: Katie Crockett, Associate Planner

SUBJECT: Site Plan Permit 20-134/ Cultural Heritage Permit 20-135, Shoreline Dental, 1409 S. El Camino Real, A request to demolish an existing single-story restaurant and build a two-story commercial building with approximately 6,000 square feet of gross floor area to house a dental office and a general office suite

BACKGROUND:

Site Information

The project site is located at 1409 S. El Camino Real, at the northwest corner of S. El Camino Real and W. Avenida Valencia, abutting exit 74 southbound ramp of the 5 Freeway (See Figure 1, below). The 24,406 square foot project site includes an approximately 25 foot wide portion of the adjacent lot to the northwest on which the subject site has an easement for parking. The lot is currently developed with a vacant single-story restaurant building.

Figure 1: Project Location



A historic structure assessment (HSA) was prepared by Brian F. Smith and Associates, Inc. to evaluate the existing building's eligibility for inclusion on the City's list of historic properties. The City's historic consultant, GPA Consulting, reviewed the HSA after DRSC

feedback and San Clemente Historic Society comments. GPA identified some missing information, such as additional background research, which was added in a revised HSA by the applicant's consultant (Attachment 6). Following review of the revised HAS, GPA concurred with the HSA conclusion that the 1963 Googie- and Contemporary-style commercial building is not historically or architecturally significant under any California Register of Historical Resources (CRHR) or City of San Clemente significance criteria due to an overall lack of original integrity.

Project Description

The applicant is proposing to demolish the vacant Tommy's restaurant building and develop a 5,927 square-foot, two-story office building. The building will house Shoreline Dental office (4,127 sf) on the first floor and an additional office space tenant (1,800 sf) on the second floor. The project includes 30 parking stalls (3 more than required for the proposed project), including required accessible parking spaces, and site landscape. The City of San Clemente's General Plan, Urban Design Element, Figure UD-1 identifies the area as a freeway gateway, and the design guidelines specify that this area can utilize Spanish Colonial Revival (SCR) or "other Spanish" style.

First DRSC Review

The Design Review Subcommittee (DRSC) first reviewed the project on September 9, 2020. Copies of the DRSC staff report and meeting minutes are attached as Attachments 1 and 2. Generally, DRSC had recommendations to improve the building architecture consistency with the SCR Design Guidelines and to refine the landscape plan. The DRSC's recommendations are summarized below.

ANALYSIS:

This report focuses on the recommendations made by DRSC and how those have been incorporated into the project design. For a full project description, see Attachment 1.

Table 1: DRSC Recommendations

DRSC Recommendation	Modifications
Recommended that the City's Historic Consultant should review the Historic Structure Assessment (HSA) submitted by the applicant.	Completed. The City's consultant, GPA, identified some missing information that precluded them from initially concurring with the applicant's HSA. After the applicant submitted a revised report, GPA concurred with the report conclusion that the existing restaurant building is not historically significant.

DRSC Recommendation	Modifications
Requested a roof plan and a cross-section showing roof equipment not visible from freeway	Partially Incorporated. See Sheet A3.3, Image 2 and cross section on sheet A3.2. Applicant states that A3.3 Image 2 is a rendering from the freeway. It does not show the horizon line (ocean). However, it does show, in conjunction with the section on A3.2 that the roof equipment will not be noticeable from the freeway. Significant views will not be blocked beyond what has already been considered for future development in this area, since the top of the building is one foot below the freeway floor and the development standards were developed with these views in mind.
Requested clarification on the easement for parking on the site.	Completed. The property line and easement on the adjacent property are shown on the site plan, and a letter of consent from the adjacent property owner has been provided (see Attachment 5). The easement will be formally updated and recorded as a condition of project approval.
Suggested modification to the retaining wall in the parking lot to allow for some landscape screening; identify wall finish.	Partially Incorporated. The wall will be finished with white stucco to match building. Parking lot layout not modified to allow for landscape screening.
Reconsider use of Quercus Ilex so close to the sidewalk and in close proximity to each other due to the size of the expected mature canopy.	Incorporated. Quercus Ilex (Holly Oak) replaced with Geijera Parviflora (Australian Willow). Australian Willow has an approximate 20' mature width compared to the Holly Oak's expected 50-60 foot canopy.
Ensure all plan sheets match; specifically, ensure all elevations and renderings show correct finished grade and better represent the planned landscape.	Incorporated. See plan set (Attachment 7).

DRSC Recommendation	Modifications
Recommended overall refinement and simplification of the design to align with SCR design standards, including removal of the glass railing, ensuring rafter tails are correctly spaced, utilization of vertical windows, and window insets.	Incorporated. Glass railing removed, vertical windows utilized, insets at windows provided. Rafter tail detail not provided. Appears somewhat widely spaced for the size, per the City's SCR Design Guidelines.
Refine arcade design, including aligning windows with arches, continuing the arcade around the corner, and reconsidering the rafter tails at the arcade given the potential nuisances related to birds.	Partially incorporated. Windows have been aligned with arches, arcade has been modified to not continue around the corner of the building. Number of rafter tails reduced, however, now they appear to be inappropriately spaced per the City's SCR Design Guidelines.

General Plan Consistency

The project is consistent with General Plan goals and policies, as outlined in Attachment 3.

Design Guidelines Consistency

As shown in the table above, the applicant has incorporated most of the modifications recommended by the DRSC, which has improved the project's consistency with Design Guidelines. The project's consistency with the Design Guidelines is outlined in Attachment 4. Staff does have minor recommendations as outlined below for better consistency with the Design Guidelines.

CONCLUSION:

The applicant has incorporated most of the DRSCs recommendations and the project is consistent with the General Plan and most Design Guidelines. Staff seeks DRSC concurrence with the below recommendations, and following revisions, recommends the project move forward to Planning Commission for a determination.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

The proposed project meets development standards and is generally consistent with General Plan goals and policies. Because the project is in a freeway gateway area, staff has the following recommendations to improve the project's consistency with Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to SCR architecture:

1. Simplify main tower, such that no “columns” on the tower are evident and no cornice detail is used.
2. Modify arcade to be a true covered arcade.
3. Update site lighting plan to show that lighting will comply with San Clemente Municipal Code 17.24.130 such that direct glare and reflections are contained within the boundaries of the parcel.

Staff seeks DRSC concurrence with the above recommendations and welcomes additional input. DRSC comments are intended to assist the applicant in designing a project that best complies with the City’s Design Guidelines and applicable City policies.

Attachments:

1. DRSC Report, September 9, 2020
2. DRSC Minutes, September 9, 2020
3. General Plan Consistency Analysis
4. Design Guidelines Consistency Analysis
5. Adjacent Property Owner Agreement
6. Historic Structure Analysis (Revised)
7. Plans

The applicant is proposing to demolish the vacant restaurant building and develop a 5,927 square foot building to house Shoreline Dental, a dental office, and an additional office tenant. The City of San Clemente's General Plan, Urban Design Element, Figure UD-1 identifies the area as a freeway gateway, and the design guidelines specify that this area can utilize Spanish Colonial Revival (SCR) or "other Spanish" style.

Figure 2: Existing Conditions



Why is DRSC Review Required?

SCMC Table 17.12.025 specifies that Design Review Subcommittee (DRSC) review is required for the Site Plan Permit and Cultural Heritage Permit to review site planning, parking lot design, setbacks, and compatibility with adjacent development, evaluate architectural design issues, such as quality and style, massing, scale, proportions, landscaping, materials, and design features. The purpose of the DRSC review is to advise applicants on how projects can best comply with general plan policies and/or design guidelines. The DRSC's recommendation will be forwarded to the Planning Commission, which is the final decision making authority for this item.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Site Design

The applicant proposed to demolish the one-story former Tommy's Restaurant building, relocate both existing driveways to the north (further from the freeway exit ramp), and construct a 5,927 square foot two-story office building. The building will house Shoreline Dental office (4,127 sf) on the first floor and an additional office space tenant (1,800 sf) on the second floor. The proposed site design includes 30 parking stalls (3 more than required for the proposed project), including required accessible parking spaces, and site landscape, including a landscape buffer area between the sidewalk and parking area that varies in width from 15 feet to 35 feet (Design Guidelines require at least 10 feet).

The building is located at the front property line, and is oriented toward both the street and parking lot, as required for Mixed Pedestrian and Auto Districts in the Design Guidelines. Parking is located to the side of the building and the trash enclosure, the sides of which are planted with climbing vines, is at the back of the site.

Architecture

The architecture is consistent with Spanish style architecture, and generally with SCR style. In particular, the applicant utilizes smooth white stucco, red tile roofing, well-proportioned arches, decorative lighting sconces, and dark trimmed windows with simulated divided lites. The building includes pedestrian arcade at the first floor and a large second floor deck, consistent with Spanish building design. There are a few opportunities to bring the architecture into further compliance with the Design Guidelines, such as utilizing two-piece clay tile roofing with random mortar packing and booster tiles at eaves and ridges, modification of the deck railing to stucco or wrought iron, and modifying the use of cornice trim, particularly at the corner tower element in order to make the roof tile more visible from the street. Consistency with City Design Guidelines is detailed in the Analysis section, below.

Landscaping and Signage

The applicant has provided a preliminary landscape plan (see sheets L-1 and L1.1 of Attachment 5), which have been reviewed and preliminarily approved by the City's Landscape Architect with some recommended adjustments, which are already reflected on the landscape plans attached. The plan utilizes fast-growing and drought-tolerant Shoestring Acacia and Australian Willow along the back property line to help screen the freeway exit ramp and associated retaining wall as well as provide parking lot shading. Stately Holly Oaks are utilized at the front of the property and also provide parking lot shading. The Mexican Fan Palms (the tree specified by the City's Design Guidelines for use along El Camino Real) located in the ROW are preserved where possible or replaced, where modifications to the ROW are required for new driveway approaches. Other drought tolerant plants are utilized to complete the landscape plan, including hedges, plants, and groundcovers, such as Agave, Cordyline, Mat Rush, and Aloe. A final landscape and irrigation plan will be required during the building permit process.

The applicant has indicated signage will be under a separate permit. Two signs (both for Shoreline dental) are shown on the elevations. Prior to any signage being approved for the building, a Discretionary Sign Permit will be required, pursuant to SCMC 17.84.020.G.2.b., which requires a Master Sign Program (MSP) for any new non-residential building. An existing freeway oriented pole sign is currently located on the subject site, which must be removed due to the lapse in the previous use (restaurant) of more than 90 days, pursuant to Section 17.84.020.H.2 of the Zoning Ordinance. The City is working with the applicant on this requirement and the site plan (Attachment 5, Sheet A-0.1) notes the existing sign to be removed.

ANALYSIS:***Development Standards***

The project meets development standards, including setbacks, height, lot coverage, and parking, as shown in Table 1, below.

Table 1 – Development Standards

Standard	Zoning Ordinance	Proposed	Complies with the Code
<u>Lot Coverage</u> (Maximum)	60%	17%	Yes
<u>Floor Area Ratio (FAR)*</u>	.5	.24	Yes
<u>Setbacks</u> (Minimum)	0'	Varies	Yes
<u>Building Height</u> (Max):			
<u>Top of Plate</u>	26'	24'6"	Yes
<u>Top of Roof</u>	33'	32'	Yes
<u>Stories</u>	2	2	Yes
<u>Landscape</u>	Minimum 10% of lot area	30% (7369 sf)	Yes
<u>Parking</u> (Minimum)	Dental: 1 per 200 sf Office: 1 per 300 sf	30 (3 more than required)	Yes

General Plan Consistency

The project is consistent with General Plan goals and policies, as outlined in Attachment 1.

Design Guidelines Consistency

The project is consistent with most applicable Design Guidelines, as outlined in Attachment 2. In particular, the project incorporates many elements of Spanish architecture, including clay roof tile, smooth white stucco finish, dark wood rafter tails, dark doors and windows with simulated divided lites, and decorative light fixtures. Staff does recommend some design changes to better comply with design standards, such as use of two-piece clay-tile roofing (instead of the S-tile proposed), removal of the glass railings at the second story deck in favor of stucco or wrought iron, and modification of the tower element so that the roof tile is more visible from the street perspective. Full staff recommendations are listed below.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

The proposed project meets development standards and is generally consistent with General Plan goals and policies. Because the project is in a freeway gateway area, staff has the following recommendations to improve the project's consistency with Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to Spanish architecture:

1. Remove glass patio railing in favor of stucco pony wall or wrought iron railing.
2. Utilize two-piece clay tile with random mortar packing and booster tiles at eaves and ridges instead of the s-tile shown.
3. Remove use of cornice trim at soffits in favor of open soffits with exposed rafter tails. At tower, this should help to make the roof tile more visible, which is also recommended.
4. Utilize bull-nosed corners on the exterior of the building.
5. Verify the extent to which the flat BUR roof-equipment area is visible from the southbound freeway and if visible, consider modifying roof plan to screen equipment well with pitched tile roof.
6. Add bike rack to site plan in a convenient, functional area.
7. Provide color and materials callouts for the trash enclosure. Modify design to be a solid roof, as required by Engineering standard.
8. Consult with the Engineering Division regarding requirements for sidewalk re-paving to meet City standards, to include broom-finished concrete with sunset red clay tile trim course. The sidewalk paving should be shown on project plans.
9. Show any parking lot or supplemental street lighting on the project plans. Parking lot or supplemental street lighting shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for El Camino Real, which specifies decorative light standards and fixtures.

Staff seeks DRSC concurrence with the above recommendations and welcomes additional input. DRSC comments are intended to assist the applicant in designing a project that best complies with the City's Design Guidelines and applicable City policies. Staff also seeks direction on whether additional DRSC review is needed, or if the project is ready to be forwarded to the Planning Commission after recommended modifications are incorporated.

Attachments:

1. General Plan Policy Analysis
2. Design Guidelines Analysis
3. Project Narrative
4. Historic Building Evaluation Report
5. Plans

**CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE
MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
DESIGN REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE
September 9, 2020**

Subcommittee Members Present: Bart Crandell, Zhen Wu, Michael Blackwell (All Subcommittee members participated in meeting via teleconference)

Subcommittee Members Absent: none

Staff Present: Senior Planner Stephanie Roxas, Associate Planner Katie Crockett, Senior Planner Jennifer Savage (Staff participated in meeting via teleconference)

1. MINUTES

The Subcommittee approved the minutes from the August 12, 2020 regular meeting with a minor change.

2. ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW OF THE FOLLOWING ITEMS:

A. Site Plan Permit 20-134 / Cultural Heritage Permit 20-135, 1409 S El Camino Real, Shoreline Dental (Crockett)

A request to demolish an existing single-story restaurant and build a two-story commercial building with approximately 6,000 square feet of gross floor area to house a dental office and a general office suite.

Associate Planner Katie Crockett summarized the staff report and attachments. Staff also read a letter from Larry Culbertson of the San Clemente Historical Society recommending reconsidering the building’s historical status.

Applicant, Cory Ritzau, made a brief statement about the project.

Chair Crandell opened the public comment section of the item.

The Design Review Subcommittee (DRSC) discussed the project, and made the following comments either individually or as a group:

- Stated the City’s Historic Consultant should review the applicant-provided Historic Structures Report.
- Expressed interest in additional education regarding the Googie style of architecture.
- Requested clarification on the easement for parking on the site.

- Requested renderings or line of sight study from I-5 and/or other properties inland of the freeway. It was also noted that when these items were previously required of projects it was to determine the allowable height, whereas line of sight has already been considered in the development standards. Additionally since the top of the building is a foot below the level of the freeway, this may not be necessary.
- Suggested staff provide a list of other recent similar projects in gateway areas, such as Pico Starbucks, North Beach Bike Shop, Valero, future In-N-Out.
- Requested a roof plan, as well as cross section to ensure roof equipment is not visible from the freeway.
- Suggested modification to retaining wall in parking lot to allow for some landscape screening. Additionally, show the wall finish.
- Recommended reconsidering the use of Quercus Ilex so close to the public sidewalk and in such close proximity to each other due to the size of the mature canopy.
- Noted that all plan sheets did not match. Requested they be updated to be consistent and that the elevations/renderings show correct finished grade and better represent the planned landscape.
- Recommended overall refinement and simplification of the design to align with SCR design standards, including removal of the glass railing, ensuring rafter tails are correctly spaced, utilization of vertical windows, and window insets.
- Refine arcade design, including aligning windows with arches, continuing the arcade around the corner, and reconsidering the rafter tails at the arcade given the potential for nuisances related to birds.

The Subcommittee concurred with staff, made additional recommendations, and requested the project be brought back to DRSC for review prior to scheduling for Planning Commission.

B. Conditional Use Permit 20-243 / Minor Cultural Heritage Permit 20-244, 1531 N. El Camino Real, Publik House Event Center (Roxas)

A request to adapt the historic San Clemente Art Supply building into a multi-use building comprised of a 150-seat special events venue, café, and office.

Senior Planner Stephanie Roxas summarized the staff report and attachments.

The applicant team also participated in the meeting via teleconference and answered questions from the Subcommittee. The applicant team was comprised of Architect Alura Aguilera, Owner's Representative Jim Holloway, Landscape Architect Scott Neiman, and Tenants Eric Ange Bowman and Boogie Rose.

Chair Crandell opened the public comment section of the item. One comment was received from Larry Culbertson of the San Clemente Historical Society citing concerns over the proposed wall height and design and proposed new building openings.

The Design Review Subcommittee (DRSC) discussed the project, and made the following comments either individually or as a group:

- Supported the overall use and commended the applicant team for the amount of work and careful detail that had gone into the project thus far.
- Expressed a desire to see the existing site landscaping refined through careful placement of trees and uplighting.
- Discussed various recommendations to improve the site landscaping, including replacing queen palms with date palms, reducing the number of date palms to open sight lines of the historic building, continuing trees along all frontages (including the alleyway), using landscape to better define property boundaries, and using Dark Skies compliant uplighting to make the property stand out at night.
- Expressed a desire to beautify the alleyway. Recommended adding public art and/or keeping a reveal around the roll up doors to be filled in to create a frame for mural or artwork.
- Expressed concerns over the proposed parking lot layout, vehicle circulation, and ingress/egress into alley.
- Stated proposed roof skylights should be flat on the exterior.
- Requested staff discuss with Engineering the possibility of placing overhead poles underground.
- Expressed concern over the proposed courtyard wall height and indicated the wall diminishes views of the west elevation. Stated the west elevation should be visible to the public and was concerned about internalizing views of the west elevation for private use only.
- Suggested adding more articulation along the large blank walls. In response, the applicant stated proposed landscaping will soften the walls.
- Recommended keeping pocket doors open anytime events center is not in use. In response, the applicant stated the pocket doors will only be closed during private events.
- Recommended exploring ways to open up views into the courtyard and remove visual barriers of the west elevation, such as pushing the wall back.
- Recommended preparing an additional rendering from the perspective of vehicles driving southbound to show what site looks like with doors open. Requested to see this exhibit before the Planning Commission hearing.

The Subcommittee provided recommendations and feedback, recommended the applicant to work with staff to resolve DRSC's concerns, and recommended moving the project design forward to the Planning Commission for consideration.

3. NEW BUSINESS

A. Draft Signage for the North Beach Historic District (Savage)

A request for feedback regarding sign options for contributing historic structures in the future North Beach Historic District.

Senior Planner Jennifer Savage summarized the staff report and attachments. Staff clarified this item only applies to plaques identifying the historic designation of the building. She further clarified that if the Subcommittee wishes to see additional wayfinding signs, staff would need to return to DRSC at a future date. Senior Planner Savage also provided an overview of the next steps in the establishment of the North Beach Historic District.

Chair Crandell opened the public comment section of the item. One comment was received from Larry Culbertson of the San Clemente Historical Society supporting the design of Option 2 and recommending the City to pursue individual National Register Listing for each of the contributing properties.

The Subcommittee unanimously supported Option 2 based on the National Register of Historic Places custom shape plaque. They felt the materials and overall design of Option 2 best represented the importance of the historic structures.

4. **OLD BUSINESS**

None

5. **ORAL AND WRITTEN COMMUNICATION**

None

ADJOURNMENT

Adjourn to the Regular Meeting of the Design Review Subcommittee to be held Wednesday, October 14, 2020 at 4:00 p.m., by teleconference only and available to the public via live stream from the City's YouTube channel.

Respectfully submitted,


Bart Crandell, Chair

Attest:


Stephanie Roxas, Senior Planner

Analysis: General Plan Policies

Below is an analysis of the project’s consistency with applicable General Plan (GP) policies.

General Plan Analysis

Policy	Project Consistency
<p>1. <i>GP LU-2.01: Quality.</i> We require that new development protect community character by providing architecture, landscaping, and urban design of equal or greater quality than surrounding development, and by respecting the architectural character and scale of adjacent buildings.</p>	<p>Consistent. The project represents quality architecture, utilizing Spanish architectural style, including incorporation of appropriate landscaping and outdoor areas, while locating parking and trash enclosures toward the side of the building, away from the primary gateway corner. The project represents an improvement in terms of architectural and site design from the existing condition of the lot and is of greater quality to existing surrounding development.</p>
<p>2. <i>GP LU-13.04. Views.</i> New development (in SECR West of I-5 Focus Area) shall be designed to minimize obstructions of ocean views from the I-5 freeway.</p>	<p>Consistent. The proposed building is sited at an elevation approximately 34 feet below the freeway elevation. The maximum height of the building is 33 feet to top of highest roof element, and has a varied roofline with the bulk of the building at an even lower elevation. Therefore, the proposed building will not obstruct views of the ocean from the freeway.</p>
<p>3. <i>GP UD-2.01: Architecture/Design Quality.</i> We require high quality design for buildings at visually significant locations in gateway areas. New buildings...in gateway areas adjacent to or opposite I-5 off-ramps shall follow SCR architectural style, except where otherwise specified in the Design Guidelines.</p>	<p>Consistent. The subject site is located within an area designated by the Design Guidelines where “other Spanish architecture is permitted.” The architecture and site plan are consistent with Spanish Colonial Revival style in many respects. In particular, smooth white stucco, red clay tile roofing, well-proportioned arches and arcade at the storefront, simulated divided lite windows, decorative lighting sconces, and exposed wood rafter tails. The site also utilizes appropriate landscape and outdoor spaces to complement the building.</p>

Policy	Project Consistency
<p>4. <i>GP UD-2.06: Parking.</i> Where practical, we limit the visibility of surface parking lots and parking spaces within gateway areas by requiring them to be located behind or to the side of buildings.</p>	<p>Consistent. The parking is located to the side of the building, away from the freeway exit.</p>
<p>5. <i>GP UD-3.07: Inter-jurisdictional Coordination.</i> We maintain work with other public agencies to help minimize and mitigate impacts and improve the operations and aesthetics of their facilities.</p>	<p>Consistent. The City will work with Caltrans on ensuring the landscape at the freeway exit within the Caltrans right-of-way (ROW) is improved and maintained in a manner more appropriate for a Gateway area and to match the property improvements proposed by the applicant.</p>
<p>6. <i>GP UD-5.07: Other Spanish Architecture.</i> New buildings and major building remodels may utilize either Spanish Colonial Revival or other Spanish Architecture on S El Camino Real between Avenida Rosa and Interstate 5, per the Design Guidelines.</p>	<p>Consistent. The subject site is located within an area designated by the Design Guidelines where “other Spanish architecture is permitted.” The architecture and site plan are consistent with SCR style in many respects. In particular, smooth white stucco, red clay tile roofing, well-proportioned arches and arcade at the storefront, simulated divided lite windows, decorative lighting sconces, and exposed wood rafter tails. The site also utilizes appropriate landscape and outdoor spaces to complement the building.</p>
<p>7. <i>GP UD-5.10: Scale and Massing.</i> We require that the scale and massing of development be compatible with its surroundings and with the General Plan, applicable specific plan and/or area plan.</p>	<p>Consistent. The subject site is located in a transitional area. Currently most buildings directly adjacent are single-story. However, the building is consistent with development standards with regard to height and it is consistent with design guidelines with regard to scale and massing. Additionally, new buildings on the adjacent vacant lots at this corner have development plans under review by the City, which propose two-story Spanish-style buildings, and this proposed building would be compatible with.</p>
<p>8. <i>GP UD-5.01: Outdoor Spaces.</i> We require integration of outdoor spaces</p>	<p>Consistent. The site plan and building design incorporate an arcade at the first</p>

Policy	Project Consistency
<p><i>into the architectural and site designs by encouraging the use of courtyards, patios, paseos, covered walkways, and other outdoor spaces enclosed by architectural or landscape elements.</i></p>	<p>floor of the building and a large second-story patio accessed from the office suite.</p>
<p>9. <i>GP UD-5.10: Landscaping Plans.</i> We require that development projects subject to discretionary review submit and implement a landscaping and irrigation plan.</p>	<p>Consistent. Landscape plans were included with the submittal and meet minimum landscape requirements prescribed by code, reviewed by the City’s landscape architect, and modified pursuant to the DRSC comments.</p>
<p>10. <i>GP BPR-6.09: Streetscape Amenities.</i> We encourage and support local, private investment in streetscape amenities (examples include: benches, street trees, decorative sidewalks) that enhance safety, walkability, neighborhood appeal, and help commercial neighborhoods stay clean, safe, and attractive.</p>	<p>Consistent. The applicant is replacing the Mexican fan palm and tree well that will be removed from the public ROW at one of the new driveway locations. Furthermore, the site driveways have been relocated away from the freeway exit ramp, promoting a safer environment for drivers and pedestrians.</p>

Analysis: Design Guidelines

The table below is an analysis of the project's consistency with the Design Guidelines. Because the project requires "other Spanish" architecture, this analysis does not include consistency with the Henry Lenny Spanish Colonial Revival (SCR) Design Guidelines. However, staff utilized the Henry Lenny Design Guidelines to guide the specific recommendations below, as applicable.

Design Guidelines Analysis

Design Guideline	Project Consistency
1. <i>Design Guidelines II.6: Internal Site Design.</i> Provide pedestrian circulation, pedestrian amenities, and bicycle facilities in all site plan proposals.	Consistent. The project incorporates a trellis-covered arcade along the side (parking lot frontage) of the building for pedestrian comfort. A number of shade trees are proposed on site and bicycle facilities are included.
2. <i>Design Guidelines II.B.3: Scale, Mass, and Form.</i> Design buildings to be compatible in scale, mass, and form with adjacent structures and the pattern of the neighborhood.	Consistent. The proposed building is consistent with the two other proposed developments on this street corner, which also proposed two-story Spanish buildings with varied roof lines. A vacant parcel and the freeway directly abut the subject property.
3. <i>Design Guidelines II.C.2: Basic Principals of SCR Architecture.</i> Building forms are one, two, and three stories with low pitched red tile hip, gable, and shed roofs. The building components are divided into parts scaled to human size.	Consistent. The building is two-story with higher tower element at the corner. Clay tile hip and gable roofs are used.
4. <i>Design Guidelines II.C.3.b, Building Form and Massing.</i> Reduce the perceived height and bulk of large structures by dividing the building mass into smaller components. Projections may be used to emphasize important architectural elements such as entrances. Varied roof heights are encouraged.	Consistent. The building is well articulated with varying roof heights, a corner tower, and arcade with well-proportioned arches at the first floor level.
5. <i>Design Guidelines II.C.3.d: Building Materials, Color, and Texture for all Discretionary Architectural Review.</i> White stucco buildings, with red or	Partially consistent. The building utilizes white stucco, dark wood rafter tails, and clay tile roof. The glass railing at the

Design Guideline	Project Consistency
<p>earth tone barrel clay roof tiles, dark exposed wood structural members, and low walls or open railings for decks.</p>	<p>second floor balcony has been removed in favor of a stucco pony wall.</p>
<p>6. <i>Design Guidelines II.F: Building Equipment and Services.</i> Trash containers and outdoor storage areas should be screened from public streets. Roof mounted equipment should be screened from view from adjacent streets and properties, giving special attention to buildings whose roofs are viewed from higher elevations.</p>	<p>Consistent. The trash enclosure is located at the back of the lot against the freeway exit ramp. The trash enclosure is smooth white stucco with dark wood-look cover to match the building design. The rear and sides of the enclosure are screened with climbing vines. A roof plan has been included and perspective drawing on Plan Sheet A3.3 demonstrates that the roof equipment will be screened from the freeway.</p>
<p>7. <i>Design Guidelines III.A2: Mixed Pedestrian and Auto Districts.</i> Sites should be planned such that the building is oriented to the street and on-site parking, with parking areas at the rear or side of the building. The street should have a 10-foot sidewalk with trees (El Camino Real Street Tree: Washingtonia Robusta) planted at regular intervals with a 10-foot landscape buffer from property line to the first row of parking. The sidewalk is to be broom finished concrete with sunset red clay tile decorative trim course.</p>	<p>Partially consistent. The building is oriented toward the sidewalk and the parking area with the parking to the side of the building, with landscape buffer exceeding 10 feet from the property line to the parking area. Existing Washingtonia Robusta line the street at regular intervals and the applicant will replace the tree and tree well removed due to the relocation of the driveways. Parking lot lighting is consistent with the standard for lighting on the El Camino Real corridor, where decorative light standards and fixtures are to be utilized.</p>

Samuel Leung

Torrance, CA 90501

November 10th, 2020

City of San Clemente
910 Calle Negocio
San Clemente, CA 92673

MF Legacy, LLC
c/o Cory Ritzau
122 Avenida Cabrillo
San Clemente, CA 92672

To Whom It May Concern,

I, Samuel Leung, as an authorized member of Cordoba Investments acknowledge and authorize Shoreline Dental and M.F. Legacy, LLC to apply for these proposed changes on the specified Easement Area of the property I own on parcel 692-131-06 in San Clemente, CA. I recognize and approve the changes to the grading, base and asphalt, drain swale and system, retaining wall, parking, traffic, and landscaping in compliance with all government and code requirements.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'S. Leung', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Samuel Leung
Member
Cordoba Investments, LLC