



Approvals:
City Manager PLG
Dept. Head [Signature]
Attorney JAG
Finance [Signature]

AGENDA REPORT

SAN CLEMENTE CITY COUNCIL MEETING
Meeting Date: October 1, 2013

Department: Beaches, Parks & Recreation
Prepared By: Sharon Heider, Beaches Parks & Recreation Director

Subject: *PROPOSED TRIBUTE PROGRAM.*

Fiscal Impact: To be determined. The Program would be designed to be self-funding, however the City may need to front construction and/or design costs.

Summary: The City has had a practice of accepting donations of benches with personalized messages. Most of the preferred locations are now taken, but there continues to be desire from the community. Upon review of current practices, staff has determined that the approach does not cover the full costs of placing and maintaining a bench, and does not provide consistency. Staff has deferred the acceptance of any additional benches until the City Council can; 1) Provide direction as to the desire to host a Memorial or Tribute Program; and if so, then 2) what type of public amenities should be available for private messages.

Staff and the Beaches, Parks & Recreation Commission recommend that the City Council approve the development of a Tribute Program, and direct the Beaches, Parks & Recreation Commission to create a subcommittee comprised of staff and members of the public to further develop the program details and return to the City Council for approval at a future date.

Background: For the past few decades, members of the public have approached the City with requests to place commemorative, memorial, or tribute items in specific locations throughout the City. Requests have been accommodated when possible with the direct costs paid by the donor. This program proved very popular, and created an unanticipated and growing demand on public space and staff time. It became clear that this program needed to be evaluated as a whole and a more formal program developed if it were to continue. The program has been on hold pending development. The Beaches, Parks & Recreation Commission considered this item at its regular meeting on September 10, 2013. The Commission conceptually approved a Tribute Program, but expressed interest in forming a subcommittee and developing the program further prior to implementation.

Current Program:
Indirect Costs- While the donor carries the direct costs associated with the acquisition of tribute items, there are many indirect costs including staff time to coordinate creation and installation, regular cleaning, graffiti removal, inspection, repainting, and repair of damage. A bench for instance has an average 10-15 year lifespan, and the indirect costs can be considerable.

Demands for Ocean Views- The City has need for benches, picnic tables, and trees in locations throughout the City, however, donors most often want a space near the ocean with a view. The City's ocean-view land is extremely scarce and valuable, and placement of additional benches or other amenities needs to be thoughtfully considered to balance the needs of the public with donor's wishes.

Inconsistency in Design- The current program has not dictated a specific pattern for customization, which has created a cluttered appearance with mismatched public amenities, and over-customization of items.

Inefficient Processing - Without an approved program in place, staff's attempts to accommodate tribute items has typically involved working with multiple members of a grieving family with desires for site visits, customization changes, and specific dates of installation.

Public Perception- Staff has received complaints that memorial/tribute items make the City look like a cemetery, and some do not feel this is an appropriate role for public space. The San Clemente Municipal Golf Course had a similar program of installing custom benches at tee boxes on the course. The Golf Committee halted the program several years ago after complaints were received that the golf course was looking like a cemetery.

Replacement- The current program states that if the item is damaged, it can be replaced at the donor's expense. This does not create a clear expectation of the lifespan of an item, and may lead donors to feel the initial donation guarantees control of the location in perpetuity.

Discussion:

Should the City Provide Private Tribute Opportunities on Public Lands:

The ability to name public amenities is a practice some communities embrace and other preclude. Staff has surveyed other communities and found a range of programs. City of Aliso Viejo has defined a park specifically for planting trees to honor the loss of a child, Dana Point on the other end of the spectrum does not allow tributes or commemorations on public property. The City of San Clemente should first decide if the practice of allowing private naming of a public amenity is appropriate for this community.

Some would argue it is a way of honoring community members. It should be noted that the Wall of Recognition was created for that purpose, however, it is very selective. Others have argued that the public space should not be used for private purpose, or that it creates an impression of a cemetery. In preparing this report, staff has used the term, "Tribute" in lieu of, "Memorial" to allow for a greater audience that may wish to honor those living, or celebrate achievements or milestones. Staff is first seeking direction from the City Council as to its desire to host a Tribute program.

Proposed Program Amenities:

Should the City wish to provide naming opportunities, staff provides a proposed program that would provide public benefit for the privatization of public amenities. In

9A-2

this exploration, staff has developed several guiding principles for the approval of a tribute item.

1. The item provides needed public benefit to the community at large.
2. The program is self funded including indirect costs and staff time.
3. The item enhances a public space, and does not change the intended use of the space.
4. The program has clearly identified timelines and responsibilities for both the donor and the City.

Staff has compiled several options for tribute opportunities that may achieve the program goals, along with a guideline for a timeline, and projected costs. The program will allow for staff to identify and publicize areas where items are needed and can be donated. Staff will maintain a central location on the City website where a donor can select an item, location, and complete an application.

Tribute Item	Lifespan	Donor Cost	Public Benefit
Bench	10-15 yrs	\$5,000	Replacement of Aging Equipment
Picnic Table	10-15 yrs	\$5,000	Replacement of Aging Equipment
Stair Riser	10 years	TBD	Wayfinding, Beautification, May deter graffiti
Custom Tile	10 years	TBD	Beautification
Tree	TBD	\$500	Beautification

Recommended

Action:

STAFF AND THE BEACHES, PARKS & RECREATION COMMISSION RECOMMENDS THAT the City Council 1) approve the creation of a Tribute Program for the naming of public amenities, and 2) direct the Beaches, Parks & Recreation Commission to work with staff and the public to further develop the program details and tribute opportunities.

Attachments: Proposed Tribute Program

Notification: Interested parties



Proposed TRIBUTE PROGRAM

Naming Opportunities for Public Amenities

October 1, 2013

STAFF DESIGN TEAM:

AERYN DONNELLY, SAM PENROD, CHERYL O'MARA, DENNIS REED,
MAILE STIVERS, SHARON HEIDER

Existing Memorial Bench Program Issues:



- No formal program or consistent designs
- City is not recouping full cost
- Locations requested are:
 - not where needed
 - difficult to access for installation
 - not in the City's ownership (Beach Trail and Beach Access Points)
- No strategy to deal with vandalism, replacement, or tenure for location

9A-4

Issues to be Addressed with New Program



- Public Benefit / Aesthetics– provides needed amenity, reduces vandalism, beautifies
- Indirect Costs – Full cost recovery including installation and maintenance
- Demands for Beach/Ocean Locations - balance with actual need/space
- Public Perception- Some do not believe public space should be used for memorials, as it makes them feel they are in mausoleum or cemetery

3

Issues Continued



- Design Consistency – provide a design for all amenities.
- Lifespan – Define clear expectations for life of amenity, cases of vandalism or breakage, and allow for others to have opportunities in future.
- Streamline Process – Provide a program that is easy to access lists location and amenities available and ability to select .

4

9A-5

Pier Bowl Ocean View Amenities Benches & Picnic Tables - \$5,000

No bench sites available.

7 picnic tables available
immediately at Parque
Del Mar.

Public Benefit:
Replacement of aging
Equipment

Text Options:
Plaque at one end of table
Text along side of bench



5

Beach Access Stair Risers Donation - TBD

Potentially hundreds of
ocean view opportunities.
T-Street may be an
Opportunity for immediate
implementation.
4 total sites

Public Benefit:
Wayfinding,
Beautification,
May deter graffiti



6

9A-6

Beach Trail and Beach Access points

Many requests to place benches along the Beach Trail and Access points have been received. However, the Beach Trail design is a result of many years of public design input which has resulted in a community accepted Master Plan. Throughout the master planning process, a consensus of, "Less is More" was heard.

In addition, much of the land that appears available is not owned by the City. Given the community preferences, no additional amenities are proposed at this time.



7

Trail Amenities Picnic Tables, Benches & Signage

Few opportunities available that have views and are in need of replacement.

Public Benefit:
Wayfinding, Replacement of inconsistent/aging equipment



8

QA-7

Wave Tile Mural – Pier Bowl Tunnel

Sea Life Ceramic Tiles – TBD (Three cost levels)

Creates opportunities in desirable pier area.

Public Benefit:
Beautification,
Graffiti prevention



9

Urban Forestation

Donation \$500

Parks and trails in need of trees will be identified by staff, and trees of a species in keeping with the approved planting plan will be installed in needed locations.

Centralized location for signage in parks or trails will alleviate the maintenance challenge if a tree requires removal or replacement.



10

QA-8

Vista Hermosa Park Amenities

Available through the
Friends of
San Clemente
Beaches, Parks &
Recreation Foundation



11

Proposed Program

The proposed program would seek to create tribute opportunities that have a benefit to the public at large, and a streamlined process with clear guidelines for better informed donors and more efficient processing.

Items donated would have a life of 15 years. At the end of 15 years the donor would have the opportunity to repurchase the space or allow another tribute to have the location. If damaged or vandalized, donor may elect to replace the item at their cost.

Available amenities will be posted online, and a standard application will be created to assist donors with their customization choices. The donated item will be installed within six months of receipt of application and funds.

12

9A-9