

**MINUTES OF THE ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING  
OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE  
PLANNING COMMISSION  
January 18, 2017 @ 6:00 p.m.  
City Council Chambers  
100 Avenida Presidio  
San Clemente, CA**

---

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Brown called the Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission of the City of San Clemente to order at 6:01 p.m.

**2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Chair Brown led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**3. ROLL CALL**

Commissioners Present: Wayne Eggleston, Michael Smith, Jason Talley, Zhen Wu;  
Chair pro tem Michael Blackwell, Vice Chair Barton Crandell,  
Chair Donald Brown

Commissioners Absent: None

Staff Present: Amber Gregg, Interim Senior Planner  
Christopher Wright, Associate Planner  
Cliff Jones, Associate Planner  
David Carrillo, Contract Planner  
Kirt A. Coury, Contract Planner  
Arlen Beck, Planning Intern  
Matthew Richardson, Assistant City Attorney  
Eileen White, Recording Secretary

**4. SPECIAL ORDERS OF BUSINESS - None**

**5. MINUTES**

A. Minutes from the Planning Commission Meeting of December 21, 2016

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR CRANDELL, SECONDED BY CHAIR PRO TEM BLACKWELL, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF DECEMBER 21, 2016, AS SUBMITTED.

**6. ORAL AND WRITTEN COMMUNICATION - None**

7. **CONSENT CALENDAR** – None

8. **PUBLIC HEARING**

A. **Specific Plan Amendment 16-361, General Plan consistency for Shorecliff's Senior Housing Site** (Wright)

A continuance of a public Hearing to consider applicant initiated amendments to the Forster Ranch Specific Plan that involve updating the land use designation and standards of a site to be consistent with and implement the Centennial General Plan, adopted in February 2014. The amendments apply to an approximately 8-acre portion of the Shorecliff's Golf Course in the Sector G Coastal Zone area. The land use designation is currently resort hotel (as a conditionally permitted use) for a 6-acre portion of the site and Shorecliffs Golf Course for a 2-acre portion. The proposed Specific Plan amendments change the land use of the resort hotel area (the 6-acre portion) to Residential High Density with the intent to allow senior housing. This change is needed to make the Specific Plan consistent with the Residential High Density designation and standards in the Centennial General Plan.

Amber Gregg, Interim City Planner, recommended the Commission continue this item to their February 8, 2016, regular meeting.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR CRANDELL, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO CONTINUE SPECIFIC PLAN AMENDMENT 16-361, GENERAL PLAN CONSISTENCY FOR SHORECLIFF'S SENIOR HOUSING SITE TO THE MEETING OF FEBRUARY 8, 2017.

**[ITEM CONTINUED. PLANNING COMMISSION DECISION PENDING.]**

B. **120 Avenida Algodon – Cultural Heritage Permit 16-307 – Jones Addition** (Carrillo)

Public Hearing to consider a request for the construction of a rear addition to a historic home located at 120 Avenida Algodon in the Residential Medium (RM) zoning district. The site's legal description is Lot 21, of Tract 779, Assessor's Parcel Number 058-093-08.

David Carrillo, Contract Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Jones Addition, CHP 16-307, dated January 18, 2017." A copy of the Presentation is on file in Planning Division.

Steve Dobbie, the applicant, indicated agreement with the Conditions of Approval; described changes proposed to the project based on new information.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing.

Larry Culbertson, resident and president of the Historical Society, opposed the proposed addition because he felt as though the project did not comply with Federal Standards and the City's guidelines for preservation; submitted copies of a listing of San Clemente Historic Structures not worthy of National Register consideration due to alterations; felt the proposed addition is too large and would destroy the historic integrity of the subject home.

Chair Brown closed the public hearing.

Commission comments included:

- Comment that the addition is clearly demarked from the original structure and can be removed in a manner that would return the historic structure to its original size.
- Suggestion that it would be unfair to property owners to prevent them from expanding historic homes to livable/comfortably sized homes for modern living.
- Suggestion that the Historical Society dispatch a formal letter of concern to City Council outlining its concerns regarding additions to historic homes and requesting information regarding Mills Act guidelines and tax impacts for properties with additions.
- Suggestion that the project be redesigned so that only one wall of the historic home is attached to the new addition. The applicant indicated this redesign would eliminate access to the new addition from the existing home.
- Suggestion that the applicant be required to remove the bougainvillea planted along the front fence to allow better visibility of the home from the street. Staff indicated this was an existing condition from a previous approval.
- Request that staff ensure that the addition follows standard procedure for additions on historic homes such as paint weathering, etc.

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR CRANDELL, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 17-001, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING CULTURAL HERITAGE PERMIT 16-307, JONES ADDITION, A REQUEST TO ALLOW A REAR ADDITION TO A HISTORIC RESIDENCE LOCATED AT 120 AVENIDA ALGODON.

**[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]**

**C. 102 Avenida Cabrillo – Conditional Use Permit 16-398 – Nomad's Cantina**  
(Beck/Jones)

Public Hearing to consider a request for a full range of alcohol for indoor and outdoor consumption for an existing restaurant located at 102 Avenida Cabrillo in the Mixed-Use 3.1 (MU 3.1) Zoning District. The site's legal description is Lot 25, of Tract 779, Assessor's Parcel Number 058-073-25.

Arlen Beck, Planning Intern, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Nomad's Canteen, CUP 16-398, dated January 18, 2017." A copy of the Presentation is on file in the Planning Division.

Jeff Gourley, applicant, requested approval so that restaurant patrons can enjoy a variety of alcoholic beverages.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

IT WAS MOVED BY CHAIR BROWN, SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR CRANDELL, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 17-002, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 16-398, NOMAD'S CANTEEN FULL ALCOHOL, TO ALLOW THE SALE OF A FULL RANGE OF ALCOHOL FOR INDOOR AND OUTDOOR ON-SITE CONSUMPTION AT AN EXISTING RESTAURANT LOCATED AT 102 AVENIDA CABRILLO.

**[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]**

**D. Discretionary Sign Permit 16-178, Los Mares 76 Station Master Sign Program** (Coury)

Public hearing to consider a request for a new Master Sign Program for an existing service station located at 606 Camino De Los Mares within the Community Commercial (CC-2) zoning district and the legal description is Lot 7 of Tract 1127 and Assessor's Parcel Number 675-091-01.

Cliff Jones, Associate Planner narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "76 Station Sign Program, Discretionary Sign Permit 16-178, dated January 18, 2017." A copy of the Presentation is on file in Planning Division.

Sorin Enache, applicant, noted that although the applicant requested red or white lights for the fuel prices on the monument sign, staff suggested red instead of the white as the red is less intense. He noted current technology will allow the white lights to be dimmed, and State Law dictates that the lights used for the price on diesel fuel are green.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing.

Jim Ruehlin, resident, cautioned that the proposed fuel price lights may be too bright at night and produce glare; suggested the lights be shielded to comply with Dark Sky guidelines; suggested the LED lights be replaced with internally illuminated signs; expressed concern as the location is a gateway to the City.

Chair Brown closed the public hearing.

Sorin Enache agreed to install the red lighting for the fuel prices for reduced intensity if needed; noted the updated technology includes a photo cell to prevent day usage; advised he has not encountered any problem with Dark Sky guidelines in other cities. He agreed to work with staff to ensure the signage is appropriate with all guidelines and concerns expressed this evening.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER TALLEY, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 17-005, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING DISCRETIONARY SIGN PERMIT 16-178, 76 STATION MASTER SIGN PROGRAM, A REQUEST TO ALLOW A MASTER SIGN PROGRAM FOR AN EXISTING SERVICE STATION LOCATED AT 606 CAMINO DE LAS MARES.

**[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]**

**E. 635 Camino De Los Mares – Discretionary Sign Permit 16-177, Los Mares Master Sign Program (Wright)**

Public Hearing to consider a request to establish a master sign program for a two-story commercial building located at 635 Camino De Los Mares. The sign program includes seven wall signs, several directional signs in the parking lot, and building address signs. The site's legal description is Lot 6 of Tract 5951, and Assessor's Parcel Number is 675-071-17.

Christopher Wright, Associate Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Los Mares Master Sign Program, Discretionary Sign Permit 16-177, dated January 18, 2017." A copy of the Presentation is on file in Planning Division.

Mike Reilly, applicant, note the new directional signs will be similar to those already in place.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

Comments included request for future sign programs to provide an example of proposed sign types (e.g. halo-lit pin-mounted letters), consideration of Dark Skies policies in discretionary signage applications; confirmation from staff that trademark logos and colors are customarily provided for in sign programs.

IT WAS MOVED BY CHAIR PRO TEM BLACKWELL, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER TALLEY, AND CARRIED 6-0-1, WITH COMMISSIONER SMITH OPPOSED, TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 17-003, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING DISCRETIONARY SIGN PERMIT 16-177, LOS MARES MASTER SIGN PROGRAM, A REQUEST TO ALLOW A MASTER SIGN PROGRAM ON A COMMERCIAL BUILDING LOCATED AT 801 NORTH EL CAMINO REAL.

Amended as follows: In resolution title, replace "801 North El Camino Real" with "635 Camino Los Mares"

**[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]**

**F. 513 & 515 Elena Lane, Cultural Heritage Permit (CHP) 16-202, Elena Lane Residences (Wright)**

Public Hearing to consider a request to construct single-family residences on two adjacent lots across the street from a historic structure. The site is within Residential Medium Density zoning district and Coastal Overlay (RM-CZ) at 513 and 515 Elena Lane. The site's legal description is Lot 16, 17, and Portion of Lot 15, Block 2 of Tract 785. The Assessor's Parcel Number is 692-044-13.

Commissioner Eggleston recused himself from considering this agenda item due to nearby property ownership and left Chambers. He did not return to the meeting.

Christopher Wright, Associate Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Elena Lane Residences, CHP 16-202, dated January 18, 2017." A copy of the Presentation is on file in Planning Division. Mr. Wright noted the City Council previously decided on the removal of the Norfolk Island Pine at 513 Elena Lane, separate from the request being considered. This Council approval included a condition requiring Community Development Director of a replacement tree plan. The replacement plan (attached to the staff report) was reviewed thoroughly and approved recently for the properties since it was consistent with Council direction.

Sean Prescott, architect representing the applicant, reviewed the proposed project; noted the project is less intense than what would be allowed; advised two architectural styles are proposed in order to showcase the historic structure and provide variety; requested removal of a condition of approval requiring a licensed arborist maintain the trees as it is onerous.

Michael Luna, architect, noted the two distinctly different architectural styles proposed will give the Ole Hanson the prominence it deserves and visual relief from too-similar styling; advised the proposed large tree removal is necessary

due to safety, aesthetic, and damage avoidance concerns. The tree will be replaced with well-maintained, beautiful, substantial trees.

Associate Planner Wright advised the licensed arborist requirement was included in response to recommendation from the City's consultant; noted staff is ambivalent regarding arborist requirement because the Council didn't require such a requirement and other conditions are adequately in place (in resolution for prior separate decision on tree removal and the current resolution for residences) to ensure the trees are maintained properly; and advised the City Council and staff considered many options for keeping the tree before reluctantly agreeing to its removal for several reasons.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing.

Larry Culbertson, resident, noted agreement with decision to remove the tree based on gradual realization that it is dangerous; supported proposal to provide a variety of architecture styles.

Chair Brown closed the public hearing.

During discussion the Commissioners supported removal of the diseased and dangerous tree (which was previously decided by the City Council separate from this project), supported removal of Condition for arborist pruning of the replacement trees; supported the reduced massing, quality design, extensive landscaping, and thoughtful mix of architectural styles.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER TALLEY, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, AND CARRIED 6-0-1, WITH COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON ABSTAINING, TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 17-004, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING CULTURAL HERITAGE PERMIT 16-202, ELENA LANE RESIDENCES, A REQUEST TO CONSTRUCT SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCES ON TWO ADJACENT LOTS ACROSS THE STREET FROM A HISTORIC STRUCTURE AT 513 AND 515 ELENA.

Amended as follows:

Page 6, remove Condition no. 29 in its entirety.

**[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]**

9. **NEW BUSINESS** - None
10. **OLD BUSINESS** - None
11. **REPORTS OF COMMISSIONERS/STAFF**
  - A. Tentative Future Agenda

- B. Zoning Administrator Minutes of 12-21-16
- C. Zoning Administrator Minutes of 01-04-17
- D. Staff Waiver, 16-438 2222 S El Camino Real
- E. Staff Waiver, 16-442 215 S El Camino Real

Commissioner Blackwell reported that the Coastal Advisory Committee's last meeting was canceled due to lack of quorum; invited all to attend the next meeting on February 9, 2017, at 7:00 p.m. in the Ole Hanson Fireside Room at the Community Center.

Vice Chair Crandell announced he is unable to attend the January 25, 2017, Design Review Subcommittee meeting, and Commissioner Smith will attend in his stead.

Interim City Planner Gregg requested that those interested in attending the Planning Commissioner's Academy or other planning-related opportunities to email her.

## 12. ADJOURNMENT

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR CRANDELL, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER WU, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN AT 8:13 P.M. TO THE ADJOURNED REGULAR PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING TO BE HELD AT 6:00 P.M. ON FEBRUARY 8, 2017, IN COUNCIL CHAMBERS AT CITY HALL LOCATED AT 100 AVENIDA PRESIDIO, SAN CLEMENTE, CA.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Donald Brown, Chair

Attest:

---

Amber Gregg, Interim City Planner