

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE
PLANNING COMMISSION
April 19, 2017 @ 7:00 p.m.
City Council Chambers
100 Avenida Presidio
San Clemente, CA**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Crandell called the Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission of the City of San Clemente to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chair pro tem Blackwell led the Pledge of Allegiance.

3. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Wayne Eggleston, Michael Smith, Jason Talley, Zhen Wu;
Chair pro tem Michael Blackwell, Vice Chair Barton Crandell

Commissioners Absent: Chair Donald Brown

Staff Present: Cliff Jones, Associate Planner
Linda Vo, Assistant Planner
Matthew Richardson, Assistant City Attorney
Eileen White, Recording Secretary

4. SPECIAL ORDERS OF BUSINESS - None

5. MINUTES

A. Minutes from the Planning Commission Study Session of April 5, 2017.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, AND CARRIED 3-0-3, WITH COMMISSIONER TALLEY, COMMISSIONER WU, AND CHAIR PRO TEM BLACKWELL ABSTAINING, TO RECEIVE AND FILE THE MINUTES OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION STUDY SESSION OF APRIL 5, 2017.

Amended as follows:

Page 1, under "Roll Call" remove "Commissioner Wu" from "Commissioners Present" and insert under "Commissioners Absent"

B. Minutes from the Planning Commission Meeting of April 19, 2017.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR CRANDELL, AND CARRIED 4-0-2, WITH COMMISSIONER TALLEY AND CHAIR PRO TEM BLACKWELL ABSTAINING, TO RECEIVE AND FILE THE MINUTES OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING OF APRIL 5, 2017.

6. **ORAL AND WRITTEN COMMUNICATION**

None

7. **CONSENT CALENDAR**

None

8. **PUBLIC HEARING**

A. 120 Avenida Algodon – Amendment to Cultural Heritage Permit 16-307– Jones Addition (Carrillo)

Public Hearing to consider a request to modify the previously approved Cultural Heritage Permit for an additional to a legal non-conforming historic home. The project is located at 120 Avenida Algodon in the Residential Medium (RM) zoning district. The site's legal description is Lot 21, of Tract 779, Assessor's Parcel Number 058-093-08.

Cliff Jones, Associate Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Jones Addition and Remodel, AM-CHP 16-307, dated April 19, 2017." A copy of the Presentation is on file in Planning Division.

Steve Dobbie, architect for the applicant, advised the proposed structure has been substantially reduced in response to survey results indicating an encroachment previously undiscovered.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 17-012, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING AMENDMENT TO CULTURAL HERITAGE PERMIT 16-307, JONES ADDITION, A REQUEST TO ALLOW A REAR ADDITION TO A NONCONFORMING HISTORIC RESIDENCE LOCATED AT 120 AVENIDA ALGODON.

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]

B. Cultural Heritage Permit 16-354 – 508 Victoria Duplex (Schuller)

Public Hearing to consider a request to demolish an existing residential fourplex and to construct a residential duplex on a site located at 508 Avenida Victoria in the Residential High zone of the Pier Bowl Specific Plan and within the Architectural Overlay (PBSP-RH-A).

Commissioner Talley recused himself from considering this item due to a past working relationship with the subject property builder and left the meeting room. He did not return to the meeting.

Cliff Jones, Associate Planner, narrated a presentation entitled, "508 Victoria Duplex, CHP 16-354, dated April 19, 2017." A copy of the presentation is on file in Planning Division.

David York, architect for the project, was available for questions.

Vice Chair Crandell opened the public hearing.

Vice Chair Crandell acknowledged receipt of a letter dated April 19, 2017, on the dais, signed by 3 residents, opposed to the subject project due to potential loss of personal ocean views.

George Liddle, Celeste Liddle, Dennis Nygren, Patricia Cox, Kathy Bell and Kim Muscara, residents, opposed the proposed project due to its high number of stories, potential blocking of others' views, negative impacts on area parking, negative construction impacts, loss of home equity due to reduced views, and potential lack of proper noticing for the project.

Commission Comments included:

- The role of the Planning Commission is to ensure the project meets applicable ordinances, policies and guidelines, which this project does. The ability to change the ordinances, policies and guidelines rests with the City Council.
- The City has restrictions regarding construction noise, debris, hours allowed, etc., and telephone numbers to call in the event the restrictions are not followed.
- In the existing zoning guidelines for the area, properties are zoned to be as tall as 45 feet; all property owners within the same zoning designation have the same ability to expand.
- The City currently does not have personal view protection rights; the Commission is unable to protect personal views when making decisions.
- Suggestion that the architecture and massing of the project is not in character with other properties in the neighborhood.

- Suggestion that the structure is too large for the property's size.
- Encouraged that the public voice their opinions on the General Plan's vision for the area to City Council. Those desiring to appeal the project would do so at the City Council level.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER WU AND CARRIED 5-0-1, WITH COMMISSIONER TALLEY ABSTAINING, TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 17-011, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING CULTURAL HERITAGE PERMIT 16-354, 508 VICTORIA DUPLEX, A REQUEST TO ALLOW THE DEMOLITION OF A FOUR-PLEX AND THE CONSTRUCTION OF A DUPLEX, LOCATED AT 508 AVENIDA VICTORIA.

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]

9. NEW BUSINESS - None

10. OLD BUSINESS - None

11. REPORTS OF COMMISSIONERS/STAFF

- A. Tentative Future Agenda
- B. Zoning Administrator Minutes of 4-5-17
- C. Staff Waiver 17-099, 306 Cazador Lane
- D. Staff Waiver 17-103, 1105 Buena Vista
- E. Staff Waiver 17-109, 601 Calle Puente

Commissioner Blackwell reported that at its last meeting, the Coastal Advisory Committee heard a report on Poche Beach Falconry Program and discussed bacteria testing levels. Upcoming events include Earth Day celebrations, the Montalvo Canyon project, social media guidelines, and a presentation from the Ocean Institute. The next meeting of the Committee is the Joint Council, Commissions, and Committee meeting of May 30, 2017.

12. ADJOURNMENT

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER WU, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN AT 8:16 P.M. TO THE REGULAR MEETING TO BE HELD AT 7:00 P.M. ON MAY 17, 2017, IN COUNCIL CHAMBERS AT CITY HALL LOCATED AT 100 AVENIDA PRESIDIO, SAN CLEMENTE, CA.

Respectfully submitted,

Barton Crandell, Vice Chair

Attest:

Cliff Jones, Associate Planner

DRAFT