

**CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE
MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
DESIGN REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE
DECEMBER 10, 2014**

Subcommittee Members Present: Julia Darden and Jim Ruehlin

Staff Present: Jim Pechous, Sean Nicholas, Amber Gregg and Cliff Jones

1. MINUTES

Minutes from November 12, 2014

2. ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW OF THE FOLLOWING ITEM

A. San Clemente Sports Hall of Fame Tile Mural Review (Nicholas)

A request to review the tile murals for the previously approved San Clemente Sports Hall of Fame tile display at the San Clemente Aquatic Center.

Associate Planner Sean Nicholas summarized the staff report. Staff indicated support of the design as presented as it provided color to the white building and is consistent with the design of the original concept murals presented at the time the whole program was approved.

Subcommittee Member Darden asked why Katherine Stovall-Dennis, the artist, chose this design rather than murals more in the design vein of the entry murals she did for the Aquatic Center.

John Dorey, Friends of the Beaches, Parks, and Recreation Foundation, stated that she was trying to put them in silhouette in order to represent all races and sexes. The goal was to inspire young people who see the hall of fame, and these images, and see themselves in accomplishing these goals. Finding a way to do that and provide that universality is difficult. He also indicated that the color was meant to break up the silhouettes and make it stand out and consistent with the colors found on the pool deck.

Aeryn Donnelly, Park Planner, also indicated that she had talked to Katherine earlier today and the artist indicated she wanted the murals to stand on their own and not be a continuation of the murals at the front. She also stated the artist wanted the murals to be playful and colorful as they are for children. Having the color will really stand out from the white of the building and the white of the hall of fame tiles.

Subcommittee Member Darden asked about other mural opportunities in the park.

Neither Planner Nicholas or Pam Passow, Beaches, Parks, and Recreation Manager, knew of any other opportunities at this time in the park.

Subcommittee Member Darden asked what is staff's position regarding the need to have the murals be compatible with the architecture. Member Darden stated that Katherine has set the bar very high as she did such an amazing job on the front murals it is hard to compare, but this design is very different from those murals.

Planner Nicholas stated that staff has reviewed the murals and is supportive of them. It is not uncommon that Spanish Colonial Revival buildings have color added to them through the use of art such as Spanish tiles or tile murals as proposed. From that perspective, staff is supportive of the designs. Planner Nicholas clarified that this is not within an Architectural Overlay but Spanish Colonial Revival architecture is required of new park buildings. Planner Nicholas also indicated that the murals will not be visible from the parking lot.

Park Planner Donnelly stated that Katherine has indicated a willingness to modify the artistic style if DRSC requested it.

Subcommittee Member Darden said that she is weighing this so carefully because the Aquatic Center is one of the nicest City facilities we have and wants to make sure the mural is complimentary and adds to the facility. She stated that she has concern that the feel of the murals is too contemporary for the facility. She stated she understood the perspective of the artist, and the inspiration she drew from the elements at the aquatic center. Though she felt being on the building, and the context of where it will be viewed, it seems too contemporary.

Subcommittee Member Ruehlin stated that regularly now DRSC is reviewing art, which is a good thing that art is coming into the community, but it highlights the need for guidelines. He stated that at times this is difficult because it is subjective. Member Ruehlin stated that he understands the direction Katherine was going, but agrees with Subcommittee Member Darden that the design is a bit contemporary and has some compatibility concerns.

John Dorey recommended continuing the item and allow for some time for the artist to arrive at the meeting.

DRSC agreed and continued the item until later in the meeting.

DRSC then re-opened the discussion once Katherine Stovall-Dennis, the artist, arrived.

Planner Nicholas gave a summary of the discussion and expressed the general concern of the DRSC.

Katherine Stovall-Dennis thanks the DRSC for their review and perspective, and complimented them on the job they do. She commented that she was once on this committee and knows how difficult the job is. Ms. Stovall-Dennis then gave a description of her process and how she came to the designs that have been presented. She acknowledged the need to perhaps tie more into the front murals and some of those components in terms of the border and palm tree components. She also suggested that she could use different colors if that is a concern.

DRSC agreed that they did not want to dictate the design and would rather Katherine be creative. They both agreed bringing in elements of the front murals will be helpful. Overall, they expressed again that the design feels too contemporary and anything she can do to bring the design of the front murals to these murals to improve compatibility with the building would be better.

Ms. Stovall-Dennis indicated that she understood the concern of the DRSC and has some ideas on how to address the issues.

Beaches, Parks, and Recreation staff and the Foundation indicated a desire to get the murals installed in time for the next hall of fame event.

In order to assist Beaches, Parks, and Recreation and the Foundation, DRSC recommended that revisions come through staff and updates sent to DRSC to ensure the design is compatible with the building.

Staff understood the direction and indicated they will provide updates to DRSC.

B. Amendment to Site Plan Permit 97-16/Amendment to Conditional Use Permit 07-245/Amendment to Minor Exception Permit 07-288, Ocean Club Amendment – Marblehead Coastal Residential Community Facility (Nicholas)

A request to consider revised architecture and site plan for the previously approved Ocean Club private community center for Marblehead Coastal residents located on four lots within the Marblehead Coastal Specific Plan PA-1.

Associate Planner Sean Nicholas summarized the staff report. Planner Nicholas indicated that the applicant was supportive of all of staff's comments, but wanted to discuss the tower element. Planner Nicholas stated that the mantra staff has followed when reviewing projects in Marblehead Coastal is "less than or equal too in height." The applicant is proposing a tower element which exceeds the height or the originally approved Ocean Club project.

Chris Barlow, the architect, stated that a taller tower element is common for a focal point building/community center such as what is proposed by the applicant. It provides a nice detail focal point for the development with an emphasis that is common in Spanish architecture.

Don McDougall, also stated that the original design of PA 1, where the Ocean Club is located, had a three story element that was only one foot shorter than the tower. With the revised architecture and approval of the Ocean Club height, there will only be one building at that height rather than 30.

Subcommittee Members Darden and Ruehlin commented that they did not want to get into a policy discussion regarding the height issue. Though they both agreed that the architecture of the Ocean Club design is better with the tower feature. While they felt the design of the facility was better with a tower, both agreed that the design of the tower needed additional features or components to be successful and appropriate for the development. DRSC requested the applicant to continue to work with staff to enhance the overall design, and bring the height of the tower down one foot to match the City Council approved heights of the previously approved architecture of PA-1.

The applicant agreed to reduce the height and work with staff on the design prior to moving forward.

C. **Conditional Use Permit 14-389/Architectural Permit 14-478,**
Capistrano Shores New Electrical Transformers and Fencing (Gregg)

A request to demolish the existing transformers and locate new transformers and fencing in a portion of leased railroad right-of-way. The project is located at 1880 N. El Camino Real and is in the Privately Owned Shoreline zoning district and the Coastal Zone Overlay (OS2-S2-CZ.)

Associate Planner Amber Gregg summarized the staff report and informed the Subcommittee that an application for a block wall had been submitted that week that is planned to take the place of the chain link fencing. Ms. Gregg noted that although the applicant has stated the fencing would be temporary, the application does not identify it as such.

Subcommittee Member Darden noted that it was clear that the proposed project is not an appropriate permanent solution.

Subcommittee Member Ruehlin agrees that the temporary solution is not appropriate. A temporary solution would have to be crystal clear to replace the proposed fence with something definitive.

Subcommittee Member Darden stated a Spanish Colonial Revival wall with smooth white stucco, landscaping, architectural features and or visual interest would be appropriate on the permanent wall.

Subcommittee Member Ruehlin concurred with Darden's comments but recognizes that the wall is not before us for review today, only the transformers and pop-out fencing. He stated the only way he can support the chain link fence is with a definitive timeline. He does not see that guarantee at this time.

The applicant, Eric Anderson, asked what was the difference between 1959 General Plan and today's?

Subcommittee Member Darden explained that the City has evolved since 1959 as reflected in the previous and exiting General Plan. Subcommittee Member Ruehlin stated that Gateways are very important and the wall is very visible and very important to the community.

Darden and Ruehlin concurred that they are not supportive of the fence.

The Subcommittee Members did discuss possible design elements the applicant may want to consider when designing the future wall. Subcommittee Member Ruehlin noted the wall should be smooth white stucco with a hand trowel Santa Barbara finish with decorative elements, and directed the applicants to review the architectural style on the soon to be remodeled Estrella Shopping Center. He also suggested utilizing arches to break up the monotony and that it is in a pedestrian area and will need to be pedestrian oriented.

Subcommittee Member Darden stated vines will be very important on that wall. She also noted that the Spanish Colonial Revival style is not only elegant in its simplicity but is typically less expensive to construct.

The Applicant Eric Wills, asked the Subcommittee what they thought about a poured in place wall with decorative murals like Cal-Trans has utilized. The Subcommittee Members concurred that they did not believe that application was consistent with City Design Guidelines.

Mr. Wills noted that they appreciated the Subcommittee's comments but they were planning on moving forward as is to the Planning Commission.

D. Minor Cultural Heritage Permit 14-480, Selma's Patio Doors (Jones)

A request to install patio doors within the commercial building at 218 Avenida Del Mar. The project is located within the Mixed Use Zoning District and within the Architectural and Central Business Overlays (MU3-CB-A).

Associate Planner Cliff Jones summarized the staff report and presented the proposed wood clad aluminum sliding glass door system.

The Subcommittee agreed that the wood clad aluminum sliding glass door system meets the requirements of the Architectural Overlay and expressed support for the door system. The Subcommittee noted that the expense to add mullions to the door system, to provide a more traditional look, was not necessary because most of the time the doors would be slid to one side and the public would not be able to see that feature. The Subcommittee felt that the sliding door system would add to the pedestrian experience along Avenida Del Mar.

The Subcommittee recommended that the project move forward to the Zoning Administrator for consideration.

3. NEW BUSINESS

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

A. Conditional Use Permit 14-228/Minor Cultural Heritage Permit 14-229, Fig @ 313 (Jones)

A request to consider allowing minor exterior changes to a historic building to accommodate a restaurant use, a full range of alcohol for on-site consumption, and a shared off-site parking agreement. The historic building is located at 313 North El Camino Real within the Mixed Use Zoning District and within the Architectural and Central Business Overlays (MU3-CB-A).

Associate Planner Cliff Jones summarized the staff report. Mr. Jones indicated that since the previous DRSC review, the applicant now proposes to demolish the spiral staircase and construct a wood staircase to provide restaurant patron access from the rear of the property.

Subcommittee Member Darden clarified that the spiral stair case to be demolished was not an original historic feature. Mr. Jones indicated that was correct.

The Subcommittee agreed that the proposed wood stair case would compliment the historic buildings architecture and expressed support for the design of the project.

The Subcommittee recommended that the project move forward to the Planning Commission for consideration.

5. ADJOURNMENT

Adjourn to the Regular Meeting of the Design Review Subcommittee to be held January 14, 2015 at 2:00 p.m. in Conference Room A, Community Development Department, 910 Calle Negocio, Suite 100, San Clemente, CA 92673.

Respectfully submitted,

Julia Darden, Vice Chair

Attest:

Cliff Jones, Associate Planner

DRAFT