

**CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE
MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
DESIGN REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE
JULY 24, 2019**

Subcommittee Members Present: Jim Ruehlin, Chris Kuczynski, Zhen Wu

Subcommittee Members Absent: none

Staff Present: Senior Planner Stephanie Roxas, Assistant Planner David Carrillo,
Assistant Planner Jonathan Lightfoot

1. MINUTES

The Subcommittee approved the minutes from the July 10, 2019 meeting with one requested modification.

The Subcommittee continued the minutes from the June 27, 2019 meeting due to a lack of quorum.

2. ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW OF THE FOLLOWING ITEMS:

A. Amendment to Sign Permit 89-106 (AM DSP 18-019), Mira Costa Plaza Master Sign Program, 3551 Camino Mira Costa (Carrillo)

A request to amend a Master Sign Program for a multi-tenant commercial building located at 3551 Camino Mira Costa within the CC2 (MO) zone.

Assistant Planner David Carrillo summarized the staff report. The applicant and property owner, Barry Saywitz, provided background information on the building signage history and goals for improving the overall aesthetics of the site by using consistent tenant signage.

The Design Review Subcommittee (DRSC) discussed the project, and made the following comments either individually or as a group:

- Recognized the owner's goals to keep costs low to tenants and allow for consistent signage.
- Requested clarification on proposed font and how signs would be mounted to walls; applicant provided samples of the proposed font type and indicated the photo simulation is not accurate.
- Requested clarification on size differences between the existing and proposed sign areas; applicant stated that proposed changes would reduce the overall signage amount.
- Requested clarification on signage placement, and stated that letters should be at the same level and take into consideration the placement of light fixtures.

- Stated that the letter height for the proposed signs are larger than the current signs, and, as proposed, the signs would have a minimal margin around the letters causing the architectural features to appear crowded. Expressed a preference for relocating Sign Type B, or limiting it to the size of the current letters (not the overall sign height).
- Expressed a preference for thicker letters (minimum of 0.5 inches) in either a black or dark bronze color.
- Expressed concern over approving an amendment prior to conclusion of staff research regarding unpermitted façade changes.
- Concerned about using plastic signs which are of a lower aesthetic quality relative to pin-mounted aluminum letters. Expressed preference for a material that mimics the look of brushed aluminum to improve the signage quality.
- Stated the City has established a high-quality signage aesthetic, and expressed general concern over the precedential nature of allowing signs of lower materials and design.

The Subcommittee provided comments and recommendations to be forwarded to the City Planner. The Subcommittee directed staff to work with the applicant to modify the project as follows: use minimum of 0.5-inch thick black letters, use a flat finish on the letters that is more similar to brushed aluminum, ensure appropriate spacing between letters and architectural features, and (if using external lighting) ensure compliance with Dark Skies policies.

B. **Minor Architectural Permit 19-092, Amendment to Sign Permit 88-21 (AM DSP 19-093), Ocean View Plaza Patio and Master Sign Program Amendment (Lightfoot)**

A request to demolish an existing freestanding sign wall and modify storefront facades, sign locations, and patio area in front of Building D at Ocean View Plaza, 638 Camino De Los Mares.

Assistant Planner Jonathan Lightfoot summarized the staff report. The applicant, Kyle Godat of Brixmor Property Group, was also available and responded to questions.

The Design Review Subcommittee (DRSC) discussed the project, and made the following comments either individually or as a group:

- Requested clarification on tenants using proposed projecting signs, number of wall signs permitted for end tenant suites (i.e., Rubio's), existing on-site tree species, ring lights around trees, and location and attachment details for the proposed shade sails.
- Discussed concerns over the proposed projecting signs, including consistency with other properties and difficulty of future tenants to fit within round size of sign. Opinions differed on the preference for the projecting signs to be round or rectilinear.

- Discussed various alternatives to the shade sails that would integrate the sails into permanent structures (i.e., pergolas), rather than attached to poles.
- Discussed proposed string lights, including future maintenance, using non-breaking bulbs, and attaching the lights to an additional a row of trees (rather than being attached to poles).
- Discussed future maintenance of the patio furniture, and suggested staff add a condition regarding cleanliness.
- Encouraged use of trees with larger shade canopies, or using a palm species from the City's landscape guidelines.
- Stated the design aesthetic appears busy with the multiple colors and shapes proposed. Recommended using consistent awning and umbrella colors to simplify the design.
- Requested to see updated renderings showing the proposed shade sails to ensure they do not obstruct tenant signs.
- Stated all lighting should be compliant with Dark Skies policies, and the illumination level and up lighting angle should be lowered if found to be too bright.
- Expressed a preference that the proposed Rubio's awning be replaced by an attached pergola to match the adjacent tenant suites.

The Subcommittee generally concurred with staff's recommendations, provided additional comments and recommendations to staff and the applicant, and recommended the project return to DRSC for additional architectural review.

C. **Minor Cultural Heritage Permit 19-035, Beach Hut Deli Façade Remodel (Lightfoot)**

A request to remodel the façade of an existing commercial building at 1844 N. El Camino Real within the MU1-A-CB-CZ zone.

Assistant Planner Jonathan Lightfoot summarized the staff report.

The Design Review Subcommittee (DRSC) discussed the project, and made the following comments either individually or as a group:

- Requested clarification on how major remodels are defined; staff clarified that both major and minor remodels are reviewed under a Minor Cultural Heritage Permit or Minor Architectural Permit subject to Zoning Administrator approval.
- Recommended that the City Planner and Zoning Administrator refer this project to the Planning Commission due to the high visibility of the project site at a gateway location, within a visitor-serving area, and adjacent to the beach and a regional transportation hub.
- Stated the site is very visible from all sides and special attention should be paid to all elevations of the project. Noted that the site is along the Pacific Coast Bike Route, the North Beach Gateway, and is adjacent to a trolley stop.

- Concurred with staff recommendation #4 and supported the creation of a second outdoor patio or raised planter area due to the high visibility of the area from El Camino Real.
- Recommended incorporating more decorative landscaping along the El Camino Real elevation rather than just turf.
- Concurred with staff recommendation #8 and noted that additional bike racks should be considered due to the large number of cyclists in the area.
- Stated the proposed "SCR design element" on the southeast (rear) elevation appears tacked on and should be replaced with a simpler design element (i.e., oculus with iron grill).
- Stated the proposed pergola over the propane tank provides insufficient screening. Recommended exploring alternatives, such as two smaller indoor tanks. If an underground gas line is not feasible and propane cannot be moved indoors, then full screening at rear is necessary. Requested that OCFA comment on the location of the propane tank.
- Discussed increasing the height of the rear wall or using trellised vines above the existing wall.
- Recognized the project is a building remodel and cannot be transformed into a true Spanish Colonial Revival style building.
- Indicated it was possible to reinforce the roof to accommodate the weight of clay tiles. Also noted that the existing 2:12 pitch is not ideal for tile roofing.
- Stated the Subcommittee cannot support the proposed metal roof tiles without seeing it. Expressed a preference for roofing that is innocuous in appearance, and recommended using simple roof shingles that allow other Spanish-style aspects of the building to stand out if the standard clay tile treatment is not feasible.
- Requested additional details on how the proposed metal tiles could be installed (including rake, ridge, and eave).
- Requested details on how rooftop mechanical equipment would be screened.
- Stated the trash enclosure should utilize Spanish-style elements consistent with recently-approved enclosures on Avenida Del Mar.
- Recommended incorporating decorative hardscape in the outdoor patio, rather than using plain industrial-style concrete. Staff noted that the Applicant's plans do indicate replacing the concrete sidewalk with pavers.
- Questioned whether the porta-potty at the flower shop was legally permitted.
- Concurred with staff recommendation #2 to accentuate the primary entry.
- Concurred with staff recommendation #1 to modify the wing walls. Commented that the wing walls could extend beyond the roof edge and become a decorative curvilinear feature.
- Commented that a landscape plan is needed and should address the area behind the building (southeast) and at the El Camino Real frontage. Noted that one tree by the flower shop appears to be dying and may need to be replaced.

The Subcommittee generally concurred with staff's recommendations, provided additional comments and recommendations to staff and the applicant, and recommended the project return to DRSC for additional architectural review.

3. **NEW BUSINESS**

None

4. **OLD BUSINESS**

None

5. **ORAL AND WRITTEN COMMUNICATION**

None

ADJOURNMENT


Adjourn to the Regular Meeting of the Design Review Subcommittee to be held Wednesday, August 14, 2019 at 3:00 p.m., at the Community Development Department, Conference Room A, located at 910 Calle Negocio, San Clemente, California.

Respectfully submitted,



Jim Ruehlin, Chair

Attest:



Stephanie Roxas, Senior Planner