

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE
PLANNING COMMISSION
May 2, 2018 @ 7:00 p.m.
City Council Chambers
100 Avenida Presidio
San Clemente, CA**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Brown called the Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission of the City of San Clemente to order at 7:08 p.m.

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chair Brown led the Pledge of Allegiance.

3. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Jim Ruehlin, Michael Smith, Zhen Wu; Chair pro tem Michael Blackwell, Vice Chair Barton Crandell, Chair Donald Brown

Commissioners Absent: Jason Talley

Staff Present: Cecilia Gallardo-Daly, Community Development Director
Veronica Morones, Assistant Planner
Vanessa Norwood, Contract Planner
Stephanie Roxas, Senior Planner
Thomas Frank, Transportation Engineering Manager
Matthew Richardson, Assistant City Attorney
Eileen White, Recording Secretary

4. SPECIAL ORDERS OF BUSINESS

None

5. MINUTES

A. Minutes from the Regular Planning Commission Study Session of April 18, 2018

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR CRANDELL, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO RECEIVE AND FILE THE MINUTES FROM THE REGULAR STUDY SESSION OF APRIL 18, 2018.

Amended as follows:

Page 1, before "Commission Comment" insert "This item was continued to a future Study Session for further discussion."

B. Minutes from the Regular Planning Commission Meeting of April 18, 2018

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER TALLEY, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO RECEIVE AND FILE THE MINUTES FROM THE REGULAR MEETING OF APRIL 18, 2018.

Amended as follows:

Page 8, 3rd paragraph, replace "Robertson" with "Richardson"

6. ORAL AND WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

None

7. CONSENT CALENDAR

None

8. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Discretionary Sign Permit 17-347 – Flora Vista Monument Signs (Norwood)

Public Hearing to consider a request to allow project identification signs for Flora Vista Community with: 1) two new entry monument signs located at Calle Sarmentoso/Via Tulipan; Calle Sarmentoso/Via Solona; and, 2) two renovated entry wall signs located on both corners of Camino Del Rio and Via Tulipan.

Vanessa Norwood, Contract Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Flora Vista Community Signs, Discretionary Sign Permit 17-347," dated May 2, 2018. A copy of the Presentation is on file in the Planning Division. She referred to handouts distributed to the Commission relating to sign size and font changes submitted by the applicant.

Laura Reilly, applicant, in response to a comment regarding the potential for landscaping to obscure sign lettering, advised that landscape plans were currently under review by the City's landscape architect.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER WU, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 18-005, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING DISCRETIONARY SIGN PERMIT 17-347, FLORA VISTA COMMUNITY ENTRY SIGNS, A REQUEST TO ALLOW PROJECT IDENTIFICATION SIGNS; TWO NEW ENTRY MONUMENT SIGNS LOCATED AT CALLE SARMENTOSO AND VIA TULIPAN; CALLE SARMENTOSO AND VIA SOLONA; AND, TWO RENOVATED ENTRY WALL SIGNS LOCATED ON BOTH CORNERS OF CAMINO DEL RIO AND VIA TULIPAN.

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL.]

B. 323 W. Paseo De Cristobal – Tentative Parcel Map 2017-143 (PLN 18-089)/Site Plan Permit (SPP) 18-088 – Cristobal Parcel Map (Norwood)

Public Hearing to consider the subdivision of a 22,262 square foot parcel into two parcels located at 323 West Paseo De Cristobal in the Residential Low Zone and Coastal Overlay (RL-CZ) Zoning District.

Vanessa Norwood, Contract Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Cristobal Parcel Map, Tentative Parcel Map 2017-143 (PLN 18-089)/Site Plan Permit 18-088," dated May 2, 2018. A copy of the Presentation is on file in the Planning Division. Staff indicated that the applicant recently provided additional information, and staff clarified that the project complies with all development standards, including the minimum 60-foot lot frontage.

Greg Borchard, applicant representing the property owner, was available for questions.

In response to a request, City Attorney Richardson added a condition of approval to address demolition of the existing home prior to the final subdivision recordation.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, SECONDED BY CHAIR PRO TEM BLACKWELL, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 18-010, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, RECOMMENDING THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVE TENTATIVE PARCEL MAP 2017-143 (PLN 18-089) AND SITE PLAN PERMIT 18-088,

CRISTOBAL PARCEL MAP, A REQUEST TO CONSIDER THE SUBDIVISION OF ONE LOT INTO TWO LOTS LOCATED AT 323 WEST PASEO DE CRISTOBAL.

Revised as follows:

Add Condition no. 11 as follows, "Prior to final map recordation, the property owner shall remove the existing home currently on the property."

[ACTION SUBJECT TO CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL.]

C. 620 Avenida Pico – Site Plan Permit 17-348/Conditional Use Permit 17-349/Architectural Permit 17-350/Discretionary Sign Permit 17-413 – Pico Starbucks (Morones)

Public Hearing to consider a request to 1) construct a 2,400 square foot, single-story commercial building for a Starbucks with a drive-through, 2) amplified sound for the drive-through speaker system, 3) a Master Sign Program that includes menu board signs and monument sign, and 4) an outdoor dining area. The site includes parcels located at 620 Avenida Pico, and portion of an adjoining lot at 600 Avenida Pico as part of a lot line adjustment. The project is located in the Community Commercial zone (CC2). The site's legal description is Parcel 2, Page 7 of Book 53, and Parcel 1, Page 7 of Book 53. The Assessor's Parcel Numbers are 679-042-04 and 679-042-01.

Veronica Morones, Assistant Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Pico Starbucks, SPP 17-348, CUP 17-349, AP 17-350, and DSP 17-413," dated May 2, 2018. A copy of the Presentation is on file in the Planning Division. She distributed an errata sheet for the Commission's consideration.

Applicant, William Nascimento of Sycamore Group LLC representing Starbucks introduced his development staff, including the architect, traffic engineer, interior space/construction planner and landscape architect, as well as the property owners. Mr. Nascimento stated that noted architect, Henry Lenny was hired to create a Spanish Colonial Revival architectural version of Starbucks. Mr. Nascimento thanked staff and the Design Review Subcommittee (DRSC) for their assistance. He described the site's circulation plan; ongoing efforts to design the appropriate lighting materials for the tower; noted site constraints due to multiple easements and water line restrictions and specialized light poles, which hamper efforts to increase landscaping. In response to questions from the Commission, he advised that efforts are ongoing to relocate and conceal the utility doors with improved design/paint. Mr. Nascimento stated that the drive-thru lane would accommodate more cars than the busiest, existing Starbucks drive-thru store in the County and noted that the site is over-parked by three spaces.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

During the ensuing discussion, the Commissioners, either individually or in agreement, provided the following commentary:

- Recommended the tower recess be no less than 6 inches to maintain the tower character and stay true to Henry Lenny's design.
- Established that although the interior ceilings would be vaulted, the area above the workspace must be flat, washable, and scrub-able.
- Thanked the applicant and Starbucks team for being amenable to suggestions for revision from DRSC and staff; commented the project improved tremendously as a result.
- Opined the signage and emblem on the tower make it freeway-oriented; suggested project revisions, such as removal of signage lettering (leaving the emblem intact), replacing the emblem with a recessed window, and/or removal of proposed signage illumination to make it less prominent.
- Commented that signage facing the freeway, although pleasant and sophisticated, is marginally freeway oriented; suggested the Commission consider requiring the applicant to turn off the lighting for the signs facing the freeway to remove potential that the signage would be considered freeway-oriented.
- Suggested that although the adjacent McDonald's Restaurant has grandfathered freeway-oriented signage, the signage is not visible until cars are already committed to the offramp; suggested the signage as proposed balances the building design.
- Suggested the certain design elements, such as pilasters on the tower and a round column on the corner window, are not true Spanish Colonial Revival design, and these elements could be further revised.
- Commented that Henry Lenny is an exceptional designer and an acknowledged expert on Spanish Colonial Revival design; the Commission can trust that the design presented is indicative of Spanish Colonial Revival architecture.
- Expressed appreciation for the classic and whimsical architecture.
- Established that trees/landscaping were removed from the westerly portion of the landscaping plans due to potential need for easement from Caltrans; requested the project be conditioned to require the applicant to add trees/landscaping in the event Caltrans does not require the easement.
- Established that both the Mobil Gas Station and Starbucks are owned by the same property owner; noted that Starbucks is bound by contract not to block the Mobil Gas Station sign.
- Established that McDonalds Restaurant is open 24 hours a day; the Starbucks is also proposed to be open 24 hours a day.

- Suggested the project be conditioned to require vehicle and pedestrian traffic review after 12 months to ensure no negative impacts.
- Opined that the proposed tower signage is freeway-visible, not freeway-oriented; noted that if the Commission decides the signage is not freeway-oriented and allows it to remain in place, they should also allow it to feature illumination; advised caution when discussing sign content (i.e. requiring removal of lettering); stated that the project as conditioned requires the applicant work with the architect/designers and staff to ensure appropriate lighting.
- Established both the architecture and landscaping will have further review by staff and/or City consultants; established originally proposed bio-swell/wetland location plans will have to be redesigned/relocated in response to permission/easement issues, and therefore require additional review and approval from Engineering Division.
- Established the applicant would not be in favor of removing the lighting from elevation of the tower signage that is visible from the freeway due to lack of architectural symmetry.
- Commented that too many trees along the site frontage may result in signage blockage on adjacent properties and/or line of sight safety issues due to street curvature.
- Confirmed that trees were removed from original landscape plans due to the need for water infiltration basins, which was moved to the front of the property due to restrictions on existing easements.
- Commented that too many trees along the frontage would block the Henry Lenny designed building from the street view. He commented that the sign package, as proposed, is modest and less than the amount of signage allowed and also, less than signage displayed at the adjacent McDonalds.

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR CRANDELL, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 18-009, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING SITE PLAN PERMIT 17-348, CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 17-349, ARCHITECTURAL PERMIT 17-350, AND DISCRETIONARY SIGN PERMIT 17-413, PICO STARBUCKS, A REQUEST TO ALLOW A SINGLE-STORY COMMERCIAL BUILDING WITH A DRIVE-THROUGH AND AMPLIFIED SOUND, MASTER SIGN PROGRAM WITH MENU BOARDS AND OUTDOOR DINING AREA ON A SITE THAT INCLUDES A PARCEL LOCATED AT 620 AVENIDA PICO AND PORTION OF AN ADJOINING LOT AT 600 AVENIDA PICO.

Amended as follows:

Amended as per the errata distributed by staff.

Add a condition of approval requiring traffic review in one year, including pedestrian traffic review.

Add a condition of approval requiring staff to supervise relocation of utility room doors in rear to ensure they are 1) appropriately placed and 2) painted the same as building color.

Add a condition of approval requiring the architectural recess for signage on the tower be the same as shown in the plans to the DRSC and lit in the same manner.

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL.]

9. NEW BUSINESS

None

10. OLD BUSINESS

None

11. REPORTS OF COMMISSIONERS/STAFF

- A. Tentative Future Agenda
- B. Zoning Administrator Minutes of April 18, 2018
- C. Staff Waiver 18-186
- D. Staff Waiver 18-197
- E. Staff Waiver 18-204

Commissioner Crandell requested Cecilia Gallardo-Daly, Community Development Director, arrange for new staff to be introduced to the Commission and their positions identified.

Commissioner Ruehlin commented that when he was appointed a Commissioner many years ago, many of his fellow Commissioners had been serving a considerable amount of time, and Planning Division staff was knowledgeable and settled. Due to this seasoning/stability, he was able to rely on staff and his fellow Commissioners for their expertise. Because the staff at the City is so new, he suggested the Commission actively mentor and help staff, and be there for them, as previous Commissioners and staff have been there for newly appointed Commissioners.

12. ADJOURNMENT

IT WAS MOVED BY CHAIR BROWN, SECONDED BY CHAIR PRO TEM BLACKWELL, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN AT 9:24 p.m. to the Joint Council/Commissioners/Committees Meeting to be held on Thursday, May 10, 2018, at 7:00 p.m. at the Ole Hanson Beach Club located at 105 West Avenida Pico, San Clemente, CA.

The next Adjourned Regular Planning Commission Meeting will be held at 6:00 p.m. on May 16, 2018, in Council Chambers at City Hall located at 100 Avenida Presidio, San Clemente, California as the Study Session has been canceled.

Respectfully submitted,

Donald Brown, Chair

Attest:

Cecilia Gallardo-Daly, Community Development Director