

These minutes will be considered for approval at the Planning Commission meeting of 10-16-2019.

**MINUTES OF THE ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING  
OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE  
PLANNING COMMISSION  
October 2, 2019 @ 6:00 p.m.  
Council Chambers  
100 Avenida Presidio  
San Clemente, California 92672**

---

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Ruehlin called the Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission of the City of San Clemente to order at 6:01 p.m.

**2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Commissioner Kaczynski led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**3. ROLL CALL**

Commissioners Present: Chris Kuczynski, Zhen Wu; Vice Chair Michael Blackwell, Chair Jim Ruehlin

Commissioners Absent: Donald Brown, Jason Talley; Chair pro tem Barton Crandell,

Staff Present: Gabriel J. Perez, City Planner  
Jennifer Savage, Senior Planner  
Christopher Wright, Associate Planner II  
Matthew Richardson, Assistant City Attorney  
Eileen White, Recording Secretary

**4. SPECIAL ORDERS OF BUSINESS**

None

**5. MINUTES**

A. Minutes from the Adjourned Regular Planning Commission Study Session of September 4, 2019.

B. Minutes from the Adjourned Regular Planning Commission Meeting of September 4, 2019.

The Commission continued both sets of minutes due to lack of quorum for minutes' approval.

IT WAS MOVED BY CHAIR RUEHLIN, SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR BLACKWELL, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO CONTINUE THE SEPTEMBER 4, 2019, PLANNING COMMISSION STUDY SESSION AND PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES TO THE REGULAR MEETING OF OCTOBER 16, 2019.

**[ITEM CONTINUED. PLANNING COMMISSION DECISION PENDING.]**

**6. ORAL AND WRITTEN COMMUNICATION**

None

**7. CONSENT CALENDAR**

None

**8. PUBLIC HEARING**

A. **General Plan Amendment 19-291/Specific Plan Amendment 19-292 – Pier Bowl Specific Plan Update** (Wright)

A public hearing to consider forwarding a recommendation to the City Council on the adoption of a City initiated update of the Pier Bowl Specific Plan (PBSP) and a cleanup General Plan Amendment. The Specific Plan is being updated for consistency with updates to the General Plan and the Coastal Land Use Plan (LUP). General Plan maps are being updated for consistency with the LUP, including changing two properties on the block of Coronado Lane from Residential High (RH) to Mixed Use 4 (MU 4).

Christopher Wright, Associate Planner II, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "General Plan Amendment 19-291, Specific Plan Amendment 19-292, Pier Bowl Specific Plan Update," dated October 2, 2019. A copy of the Presentation is on file in Planning Division. In response to questions from the Commissioners, he noted the purpose of the proposed Amendments is to revise the General Plan and Pier Bowl Specific Plan to achieve consistency between these documents and the City's updated Land Use Plan (LUP) which has been approved by the California Coastal Commission (CCC); advised other issues of note, such as the affect of Sea Level Rise and beach erosion on the beach trail, and future Marine Safety Building relocation have been or will be addressed in other documents/plans.

Chair Ruehlin opened the public hearing.

Laura Ginn, representing the owners of the Robison House, described potential uses of the property currently being considered or have been considered in the past. She thanked the City and Planning Commission

for its assistance to date; noted that if the site were improved and properly curated it would increase property values in the entire area.

Mark McGuire, representing the owner of vacant properties in the Pier Bowl area, thanked staff for the updated and suggested additional revisions including, 1) changing lot area and width standards to reflect existing lots so properties are conforming, 2) allowing the maximum permitted density of commercial projects to be similar to mixed-use projects, 3) standards to address stack and tandem parking for hotel/restaurant uses, and 4) opportunities for in-lieu parking programs and/or trolley program contributions for commercial uses in the Pier Bowl.

Chair Ruehlin closed the public hearing.

During the ensuing discussion, the Commissioners, either individually or in agreement, provided the following commentary:

- Established from staff that the draft Pier Bowl Specific Plan refers to City plans, programs, and regulations, rather than duplicate and address topics covered more effectively in other documents such as the Local Coastal Program for sea water level rise and the City's Inclusionary Housing Program for affordable housing requirements programs.
- Established from staff that a request for parking waivers on the Robison and Beachcomber Motel properties will have to include a parking study to address increased parking demand.
- Commented that General Plan policies call for avoiding parking structures in the Pier Bowl but not prohibiting them and therefore, consideration of a parking structure should not be eliminated from the Specific Plan.
- Expressed suggestions to study and consider a year-round trolley program, rehabilitation of the steep walk from Avenida Del Mar to the Pier Bowl area, development of strategies to increase connectivity between Avenida Del Mar with the Pier Bowl, creative multi-modal solutions, and circulation improvements such as a conversion of Avenida Victoria to a one-way street.
- Suggested building the Marine Safety Building on stilts as one option for consideration for addressing sea level rise.
- Requested staff to provide information in the staff report for the next meeting that highlights differences between the Specific Plan design guidelines and City-wide design guidelines.

The Commissioners reviewed the draft PBSP section by section, and suggested the following revisions:

- Page 2-27, under “207 Landscape Concept”, 3<sup>rd</sup> sentence, following “when proposed” insert “to follow Chapter 3 Streetscape Design Guidelines and when located.”
- Pages 2-30 to 2-33, eliminate the red dotted lines and annotation indicating the public view corridors from the photographs, and eliminate any language in the document referring to the red dotted lines;
- Page 3-5, add a site design guideline to establish driveway cut standards if General Plan policies do not address this.
- Page 3-8, under “Criteria for Plant Selection”, No. 1. Revise title to read “Plants must be drought-tolerant, non-invasive, and non-toxic.” In the following paragraph, revise first sentence to read “Plants must be primarily drought-tolerant and consist of non-invasive species. In the second sentence, after “Plants should” insert, “consist of non-non-toxic varieties in the public right-of-way and”
- Page 3-9, move the last sentence of the first paragraph to the second paragraph after the sentence that ends with “tree monoculture.”
- Page 3-12, Section 304(C)(2) Parking area screening, remove the “f” typo in the first line; and add the following to the end of the paragraph, “Opportunities to add tree canopies for shade without obstructing public view corridors are encouraged.”
- Page 3-12, Section 304(C)(4); revise title to “Trees in front yards and street side yards” and revise following paragraph by removing “street” before “trees” in the first sentence and inserting “and street side yards” after “front yards.”
- Page 3-15, 3-17, and 3-18, as needed remove trees shown on Section 304(F) images for consistency with streetscape design guideline for desired 25-foot street tree spacing.
- Remove mention of “signage” in references to “wayfinding signage program” or “wayfinding signage” in the draft specific plan to account for other technologies that could be used for wayfinding; including the removal of “signage” on page 3-21 in Section 304(l) “Directional Sign Program.”
- Page 3-24, Section 305(B)(3)(a) Roofs, remove “with little or no eave overhang” from first sentence.
- Page 3-25, Section 305(B)(3)(b) Roofs, in first sentence, after “Flat roofs” insert “including roof decks, particularly from higher topography in the Pier Bowl”, replace “public streets” with “the public right-of-way”; and in the 3<sup>rd</sup> sentence strike, “from public property, particularly from higher topography in the Pier Bowl.”
- Page 3-31, Section 305(B)(12) Awnings, add or modify the image to show wrought-iron awning supports to illustrate the awning guideline in more detail.
- Page 3-34, no. 5, replace the first sentence with “Encourage usable human scale spaces between structures where narrow corridors are created.”

- Page 4-3, revise title “404” to read, “Future Initiatives”; following the first paragraph, insert, “A. Design Guidelines Update”; change guidelines “A, B, C & D” to “(A)1, (A)2, (A)3 & (A)4”
- Page 4-4, Section 404(A)(4) at top of page, revise title to read, “Wayfinding Program”; and in 1<sup>st</sup> paragraph, 3<sup>rd</sup> sentence replace “signs” with “program”
- Page 4-4, add Subsection B “Circulation Parking Study”; and following text: “A study circulation and parking for uses in the Visitor Serving Commercial District should be completed that evaluates parking demand and ways to improve circulation in the Pier Bowl. In particular, the study should review the option of making Avenida Victoria a one-way street and improving the connectivity of the Pier Bowl and Downtown T-Zone areas.”
- Strike “by the City Planner or Planning Commission” in the last paragraph of page 5-2, and remove similar text from references to interpretation procedure in the draft specific plan.
- Page 5-4, no. 17, under requirement “Landscaping visible from street or public spaces, not including hardscape”, replace existing with “10 percent of net lot area of landscaping shall be provided in surface areas visible from the public right-of-way. The City may give vertical plantings credit toward the size of planting area.”
- Page 5-8, no. 17, under requirement “Landscaping visible from street or public spaces, not including hardscape”, replace existing with “10 percent of net lot area of landscaping shall be provided in surface areas visible from the public right-of-way. The City may give vertical plantings credit toward the size of planting area.”
- Page 5-13, no. 14, under requirement “Landscaping visible from street or public spaces, not including hardscape”, replace existing with “10 percent of net lot area of landscaping shall be provided in surface areas visible from the public right-of-way. The City may give vertical plantings credit toward the size of planting area.”
- Page 5-18, no. 11, under requirement “Landscaping visible from street or public spaces, not including hardscape”, replace existing with “10 percent of net lot area of landscaping shall be provided in surface areas visible from the public right-of-way. The City may give vertical plantings credit toward the size of planting area.”
- Page 5-27, replace Standards no. 16, 17, and 18, with a Standard titled “Urban open area and landscaping area” and insert text “See SCMC 17.85.050, Landscaping requirements for specific zones, Mixed Use Zones, for urban open area and landscaping area requirements.”
- Page 5-30, no. 10, under requirement “Landscaping visible from street or public spaces, not including hardscape”, replace existing with “10 percent of net lot area of landscaping shall be provided in surface areas visible from the public right-of-way. The City may give vertical plantings credit toward the size of planting area.”

- Page 5-32, under “C. Conditionally Permitted Uses” delete listed uses except “Public safety facilities, such as marine safety headquarters”; under “D. Accessory Uses” delete nos. 3 “Carports” and 6 “Playground for a conditionally permitted school use” and renumber the remaining uses.
- Page 5-34, remove the red dotted lines and annotation from the photo.
- Page 5-38, under “8. Lighting”, under “Requirement”, add a period at the end of “requirements.” Add a new sentence, “In addition to these standards, lighting in the Pier Bowl shall be directed so it does not shine on the beach or ocean.”
- Page 7-2, under “704 Definitions”, first paragraph, second sentence, before “General Plan” delete “or”, before “Zoning Ordinance” replace “or” with “and” , and delete the comma after “Zoning Ordinance.”
- Page 7-3, relocate the “Spanish Colonial Revival” definition to the General Plan.

Associate Planner Wright encouraged the Commissioners to contact him with any other potential revisions or to set up a meeting for discussion.

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR BLACKWELL, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER WU AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO CONTINUE GENERAL PLAN AMENDMENT 19-291/SPECIFIC PLAN AMENDMENT 19-292 – PIER BOWL SPECIFIC PLAN UPDATE TO THE MEETING OF NOVEMBER 6, 2019.

**[ITEM CONTINUED. PLANNING COMMISSION DECISION PENDING.]**

**9. NEW BUSINESS**

None

**10. OLD BUSINESS**

None

**11. REPORTS OF COMMISSIONERS/STAFF**

- A.** Tentative Future Agenda
- B.** Zoning Administrator Minutes of September 5, 2019
- C.** Zoning Administrator Minutes of September 19, 2019
- D.** Staff Waiver Memo and Reports
- E.** The Joint Council/Commissions/Committees meeting will be held on Tuesday, October 29, 2019 from 5:30 p.m. to 9:00 p.m. at Wedgewood at the San Clemente Municipal Golf Course located at 150 E. Avenida Magdalena, San Clemente, California.

City Planner Perez requested the Commissioners contact him if they plan on attending the October 17, 2019, Planning Officials Forum: reported the Smoke Shop Ordinance has been introduced by Council with a 500-foot distance between any other smoke shop and/or sensitive uses; announced Council has requested staff develop an ordinance to prevent the sale of flavored vape products in the City.

Commissioner Wu reported he attended the American Planning Association Conference September 15 through 18. He found it very informative and educational, and suggested all attend next year's Conference, which will be held in Riverside, CA.

## 12. ADJOURNMENT

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR BLACKWELL, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER KUCZYNSKI, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN AT 10:48 P.M. TO THE NEXT REGULAR MEETINGS OF THE STUDY SESSION AND PLANNING COMMISSION TO BE HELD ON OCTOBER 16, 2019, AT 6:00 P.M. IN COUNCIL CHAMBERS LOCATED AT 100 AVENIDA PRESIDIO, SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Jim Ruehlin, Chair

Attest:

---

Gabriel J. Perez, City Planner