

**MINUTES OF THE ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING
OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE
PLANNING COMMISSION
July 8, 2015 @ 6:00 p.m.
City Council Chambers
100 Avenida Presidio
San Clemente, CA**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Commissioner Brown called the Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission of the City of San Clemente to order at 6:00 p.m.

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Commissioner Brown led the Pledge of Allegiance.

3. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Michael Blackwell, Donald Brown, Barton Crandell, Wayne Eggleston, Michael Smith, Jim Ruehlin, and Zhen Wu

Commissioners Absent: None

Staff Present: Jim Pechous, City Planner
Adam Atamian, Associate Planner
Christopher Wright, Associate Planner
Brian Brower, IS Analyst
Matthew Richardson, Assistant City Attorney
Eileen White, Recording Secretary

4. SPECIAL ORDERS OF BUSINESS

A. Selection of Planning Commission Chair, Vice Chair, and Chair Pro Tem

Commissioner Ruehlin nominated Commissioner Brown to serve as Chair and Commissioner Smith seconded the nomination. There were no other nominations, and Commissioner Brown was elected Chair on a unanimous vote.

Commissioner Crandell nominated Commissioner Ruehlin to serve as Vice Chair and Chair Brown seconded the nomination. There were no other nominations, and Commissioner Ruehlin was elected Vice Chair on a unanimous vote.

Commissioner Smith nominated Commissioner Crandell to serve as Chair pro tem, and Vice Chair Ruehlin seconded the nomination. There were no other nominations, and Commissioner Crandell was elected Chair pro tem on a unanimous vote.

B. Selection of Design Review Subcommittee Members

Select three members and one alternate to serve on the Design Review Subcommittee which meets the second and fourth Wednesday of each month at 3:00 p.m. in the Community Development Department, Conference Room A.

Chair Brown nominated Commissioner Eggleston, Chair pro tem Crandell and Vice Chair Ruehlin to serve as the Design Review Subcommittee, with Commissioner Wu as alternative. There were no other nominations, and Commissioner Eggleston, Chair pro tem Crandell and Vice Chair Ruehlin, with Commissioner Wu acting as alternative, were selected to serve on the Design Review Subcommittee.

C. Selection of Coastal Advisory Committee Member

Select one member to serve on the Coastal Advisory Committee which meets the second Thursday of each month at 7:00 p.m. in the Community Center, Ole Hanson Fireside Room.

Commissioner Blackwell nominated himself to serve on the Coastal Advisory Committee, and Vice Chair Ruehlin seconded the nomination. There were no other nominations, and Commissioner Blackwell was elected to serve on the Coastal Advisory Committee on a unanimous vote.

D. City Email Review (Brower)

Review of procedures for Planning Commissioners to access City email.

Brian Brower, IS Analyst, distributed a handout and reviewed procedure for the Commissioners to access their new official Planning Commission-associated email addresses.

5. MINUTES

A. Minutes from the Planning Commission Regular Study Session of June 17, 2015

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, SECONDED BY CHAIR PRO TEM CRANDELL, AND CARRIED 5-0-2, WITH COMMISSIONER BLACKWELL AND COMMISSIONER WU

ABSTAINING, TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE REGULAR STUDY SESSION OF JUNE 17, 2015, AS SUBMITTED BY STAFF.

B. Minutes from the Planning Commission Regular Meeting of June 17, 2015

IT WAS MOVED BY CHAIR PRO TEM CRANDELL, SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR RUEHLIN, AND CARRIED 4-0-3, WITH COMMISSIONER BLACKWELL, COMMISSIONER WU, AND CHAIR BROWN ABSTAINING, TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF JUNE 17, 2015, WITH THE FOLLOWING REVISION:

Page 5, 5th paragraph, replace “Chair Darden” with “Chair pro tem Ruehlin”

C. Minutes from the Planning Commission Adjourned Regular Meeting of June 24, 2015

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR RUEHLIN, SECONDED BY CHAIR PRO TEM CRANDELL, AND CARRIED 4-0-3, WITH COMMISSIONER BLACKWELL, COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, AND COMMISSIONER WU ABSTAINING, TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING OF JUNE 24, 2015, AS SUBMITTED BY STAFF.

6. **ORAL AND WRITTEN COMMUNICATION** - None

7. **CONSENT CALENDAR** - None

8. **PUBLIC HEARING**

A. 831 Via Suerte – Amendment to Discretionary Sign Permit 06-044 – Talega Village Center Master Sign Program (Atamian)

Public Hearing to consider a request to modify the Master Sign Program of the Talega Village Center to alter allowable signage locations on the east wall of the “Shops 3” Building and provide additional monument signs. The project is located at 831 Via Suerte within the commercial portion of the mixed-use land use designation of the Talega Specific Plan. The legal description is Lot A, of Tract 16253, and Assessor’s Parcel Number 701-372-05, and Lot 4, of Tract 16936, and Assessor’s Parcel Number 701-372-01.

Adam Atamian, Associate Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, “Talega Village Center Master Sign Program Amendment, Amendment to Discretionary Sign Permit 06-044, dated July 8, 2015.”

David Szucs, Garden Grove resident, representing the applicant, advised the reason for the modified signage is to make the medical facilities more visible to the community.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER SMITH, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 15-025, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING AMENDMENT TO DISCRETIONARY SIGN PERMIT 06-044, TALEGA VILLAGE CENTER MASTER SIGN PROGRAM AMENDMENT, TO AMEND THE MASTER SIGN PROGRAM TO MODIFY THE LOCATIONS OF SIGNS ON THE REAR, EAST-FACING WALL OF THE "SHOPS 3" BUILDING, AND DENY THE ADDITION OF NEW MONUMENT SIGN LOCATIONS ON THE CENTER'S TWO MONUMENT SIGNS, LOCATED AT 831 VIA SUERTE

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]

B. 801 North El Camino Real – Discretionary Sign Permit 14-394 – Rite Aid Sign Program (Wright)

Public Hearing to consider a request for a wall sign larger than 25 square feet within the Architectural Overlay district. The project site is located in the Neighborhood Commercial (NC2) zoning district, Coastal Zone Overlay, and Architectural Overlay (NC2-CZ-A) at 801 North El Camino Real. The site's legal description is Lot 1 of Block 5, Tract 793 and Assessor's Parcel Number 057-155-36.

Christopher Wright, Associate Planner, summarized the staff report.

The applicant for this request was not present.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

During the ensuing discussion the Commissioners, either individually or in agreement, provided the following commentary:

- Established that language in the sign design guidelines needs to be clarified with regard to how sign area should be measured when signs have an irregular shape and the "outer limits" of a sign can be interpreted in multiple ways.
- Suggested revision to ensure the new sign does not exceed 64 square feet total.

- Established that staff has encouraged Rite Aid, the applicant, to revise the existing monument street sign and drive-through canopy sign to match the new font/color/style of the proposed wall sign but such revisions are a “change of copy” that are reviewed separate from this permit process.
- Required the applicant to revise signage to the satisfaction of the City Planner to ensure placement of the new signage will not obstruct the existing diamond tile placement on the store facade.
- Required the applicant to revise the plans to be in scale and accurately show what is being proposed.

IT WAS MOVED BY CHAIR PRO TEM CRANDELL, SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR RUEHLIN, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC-15-027, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING DISCRETIONARY SIGN PERMIT 14-394, RITE AID SIGN, A REQUEST TO ALLOW A WALL SIGN LARGER THAN 25 SQUARE FEET IN THE ARCHITECTURAL OVERLAY DISTRICT ON A SITE LOCATED AT 801 NORTH EL CAMINO REAL

Amended as follows:

Page 4, Condition no. 8, following “will be” insert “no larger than the regulation 64 feet, located to better fit the design of the facade, and”

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]

C. Zoning Amendment 14-456 and General Plan Amendment 15-049
(Wright/Hare) (continued from 06-17-15)

Public Hearing to consider City-initiated amendments to the Centennial General Plan and Zoning Ordinance. The Planning Commission will review the proposed amendments, receive public testimony, and forward a recommendation to the City Council on the adoption of the proposed amendments.

Christopher Wright, Associate Planner, announced that the amendments have been organized into three separate parts to allow Commissioners requiring to recuse themselves from certain amendments to take part in deciding and acting on as many amendments as possible.

Part 1

Chair Brown recused himself from considering Part I of the amendments due to property ownership within 500 feet of affected locations. He left the meeting room at 7:25 p.m. and handed the gavel to Vice Chair Ruehlin.

Christopher Wright, Associate Planner, reviewed the staff report and proposed amendments in Part 1, which includes:

- A Zone change to create the Mixed Use 3.2 (MU3.2) zone per the General Plan
- Revisions and addition of MU3.2 standards in the General Plan and Zoning Ordinance.
- Zone change from Neighborhood Commercial 2 (NC2) to NC3 and increase in Floor Area Ratio from .35 to .75.
- Increase in Floor Area Ratio of NC2 zone from .35 to .5.
- Extension of Architectural Overlay to South El Camino Real and alleys

Vice Chair Ruehlin opened the public hearing.

Bill Hart, former chair of the General Plan Advisory Committee (GPAC) commented that during its review of South El Camino Real, GPAC felt as though the area is currently in blighted condition and suggested a mixed use/increased density approach would stimulate building on the vacant and/or dilapidated building lots and encouraged investment in properties. He encouraged the Commission to keep sight of that goal while considering proposed revisions.

Michael Luna, resident, urged the Commission to organize another workshop on the MU-3.2 issue to help all involved parties understand the ramifications of proposed revisions; discussed development obstacles associated with the proposed guidelines; encouraged the Commission to use more flexible mixed use parking standards instead of the standard parking ratios used for most of the city.

Zachary Gilmer, resident, supported for building size to be limited with height limits rather than a limit on the number of story to give architects and developers flexibility while designing potential units; suggested the City consider granting developers a tax break similar to those allowed on historic homes to stimulate development in the area; asked if chimneys and/or towers will be allowed to extend about the height maximum.

Nick Buchanan, resident, supported a workshop to further discuss the MU 3.2 issue; commented on the difficulties associated with financing urban projects; advised he bought property and began the design process due to development standards in the updated General Plan; encouraged the Commission to stand behind the goals of the GPAC to encourage quality development in the area.

Vice Chair Ruehlin closed the public hearing.

During the ensuing discussion the Commission, either individually or in agreement, provided the following commentary for Part 1:

- Supported suggestion for workshop or additional study session for better understanding of the issues.
- Commented that they are tasked with establishing design guidelines for 2-story frontages with 3-story in the rear mixed use projects.
- Commented that although City Council has provided direction, it is the Planning Commission's role to use their expertise to the table during deliberations and forward a recommendation in which the City Council can agree with or disregard the recommendation. This includes providing understanding/explanation of how structures can effectively be designed/built under the proposed restrictions.
- Commented that attempts to create mixed use projects in the recent past have not been successful.
- Noted that too many restrictions for building may result in no development whatsoever.
- Commented that flexibility in the Zoning Ordinance is key to allowing developers some flexibility in architectural design/massing, resulting in pleasing and complementary design rather than boxed buildings and strict adherence to minimum standards.
- Commented that side access garages should be encouraged but building height should be minimized to the best extent possible and it is not clear whether what the height ceiling should be to support side access garages.
- Suggested that potential view blockages would be reviewed on an individual project basis but cumulative effects are a concern and should be considered.
- Suggested field trips to coastal cities that have examples of successful mixed use projects.
- Elected to table this agenda item to allow staff time to schedule working study session to enable the Commission to better understand the issues. At that meeting, the Commission directed staff to: 1) identify a "baseline" MU3.2 site to get a sense of the average property conditions, 2) provide examples and information on successful mixed use projects, 3) provide information on view corridor analysis methods, 4) and provide ideas for new design guidelines that the Commission could consider and recommend in conjunction with new development standards for the MU3.2 area. The Commission could recommend that such design guidelines be incorporated when the design guidelines are updated.

Jim Pechous, City Planner, agreed to provide minutes from the GPAC meetings pertaining to the South El Camino Real zoning discussion to the Commissioners for their consideration.

Associate Planner Wright agreed to provide contour maps for the MU 3.2 areas for the working study session.

IT WAS MOVED BY CHAIR PRO TEM CRANDELL, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER SMITH AND CARRIED 6-0-1, WITH CHAIR BROWN ABSTAINING, TO TABLE PART ONE GENERAL PLAN AND ZONING AMENDMENTS.

[AGENDA ITEM TABLED.]

Chair Brown returned to the meeting room at 10:15 p.m. and resumed control of the meeting.

Part 2

Part 2 includes zoning amendments only. The changes rename the Neighborhood Commercial 2 (NC2) zone as NC1.2 and rezone a portion of parcels from RL to NC1.3.

Commissioner Wu recused himself from considering Part 2 of the amendments due to property ownership within 500 feet of affected locations. He left the meeting room at 10:20 p.m.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

It was moved by Vice Chair Ruehlin, seconded by Commissioner Eggleston and carried 6-0-1, with Commissioner Wu abstaining, to take a straw vote to indicate approval of the Zoning Amendments in Part 2.

Commissioner Wu returned to the meeting room at 10:30 p.m.

Part 3

Part 3 amendments includes items other than those discussed in Parts 1 and 2.

Chair Brown opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

It was moved by Vice Chair Ruehlin, seconded by Commissioner Eggleston and unanimously carried to take a straw vote to indicate approval of the General Plan and Zoning Amendments in Part 3.

9. **NEW BUSINESS** - None

10. **OLD BUSINESS** - None

11. **REPORTS OF COMMISSIONERS/STAFF**

- A. Tentative Future Agenda
- B. Minutes from the Zoning Administrator meeting of June 17, 2015
- C. Staff Waiver 15-196, 167 Avenida Del Mar
- D. Staff Waiver 15-208, 204 W. Paseo De Cristobal

Chair Brown reported that at its meeting on Thursday, July 9, 2015, the Coastal Advisory Committee will hear a presentation from Lawrence Honma on sand replenishment.

Commissioner Eggleston announced he will not be present at the Commission's first meeting in August.


12. **ADJOURNMENT**

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR RUEHLIN, SECONDED BY CHAIR PRO TEM CRANDELL, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED to adjourn at 10:44 p.m. to an Adjourned Regular Meeting to be held at 6:00 p.m. on July 22, 2015 in Council Chambers at City Hall located at 100 Avenida Presidio, San Clemente, CA.

Respectfully submitted,

Donald Brown, Chair

Attest:



Jim Pechous, City Planner