

The Outlets at San Clemente

Draft Supplemental Environmental Impact Report



Prepared for:

Lead Agency
City of San Clemente
910 Calle Negocio, Suite 100
San Clemente, CA 92673
Contact: Amy Vazquez
outletsigns@san-clemente.org



Prepared by:

CAA Planning, Inc.
30900 Rancho Viejo Road, Suite 285
San Juan Capistrano, CA 92675
Contact: Shawna L. Schaffner

November 2017

**Volume 1
Draft
Supplemental EIR**

Contents

1.	Introduction	1
	1.1 Purpose of the SEIR	1
	1.2 Statutory Authority.....	1
	1.3 CEQA Process	3
	1.4 Incorporation by Reference	7
	1.5 Issues to be Resolved.....	7
	1.6 Disagreement among Experts	8
	1.7 Thresholds of Significance.....	8
	1.8 Project Alternatives	8
	1.9 Availability of Draft EIR, Technical Appendices, and Administrative Record.....	9
2.	Executive Summary	11
	2.1 Project Location	11
	2.2 Project Description.....	11
	2.3 Discretionary Actions	14
	2.4 Summary of Environmental Impacts	14
	2.5 Matrix of Mitigation Measures.....	16
	2.6 Impacts Found Not To Be Significant.....	17
3.	Project History and Background	19
4.	Project Description.....	33
	4.1 Project Location	33
	4.2 Existing Conditions.....	33
	4.3 Project Description.....	35
	4.4 Energy Conservation.....	54
	4.5 Discretionary Approvals.....	55
	4.6 Project Objectives.....	55
	4.7 Intended Uses of the SEIR.....	56
5.	Environmental Setting, Impacts, and Mitigation Measures	59
	5.1 Aesthetics.....	59
	5.1.1 Existing Conditions	60
	5.1.2 Regulatory Setting.....	60
	5.1.3 Thresholds of Significance	67
	5.1.4 Project Impacts Prior to Mitigation.....	67
	5.1.5 Mitigation Measures	164
	5.1.6 Level of Significance after Mitigation	164
	5.1.7 Cumulative Impacts	167
	5.1.8 Unavoidable Adverse Impacts.....	167
	5.2 Biological Resources	169
	5.2.1 Existing Conditions	169
	5.2.2 Regulatory Setting.....	170
	5.2.3 Thresholds of Significance	172
	5.2.4 Project Impacts Prior to Mitigation.....	173
	5.2.5 Impact Analysis.....	179
	5.2.6 Mitigation Measures	182
	5.2.7 Level of Significance after Mitigation	182
	5.2.8 Cumulative Impacts	182
	5.2.9 Unavoidable Adverse Impacts.....	183
	5.3 Land Use and Planning.....	185
	5.3.1 Existing Conditions	185
	5.3.2 Regulatory Setting.....	185
	5.3.3 Thresholds of Significance	188
	5.3.4 Project Impacts Prior to Mitigation.....	188
	5.3.5 Mitigation Measures	198
	5.3.6 Level of Significance after Mitigation	198

5.3.7	Cumulative Impacts.....	198
5.3.8	Unavoidable Adverse Impacts	199
5.4	Transportation and Traffic.....	201
5.4.1	Existing Conditions	202
5.4.2	Performance Criteria	202
5.4.3	Thresholds of Significance.....	202
5.4.4	Project Impacts Prior to Mitigation	203
5.4.5	Mitigation Measures.....	212
5.4.6	Level of Significance After Mitigation.....	212
5.4.7	Cumulative Impacts.....	213
5.4.8	Unavoidable Adverse Impacts	213
6.	Alternatives Analysis.....	215
6.1	Introduction.....	215
6.2	Feasibility	216
6.3	Alternatives Considered But Not Advanced	217
6.4	Alternatives Presentation.....	218
6.5	Project Alternative 1 - No Project	219
6.5.1	Description of Alternative.....	219
6.5.2	Attainment of Project Objectives.....	221
6.6	Project Alternative 2 – Reduced Size/Reduced Number of Signs Alternative	223
6.6.1	Description of Alternative.....	223
6.6.2	Attainment of Project Objectives.....	228
6.7	Project Alternative 3 - Project ID Signs Only.....	230
6.7.1	Description of Alternative.....	230
6.7.2	Attainment of Project Objectives.....	236
6.8	Project Alternative 4 – No Color Exceptions	237
6.8.1	Description of Alternative.....	237
6.8.2	Attainment of Project Objectives.....	238
6.9	Project Alternative 5 – DRSC/Applicant Updated Project.....	239
6.9.1	Description of Alternative.....	239
6.9.2	Attainment of Project Objectives.....	250
6.10	Environmentally Superior Alternative	251
7.	Summary of Cumulative Impacts.....	253
8.	Growth-Inducing Impacts	257
9.	Inventory of Mitigation Measures	259
10.	Inventory of Unavoidable Adverse Impacts.....	261
10.1	Aesthetics	261
11.	Organizations Affiliated with the Project.....	263

Appendices

Appendix A – Notice of Preparation/Initial Study

Appendix B – NOP Comment Letters

Appendix C – Operational Photometric Assessment – Plaza San Clemente

Appendix D – Operational Photometric Assessment – Plaza San Clemente Hotel Site

Appendix E – Amendment to Site Plan Permit 99-16 Marblehead Coastal, Commercial Plaza Plans

Appendix F – Design Review Subcommittee, Agenda Item 2-D

Appendix G – Visual Impact Analysis of Proposed Freeway Signage

Appendix H – 1. Biological Resources Impact Analysis Report; and 2. Supplement to
Biological Resources Impact Analysis

Appendix I – Sign Impact Analysis Letter Report

Appendix J – Analysis of Proposed Freeway-Oriented On-Premise Signage

Appendix K – Individual Sign Location Details

List of Figures

Exhibit 2-1	– Regional Map	12
Exhibit 2-2	– Vicinity Map	13
Exhibit 3-1	– Amendment to Site Plan Permit 99-16 Marblehead Coastal, Commercial Plaza.....	21
Exhibit 3-2	– Amendment to Site Plan Permit 99-16 Marblehead Coastal, Commercial Plaza.....	22
Exhibit 3-3	– Amendment to Site Plan Permit 99-16 Marblehead Coastal, Commercial Plaza.....	23
Exhibit 3-4	–Amendment to Site Plan Permit 99-16 Marblehead Coastal, Commercial Plaza.....	24
Exhibit 3-5	– Master Sign Program for SEP 06-402.....	26
Exhibit 3-6	– Master Sign Program for SEP 06-402.....	27
Exhibit 3-7	– Master Sign Program for SEP 06-402.....	28
Exhibit 3-8	– Master Sign Program for SEP 06-402.....	29
Exhibit 4-1	– Sign Plans	36
Exhibit 4-2	– Sign Plans	37
Exhibit 4-3	– Overall Site Plan	38
Exhibit 4-4	– MSP 3.0 Tenant Signage Criteria	39
Exhibit 4-5	– Reverse Channel Halo Fabrication	41
Exhibit 4-6	– Materials Board	42
Exhibit 5-1	– Visual Assessment Units	62
Exhibit 5-2	– Visual Assessment Unit Photos.....	63
Exhibit 5-3	– Visual Assessment Unit Photos.....	64
Exhibit 5-4	– Visual Assessment Unit Photos.....	65
Exhibit 5-5	– Signage Viewshed – Regional	69
Exhibit 5-6	– Signage Viewshed – Local.....	70
Exhibit 5-7	– Candidate Key View Locations Aerial	82
Exhibit 5-8	– Candidate Key View 1 Photographs.....	83
Exhibit 5-9	– Candidate Key View 2 Photographs.....	84
Exhibit 5-10	– Candidate Key View 3 Photographs.....	85
Exhibit 5-11	– Candidate Key View 4 Photographs.....	86
Exhibit 5-12	– Candidate Key View 5 Photographs.....	87
Exhibit 5-13	– Candidate Key View 6 Photographs.....	88
Exhibit 5-14	– Candidate Key View 7 Photographs.....	89
Exhibit 5-15	– Candidate Key View 8 Photographs.....	90
Exhibit 5-16	– Candidate Key View 9 Photographs.....	91
Exhibit 5-17	– Candidate Key View 10 Photographs	92
Exhibit 5-18	– Candidate Key View 11 Photographs.....	93
Exhibit 5-19	– Candidate Key View 12 Photographs.....	94
Exhibit 5-20	– Candidate Key View 13 Photographs.....	95
Exhibit 5-21	– Candidate Key View 14 Photographs	96
Exhibit 5-22	– Candidate Key View 15 Photographs	97
Exhibit 5-23	– Candidate Key View 16 Photographs	98
Exhibit 5-24	– Candidate Key View 17 Photographs.....	99
Exhibit 5-25	– Candidate Key View 18 Photographs.....	100
Exhibit 5-26	– Candidate Key View 19 Photographs.....	101
Exhibit 5-27	– Candidate Key Views 21 and 22 Photographs.....	102
Exhibit 5-28	– Candidate Key Views 23 and 24 Photographs.....	103
Exhibit 5-29	– Candidate Key Views 25 and 26 Photographs.....	104
Exhibit 5-30	– Candidate Key Views 27 and 28 Photographs.....	105
Exhibit 5-31	– Candidate Key Views 29a and 29b Photographs.....	106
Exhibit 5-32	– Candidate Key Views 30 and 31 Photographs.....	107
Exhibit 5-33	– Candidate Key Views 32 and 33 Photographs.....	108
Exhibit 5-34	– Candidate Key Views 34 and as Photographs.....	109
Exhibit 5-35	– Candidate Key Views be and 36 Photographs.....	110

Exhibit 5-36	- Candidate Key Views 37 and 38 Photographs	111
Exhibit 5-37	- Candidate Key View 39 Photographs.....	112
Exhibit 5-38	- Candidate Key View 40 Photographs.....	113
Exhibit 5-39	- Candidate Key View 41a Photographs	114
Exhibit 5-40	- Candidate Key View 41b Photographs.....	115
Exhibit 5-41	- Candidate Key View 42 Photographs.....	116
Exhibit 5-42	- Candidate Key View 43 Photographs.....	117
Exhibit 5-43	- Candidate Key View 44 Photographs.....	118
Exhibit 5-44	- Candidate Key View 45 Photographs.....	119
Exhibit 5-45	- Candidate Key View 46 Photographs.....	120
Exhibit 5-46	- Candidate Key View 47 Photographs.....	121
Exhibit 5-47	- Candidate Key View 48 Photographs.....	122
Exhibit 5-48	- Candidate Key View 49 Photographs.....	123
Exhibit 5-49	- Candidate Key View 50a Photographs	124
Exhibit 5-50	- Candidate Key View 50b Photographs.....	125
Exhibit 5-51	- Candidate Key View 51 Photograph.....	126
Exhibit 5-52	- Candidate Key View 2 Visual Simulation.....	129
Exhibit 5-53	- Candidate Key View 3 Visual Simulation.....	131
Exhibit 5-54	- Candidate Key View 6 Visual Simulation.....	133
Exhibit 5-55	- Candidate Key View 8 Visual Simulation.....	135
Exhibit 5-56	- Candidate Key View 9 Visual Simulation.....	137
Exhibit 5-57	- Candidate Key View 10 Visual Simulation.....	139
Exhibit 5-58	- Candidate Key View 13 Visual Simulation.....	141
Exhibit 5-59	- Candidate Key View 16 Visual Simulation.....	143
Exhibit 5-60	- Candidate Key View 17 Visual Simulation.....	145
Exhibit 5-61	- Candidate Key View 41a Visual Simulation.....	147
Exhibit 5-62	- Photometric Plan	150
Exhibit 5-63	- Sign Lighting Example	151
Exhibit 5-64	- Daytime View Comparison	153
Exhibit 5-65	- Nighttime View Comparison.....	154
Exhibit 5-66	- Nighttime Views - Candidate Key View 8.....	155
Exhibit 5-67	- Nighttime Views - Candidate Key View 9.....	156
Exhibit 5-68	- Nighttime Views - Candidate Key View 10.....	157
Exhibit 5-69	- Nighttime Views - Candidate Key View 13.....	158
Exhibit 5-70	- Candidate Key View Simulations.....	176
Exhibit 5-71	- Zoning Map.....	187
Exhibit 5-72	- I-5 Southbound Path of Travel (With Signage).....	206
Exhibit 5-73	- I-5 Southbound Path of Travel (Without Signage, Route Option 1)	207
Exhibit 5-74	- I-5 Southbound Path of Travel (Without Signage, Route Option 2)	208
Exhibit 5-75	- I-5 Southbound Path of Travel (With Signage, Route Option 3)	209
Exhibit 5-76	- Weaving Analysis.....	211
Exhibit 6-1	- I-5 NB, Portions of Existing Buildings and Tower - Alternative 2	224
Exhibit 6-2	- Avenida Vista Hermosa - Alternative 2	225
Exhibit 6-3	- I-5 NB, Portions of Existing Buildings Proposed Hotel - Alternative 2.....	226
Exhibit 6-4	- 2165 Avenida Espada More than One-Half Mile to Hotel - Alternative 2	227
Exhibit 6-5	- I-5 NB, Portions of Existing Buildings and Tower - Alternative 3	231
Exhibit 6-6	- Avenida Vista Hermosa - Alternative 3	232
Exhibit 6-7	- I-5 NB, Portions of Existing Buildings Proposed Hotel - Alternative 3.....	233
Exhibit 6-8	- 2165 Avenida Espada More than One-Half Mile to Hotel - Alternative 3	234
Exhibit 6-9	- Site Plan - Alternative 5.....	241
Exhibit 6-10	- Tenant Sign Zones - Alternative 5	242
Exhibit 6-11	- Tenant Sign Locations - Alternative 5.....	243
Exhibit 6-12	- Tenant Sign Zones, Hotel - Alternative 5	244

Exhibit 6-13 – Icon Tower, Northeast and Southeast Elevations – Alternative 5	245
Exhibit 6-14 – Icon Tower, Northwest and Southwest Elevations – Alternative 5.....	246
Exhibit 6-15 – Tenant Sign Mounting Section – Alternative 5.....	247
Exhibit 6-16 – Signage Criteria – Alternative 5	248

List of Tables

Table 1-1 Scoping Meeting Comment Summary.....	4
Table 1-2 NOP Review Period Comment Summary	5
Table 2-1 Impacts Found Not To Be Significant.....	17
Table 4-1 Surrounding Land Uses.....	34
Table 4-2 Proposed Tenant ID Specification	43
Table 4-3 Project ID Signs Specifications.....	52
Table 4-4 Hotel ID Sign Specifications	53
Table 5-1 Visual Assessment Evaluation	61
Table 5-2 Candidate Key View Descriptions	73
Table 5-3 Sign Ordinance Objectives Consistency Analysis.....	159
Table 5-4 Marblehead Coastal Specific Plan Consistency Analysis	161
Table 5-5 Marblehead Coastal Design Guidelines and Standards Consistency Analysis.....	162
Table 5-6 Illumination Comparative Measurements.....	174
Table 5-7 Habitats/Vegetation Communities within Project Study Area.....	175
Table 5-8 Sign Exception Permit Requirements.....	192
Table 5-9 Caltrans Outdoor Sign Requirements	204
Table 5-10 Peak Hour Weaving Capacity Analysis Summary.....	210
Table 6-1 Summary Matrix of Impacts of Alternatives in Relation to Proposed Project as Mitigated	219
Table 7-1 Cumulative Impacts Summary.....	254

This page intentionally blank