

Approved by the Beaches, Parks and Recreation Commission at its regular meeting on August 14, 2018.



**CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE  
MINUTES OF THE  
BEACHES, PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION  
REGULAR MEETING  
THURSDAY, JULY 10, 2018, 6:00 P.M.**

Chair Streger called the Regular Meeting of the Beaches, Parks and Recreation Commission of the City of San Clemente to order on Tuesday, July 10, 2018, at 6:11 p.m. in the City of San Clemente City Council Chambers located at 100 Avenida Presidio, San Clemente, California. Commissioner Dorey led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**PRESENT** Commissioners Richard Ayer, John Dorey, Charlie Smith, Bernie Wohlfarth,  
Chair Pro Tem John Bandaruk, Chair Steven Streger

**ABSENT** Commissioner Nick Gates

**STAFF PRESENT** Samantha Thomas, Recreation Manager  
Maile Stivers, Administrative Assistant

- 1. NOMINATION AND ELECTION OF CHAIR, CHAIR PRO TEM, AND COASTAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE REPRESENTATIVE**  
None.
- 2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**
  - A. June 7, 2018**  
MOTION BY CHAIR PRO TEM BANDARUK, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, AND CARRIED 6-0, to approve the Beaches, Parks and Recreation Commission Meeting minutes of June 7, 2018.
- 3. CURRENT COMMUNITY ACTIVITIES AND EVENTS**
  - A. Recreation Division Update**  
Samantha Thomas, Recreation Manager, presented photos and reviewed recent activities and events including a beach concert and the installation of a shade structure in Courtney's SandCastle Playground; and previewed the upcoming concert at Linda Lane Park.
  - B. Recreation Division Activities Update Report dated 7/10/18**  
Received and filed.
- 4. OLD BUSINESS**

Chair Streger reordered the items to be considered.

Commissioner Dorey recused himself at 6:17pm and left the dais due to potential Friends of San Clemente Foundation involvement.

**C. San Luis Rey Park Master Plan Amendment to Add Pickleball Use – Second Review**

Samantha Thomas, Recreation Manager, summarized the contents of the administrative report regarding a proposed amendment to the San Luis Rey Park master plan to add pickleball use and responded to Commission inquiries.

Si Moskowitz, San Clemente resident, stated he is a tennis player; stated there have been notable tennis players raised in San Clemente; stated he is a member of two tennis clubs that recently installed pickleball courts and have many tennis courts; opined pickleball and tennis are incompatible as there are too many lines; opined it is difficult to get a tennis court; opined pickleball courts should be built elsewhere; and opined a half facility for tennis and pickleball is not desirable long term.

Kirk Steele, San Clemente resident, stated he is a tennis player in favor of pickleball courts; opined San Luis Rey Park is not the place for pickleball courts; opined there are other options including the lawn bowling green; opined residents will be upset by increased noise from pickleball play; and opined the proposal is similar to converting two golf course holes to frisbee golf.

Fred Houston, San Clemente resident, stated his family plays tennis; opined more tennis courts are needed in San Clemente; stated tennis courts are frequently full; opined the one functional tennis court in Bonito Canyon Park could be converted to pickleball courts; and opined fundraising efforts should be undertaken to fund dedicated pickleball courts.

Suzie Freeman, San Clemente resident, opined San Luis Rey is not a good location for pickleball courts; noted data of court usage; stated tennis players work together to accommodate play schedules; and opined pickleball lessons and tournament scheduling would not allow flexibility for tennis players.

Sandra McCanne, San Juan Capistrano resident, stated the San Luis Rey courts have a tennis club history; stated courts are often full; and opined other options should be considered.

Houman Safaj, San Clemente resident, opined daylight savings time will limit availability of tennis courts as lighted courts are limited; stated lessons take up court space; opined the City is responsible to provide adequate facilities for residents; opined it is not right to create bad feelings between pickleball and tennis players; stated tennis is the second most watched sport; opined chalk and tape lines at San Geronio cause confusion and could be hazardous; and opined the condition of courts need to be addressed before allocating other resources.

Shawn Houshmand, San Clemente resident, stated his daughter uses the tennis courts to practice; stated at many times the courts are full; opined the public courts are a great asset to be able to practice; stated all courts are full Saturday and Sunday mornings; stated most people play doubles; opined a survey of court usage should be done; opined paddle tennis at the Shorecliffs Beach Club is noisy and affects neighbors; stated City tennis lessons take court space; and opined San Luis Rey is not a good location for pickleball.

Dro Karamians, San Clemente resident, stated he is a tennis player who played competitively; stated he volunteers his time to help coach high school youth; stated taking away tennis courts will affect youth; and opined Vista Hermosa Sports Park would be a good location for pickleball courts.

Raudel Barba, San Clemente resident, stated he was a former tennis player and coach and now teaches pickleball; stated he has taught many students through the City Recreation programs; opined the City should embrace the game of pickleball; and opined pickleball is a game for life.

Phil Dunmeyer, San Clemente resident, stated there are 14 tennis courts; opined one court should be converted to pickleball and one more striped for both tennis and pickleball; opined there are more pickleball players than tennis players in San Clemente; presented usage data from visiting tennis courts noting open court times; stated there are more court users with pickleball per hour than tennis is the same space; opined no players have quit pickleball to take up tennis; and noted other tennis to pickleball court conversions.

Kathy Oshima, San Clemente resident, stated she is in possession of a petition supporting conversion of one court to pickleball and a dual lined second court at San Luis Rey Park; opined the Commission should support the option that serves the most people; stated that pickleball is included in the middle school curriculum; opined courts should be created to create community through social networks; stated the timing is good as courts are being resurfaced already; opined pickleball players are willing to work cooperatively; stated few pickleball players have their own nets, and more would be served by permanent pickleball courts; and opined players with their own nets would have an advantage for court usage.

Kevin Chaidez, San Clemente resident, opined there are many communities that share tennis and pickleball; opined communication is important for the groups to work together; presented an estimate of \$7,500 to convert a tennis court to permanent pickleball courts; stated he currently has pledged for \$5,500 and will guarantee the full \$7,500 will be raised, but have not collected funds yet; and stated the Friends of San Clemente Foundation has been approached to manage the donations for pickleball.

Manny Romero, San Clemente resident, presented proposal for \$7,500 for a tennis court to be converted to permanent pickleball courts; stated courts are open at times; stated the money would not be an issue as donations have been guaranteed; opined permanent pickleball courts would solve the issue of scheduling and concern over court usage; stated a pickleball committee has been formed to work with the City; expressed support for one full pickleball court conversion at San Luis Rey Park; and opined players displaced from Rancho San Clemente tennis facility will return once it is reopened.

Robi Craig, San Clemente resident, opined tennis players have no problem being inclusive of the pickleball community; opined single tennis courts around the city should be considered for pickleball that would not impact San Luis Rey Park; stated tennis courts are full often; stated parking at San Luis Rey is full when she plays tennis; opined parking will be more difficult at San Luis Rey with pickleball; and expressed support for pickleball as long as it is not at San Luis Rey Park.

Commissioners either individually or in agreement provided the following comments:

- Volleyball and basketball are played on shared courts with lines for both indicating dual lines may work.
- Paint should be used instead of chalk or tape to mark pickleball courts.
- Increased noise should be considered in neighborhoods and on the golf course.
- Courts for both pickleball and tennis are needed.
- Pickleball was shown as a community desire through the Beaches, Parks and Recreation Master Plan.
- 7% of the tennis court space seems reasonable to dedicate to pickleball.
- It is possible to paint dedicated pickleball courts, and not provide nets within budget.
- Multiple lines on a court would be confusing.
- Court #4 should be dedicated pickleball courts.
- Nets should be installed during the resurfacing for dedicated pickleball court.
- Tennis and pickleball courts should remain separate as managing usage types on a shared court would be problematic.

MOTION BY CHAIR STREGER, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER WOHLFARTH, AND CARRIED 6-0, to approve reconfiguration of court #4 at San Luis Rey Park to pickleball lines only, install sleeves and nets for pickleball as indicated in the report, and to work with the pickleball community to reduce costs.

MOTION BY CHAIR PRO TEM BANDARUK, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, AND FAILED 2-3 WITH COMMISSIONERS AYER AND WOHLFARTH AND CHAIR STREGER OPPOSED, to dual stripe court #3 at San Luis Rey Park for pickleball and tennis, and direct staff to develop a schedule for sharing of the court.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, SECOND BY CHAIR PRO TEM BANDARUK, AND CARRIED 3-2 WITH COMMISSIONER WOHLFARTH AND CHAIR STREGER OPPOSED, to direct staff to analyze scheduling and timing of utilization of court #3 for dual use by tennis and pickleball, to revisit the striping of court #3, and report back at the next meeting.

Commissioner Dorey returned to the dais at 7:50pm.

Commissioner Dorey recused himself and left the dais at 7:55pm due to his association with the PierPride Foundation.

**A. PierPride Partnership Agreement – Second Review**

Samantha Thomas, Recreation Manager, summarized the contents of the administrative report regarding a proposed partnership agreement with PierPride and responded to Commission inquiries.

Jim Nielsen, PierPride Foundation Treasurer, responded to Commission inquiries regarding organization finances, fundraising, and activities.

Commissioners either individually or in agreement provided the following comments:

- There is not a cap on subsidies outlined in 3.2 for October events.

MOTION BY CHAIR STREGER, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER AYER, AND CARRIED 5-0, to recommend the City Council approve a partnership agreement with PierPride Foundation with the modification that the fees waived sentence in section 3.6 be moved to section 3.2 and the waived amount be changed from \$1,000 to \$2,000.

Commissioner Dorey returned to the dais at 8:15pm.

**B. Use of Bicycles and Electric Bicycles on the Beach and Beach Trail**

Samantha Thomas, Recreation Manager, summarized the contents of the administrative report regarding the use of bicycles and electric bicycles on the beach and Beach Trail and responded to Commission inquiries.

Cynthia Blaylock, San Clemente resident, stated she enjoys riding her electric bicycle on city streets; stated she would like to use the electric bicycle to access the pier area and Del Mar from North Beach; opined the Beach Trail is safer than El Camino Real for cyclists; stated the use of electric bicycles is a green alternative and should be encouraged; stated the use of electric bicycles eliminates the need to park a vehicle; opined if electric bicycles are prohibited from the Beach Trail, riders are more likely to visit Dana Point's businesses; opined the use of electric bicycles with a speed limit is not incompatible with bicycle use; opined it would be unfair to ban electric bicycles and not bicycles if the rules are applied evenly to both; noted the General Plan and

Bike and Pedestrian Master Plan encourage bicycle and electric bicycle use; and noted there have been no reported incidents with electric bicycles on the Trail.

Susan Ambrose, San Clemente resident, stated she is a frequent Beach Trail user; stated she frequently hears from friends and neighbors about near misses and concerns with bicycles and electric bicycles on the Beach Trail; opined we are missing appropriate rules of the road behavior; noted an incident of a near miss with an electric bicyclist; and expressed support for the recommendation of banning electric bicycles on the Beach Trail.

C.L. Snider, San Clemente resident, stated dog walkers do not abide by the six foot leash or shorter rule; noted the speed of electric bicycles and bicycles who would take a long time to stop; stated the statistics of Beach Trail users; and opined the Mariposa boardwalk is a bridge where bicycles should be walked.

Alison Betts, San Clemente resident, stated she is a daily Beach Trail user in all modes including electric bicycle; stated she is respectful of other users; opined it is not about rules but Trail users respecting one another; questioned future regulation of other modes of use that may be problematic; opined she has not seen signage about 10mph speed limit; and opined the beach patrol sheriff should be asked to enforce regulations.

Brenda Miller, San Clemente resident, stated the philosophy of the Bike and Pedestrian Master Plan is to increase mobility by all modes; opined the Beach Trail plays a key role in accessing the ocean; stated electric bicycles reduce the need for parking; opined restrictions on use of the Beach Trail would have a chilling effect on Beach Trail functionality; expressed support for ticketing for problem users of the Trail; and opined the Beach Trail is undersized for its volume of use.

Michael Metcalf, San Clemente resident, stated there is bad behavior on the Beach Trail by all user types; opined generally the Beach Trail is very popular and most users are civil; opined banning any category of user is arbitrary and unfair; opined enforcement would improve behavior; opined if the City is unwilling to pay for enforcement, it might not be a problem; and opined electric bicycles should not be banned from the Beach Trail.

Martin Eichmann, San Clemente resident, stated he uses an electric bicycle on the Beach Trail and can no longer walk or run; stated his electric bicycle can be pedaled without any electricity; stated his bicycle has a speedometer, and he usually rides 6-8 miles per hour on the Trail; stated electric bicycles have disc brakes and can stop quickly; and opined a few concerns should not prompt a ban on electric bicycles.

Commissioners either individually or in agreement provided the following comments:

- Someone riding an electric bicycle appropriately on the Beach Trail is no greater risk than any other user.
- Accessing Del Mar on City streets from North Beach by bicycle is more dangerous.
- Bicycle riding on the beach occurs at extreme low tides.
- There should be a speed limit for bicycles on the beach.
- Eight miles per hour is an appropriate speed limit.
- The beach should not be used by bicycles as the Beach Trail provides for mobility.
- Reckless riding could be cited without a radar speed reading.
- Ticketing would discourage problem behavior.
- Electric bicycles can be dangerous in the wrong hands.
- The Beach Trail was not designed to be ridden by bicycles in its entirety.
- Electric bicycles are ridden too fast.
- The Beach Trail was designed for exercise, and electric bicycles do not provide exercise.
- Eight miles per hour is too fast on the bridge and between Corto Lane and the Pier.
- Bicycles should not be ridden on the bridges.
- A six miles per hour speed limit would signal bicycles need to be ridden slowly.
- The rules should be the same on the beach as the Beach Trail for bicycles.
- The beach is not an appropriate place for transportation.
- Any area of the Beach Trail narrower than five feet should require walking of bicycles.

MOTION BY CHAIR STREGER, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, AND CARRIED 6-0, to recommend the City Council approve amendments to Municipal Code section 12.32.130 (B) to include the words "Beach and" before any Beach Trail reference, to indicate riding of bicycles is prohibited on any bridges, the maximum speed of the Beach Trail be reduced to six miles per hour, and indicate riding of bicycles is prohibited between Corto Lane and the Pier.

## 5. NEW BUSINESS

### A. Consideration of a Public Mural at San Luis Rey Park

Samantha Thomas, Recreation Manager, summarized the contents of the administrative report regarding a proposed public mural at San Luis Rey Park and responded to Commission inquiries.

Melinda Morey, proposed mural artist, presented photos of other mural and gallery artwork she has completed; provided detail and background on the proposed mural design; discussed the intent of the artwork; stated the design will be further refined; and responded to Commission inquiries.

Mike Quinn, Baha'i Center representative; provided project and artwork details; provided the intent and vision of the artwork; stated he visited the park and spoke with park visitors about the proposed artwork; and responded to Commission inquiries.

Commissioners either individually or in agreement provided the following comments:

- Darker murals deter graffiti.
- The mural design looked political initially.
- The mural artwork is beautiful.
- Increasing the size of the under fold would make the design look less like a wall.
- The finished artwork will communicate what is intended.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER AYER, SECOND BY CHAIR PRO TEM BANDARUK, AND CARRIED 6-0, to recommend the City Council approve the establishment of a mural entitled "Envision Unity" at San Luis Rey Park.

**B. Special Event Partnership Agreement with Positive Vibe Warriors Foundation for Annual Stoke-O-Rama Surf Contest.**

Samantha Thomas, Recreation Manager, summarized the contents of the administrative report regarding a proposed partnership agreement with Positive Vibe Warriors Foundation for the annual Stoke-O-Rama surf contest and responded to Commission inquiries.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, SECOND BY CHAIR PRO TEM BANDARUK, AND CARRIED 6-0, to recommend the City Council approve a partnership agreement with the Positive Vibe Warriors Foundation for its annual Stoke-O-Rama Surf Contest, waiving the beach rental fees, Special Event Permit application fee, and lifeguard service fees.

**6. PUBLIC INPUT**

Kelly Chapman, San Clemente resident, stated a committee was formed called San Clemente Citizens Group who posted a letter online addressing the feeding by local charities of the homeless population; requested that charities be asked not to provide food that can be taken into the hillsides especially if cooking is needed by asking for a residential address when providing food, and requiring food to be eaten on site if no address is provided; and opined food should not be distributed at North Beach.

**7. COMMUNICATIONS**

None.

**8. ITEMS FROM COMMISSION**

**A. Subcommittee Reports**

1. Community Events – None.



2. Integrated Pest Management Subcommittee – Chair Pro Tem Bandaruk reported the integrated pest management policy will be going to the July City Council meeting.

**B. Items from Commissioners**

1. Coastal Advisory Committee (CAC) – Commissioner Ayer reported the CAC received a presentation by Carl Stiehl regarding the City's land use plan and a presentation regarding bird deterrence under the San Clemente Pier.
2. Friends of San Clemente Foundation – Commissioner Dorey reported the Friends Foundation is selling sponsorships for pet waste stations; reported a successful golf tournament; and reported the carnival will be returning in October.
3. Courtney's Sandcastle Charitable Foundation (CSC) – Chair Pro Tem Bandaruk reported the shade structure has been installed at Courtney's Sandcastle Playground; and reported there has been a request for tree replacement in the sensory garden area.
4. Public Safety Task Force – Chair Pro Tem Bandaruk reported the Task Force will meet again, and an additional deputy has been hired.

**9. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no other business before the Commission, Chair Streger adjourned at 9:39 p.m. to a regular meeting on Tuesday, August 14, 2018 at 6:00 p.m. at the at City of San Clemente Council Chambers located at 100 Avenida Presidio, San Clemente, CA.

---

Chairperson and Commissioner of the  
Beaches, Parks & Recreation Commission

---

Beaches, Parks & Recreation Director