



**CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE
DRAFT MINUTES OF THE JOINT
BEACHES, PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION AND
PUBLIC SAFETY COMMITTEE SPECIAL MEETING
THURSDAY, DECEMBER 17, 2020, 6:00 P.M.**

Chair Streger called the Special Joint Meeting of the Beaches, Parks and Recreation Commission and the Public Safety Committee of the City of San Clemente to order on Thursday, December 17, 2020, at 6:00 p.m via teleconference. Chair Berkuta led the Pledge of Allegiance.

PRESENT Commissioners Richard Ayer, John Dorey, Charlie Smith, Bernie Wohlfarth, Chair Pro Tem John Bandaruk, Chair Steven Streger

Committee Members Gary Walsh, Vice Chair Joe Janis, Chair Nick Berkuta, Committee Member Rick Loeffler arrived at 6:09pm during agenda item 1.

ABSENT None

STAFF PRESENT Samantha Wylie, Recreation Manager
Lt. Ed Manhart, Orange County Sheriff's Department
Chief Rob Capobianco, Orange County Fire Authority
Adam Atamian, Code Compliance Manager
Maile Stivers, Administrative Assistant

1. USE OF ELECTRIC BICYCLES ON CITY TRAILS, BEACH TRAIL, AND IN PARKS

Samantha Wylie, Recreation Manager, summarized the contents of the administrative report and responded to Commission and Committee inquiries.

Lt. Ed Manhart, Orange County Sheriff's Department, responded to Commission and Committee inquiries regarding feasibility of speed limit enforcement options on the Beach Trail, traffic injury collision history on the Beach Trail, Beach Patrol staffing, speed limit versus maximum speed designations, visual observation of speed estimations, regulations of ebike usage related to age, allowable locations for bicycle use, and assignment of fault and liability for traffic collisions.

Chief Rob Capobianco, Orange County Fire Authority responded to Commission and Committee inquiries regarding response and statistics related to injuries involving bicycles and ebikes.

Adam Atamian, Code Compliance Manager, responded to Commission and Committee inquiries regarding staffing, enforcement, enforcement capabilities by Park Rangers, and citations and violations related to the Beach Trail.

Christy MacBride-Hart, San Clemente resident, opined further study is needed regarding the perceived speed of bicycles, the speed limit, the number of speeding cyclists, and the number of injuries caused by bicycles; stated she rarely sees a speeding bicycle and has not seen a near miss; opined a radar gun or radar box should be deployed in the Linda Lane area of the Beach Trail; and expressed support for bicycles to have bells or noisemakers to alert of their approach.

Tom, San Clemente resident, opined ebike safety is related to the operator; opined young riders operate more recklessly; and opined children should be banned from driving golf carts in the downtown area noting unsafe driving behaviors.

Michael A. Payne, San Clemente resident, opined most bicyclists are traveling too fast on the Beach Trail with ebikes as the worst offenders and many do not observe walk bike areas; and opined with other bicycling opportunities, the Beach Trail should be closed to bicycles.

David Arthur, San Clemente resident, opined safety concerns related to ebikes are understandable; opined San Clemente is a beach town focused on outdoors, health, community involvement, sports, and fitness; opined ebikes help people get out of their homes; opined regulations restricting bicycles are not good and do not represent a majority of residents; expressed a preference for bicycling on a sidewalk noting safety concerns of the street; opined people should be fined for riding irresponsibly, training should be required for children, parents should sign for responsibility with financial consequences, and a certain type of license should be required; opined parents are at the heart of the problem and need to teach responsibility and safety; and opined we need to weigh on the side of the positives that bicycling brings to a community.

Kelly Ferry, San Clemente resident, stated ebikes cannot be heard when approaching and operators do not slow down or use bicycle etiquette; stated pedestrians have to move off sidewalks to avoid bicycles; opined young riders do not realize the consequences of the speed of ebikes; opined sidewalks and pathways are for pedestrians and non-motorized bicycles; and opined if ebikes were restricted to roads with vehicles, usage would go down.

Nick, San Clemente resident, opined ebikes should be allowed on the Beach Trail noting the usage of ebikes frees up beach parking; opined all ages and ranges of physical ability are able to access beaches using bikes and ebikes and a ban would make them less accessible; opined speeding or reckless cyclists should be cited; and opined adding more rules when current rules are not enforced is not a realistic solution.

Ellie Hammargren, San Clemente resident, expressed support for the 10 mph speed limit questioning why it cannot be enforced; opined if there is no enforcement of speed on the Beach Trail, ebikes should not be allowed; stated the Beach Trail is primarily used for

walking; opined pedal bicycles could be ridden easily on a flat surface; and opined ebikes should not be allowed on beaches as they reduce the serenity.

Shari Grace, San Clemente resident, opined use of electric or motorized vehicles on trails has become more dangerous; noted frequent instances of a bike on the Beach Trail approaching from behind at great speed; stated there is an issue with both youth and adult cyclists; opined the Beach Trail was not designed for motorized vehicles; expressed support for enforcement on the Beach Trail; opined enforcement on the Trail would be difficult and could require multiple people; opined education and signage would not be effective; opined bicycles should be banned from the Beach Trail until the City can provide enforcement; and opined more bike racks could be added at beach entrances.

Lynn Hopper, San Clemente resident, expressed concern for the use of ebikes; questioned the definition of ebikes; stated non-licensed drivers are given without supervision or rules to follow; and opined ebikes should be kept off of beaches, and monitored or removed from the Beach Trail stating they are able to use the roads.

Commissioners and Committee Members either individually or in agreement provided the following comment:

- No accidents have been reported on the Beach Trail.
- The Beach Trail is a shared limited resource.
- The problem is individual behavior, not bicycles.
- Education regarding bicycle safety is recommended.
- Ebikes are becoming increasingly popular, and will continue to grow in numbers.
- The issue is not bad operators of ebikes.
- The higher the number of bicycles on the Beach Trail, the greater the hazard.
- Bicycles take up more space than walkers.
- If the goal is a multipurpose trail, appropriate signage may be added.
- Rules related to the use of ebikes are difficult to enforce.
- There are portions of the Beach Trail that are very narrow and should be considered.
- The vision for the environment of the Beach Trail should be considered.
- The speed limit is important.
- Sheriffs will not be able to enforce Beach Trail rules.
- Beach Patrol during the summer has a better chance at some enforcement.
- The lack of incidents on the Beach Trail does not mean there cannot be incidents.
- More signage should be added for voluntary compliance.
- A survey examining the number of bicycles and incidents on the Trail should be conducted.
- The ban of Class 3 ebikes should be enforced.
- Most ebikes on the Beach Trail are Class 3.
- Narrow areas on the Beach Trail should be widened.
- Class 3 ebikes are not easily distinguished from other ebikes.
- Class 3 ebikes are indicated with a sticker.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER AYER AND FAILED DUE TO LACK OF SECOND, to vote substantively on the agenda item.

2. PUBLIC INPUT

None.

3. ADJOURNMENT

Beaches, Parks and Recreation Commission: MOTION BY COMMISSIONER AYER, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, AND CARRIED 4-2 WITH CHAIR STREGER AND CHAIR PRO TEM BANDARUK OPPOSED, to adjourn at 7:38pm to an adjourned regular meeting Tuesday, January 12, 2021 at 6:00pm via teleconference.

Public Safety Committee: MOTION BY COMMITTEE MEMBER LOEFFLER, SECOND BY COMMITTEE MEMBER WALSH, AND CARRIED 4-0, to adjourn at 7:38pm to the special meeting Tuesday, January 26, 2021 at 2:00pm via teleconference.

Chairperson and Commissioner of the
Beaches, Parks & Recreation Commission

Beaches, Parks & Recreation Director