




Memorandum Planning

March 20, 2013

To: Planning Commission
From: Cliff Jones, Associate Planner 
Subject: Review of Window Materials Policy
Copies: Jim Pechous, City Planner

The purpose of this memo is to receive direction on proposed revisions to the Planning Commission policy related to window materials in the Architectural and Pedestrian Overlay for non-historic properties.

On November 8, 2012, the City Council requested the Planning Commission window materials policy (Policy), Attachment 1, be revised to allow windows with factory finishes within the Architectural and Pedestrian Overlays (Overlays). Generally speaking, the Policy does not allow fiberglass or aluminum clad windows on Spanish (non-historic buildings) or on the ground floor of buildings in sensitive areas of the Downtown core and Pier Bowl.

Staff proposes the Policy be amended to allow quality fiberglass and aluminum windows with a manufactured paint application (factory finish) on non-historic buildings in the Overlays, subject to discretion of the City Planner.

DRSC received presentations on fiberglass and aluminum windows from Milgard at their November 28, 2012 meeting and from Anderson at their February 27, 2012 meeting. Milgard and Anderson representatives showed examples of fiberglass and aluminum clad wood windows that design and look is consistent in character with Spanish Colonial Revival architecture (see attached examples). DRSC members expressed support to allow manufactured paint application (factory finish) on all non-historic buildings in the Architectural and Pedestrian Overlays at their February 27, 2012 meeting.

Table 1 below provides a summary of the proposed Policy amendment with changes highlighted in yellow.

**Table 1: Window Material Policy
Architectural Overlay – Non-Historic Buildings**

	Commercial Central Business District	Commercial Outside Central Business District	Residential Central Business District	Residential Outside Central Business District
Wood	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Steel (Iron)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Fiberglass (factory finish)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Aluminum (factory finish)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Vinyl	No	No	No – Ground Floor Yes – 2nd Story/Non-Visible	Yes

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission revise the Policy consistent with staff recommendation as reflected in Table 1 above.

Attachments:

1. Planning Commission directed policy for window replacement within the Architectural and/or Pedestrian Overlays districts
2. November 8, 2012 City Council minutes (excerpted)
3. DRAFT February 27, 2012 Meeting minutes (excerpted)
4. Examples of Fiberglass and Aluminum Windows



Memorandum Planning

November 8, 2011

To: Planning Staff
From: Jim Pechous, City Planner
Subject: Design Guidelines Interpretation - Window Materials in the
Architectural and Pedestrian Overlay
Copies: Planning Commission

SUMMARY

To enhance and maintain the sense of historical character within the Architectural (A) and Pedestrian (P) Overlay districts, the following interpretation of the City's Design Guidelines related to acceptable window materials for non historic properties has been established:

∂ WINDOWS IN THE ARCHITECTURAL (A) OVERLAY AND PEDESTRIAN (P) OVERLAY

- Exterior modifications to structures, including windows, located within the overlay are subject to a Minor Cultural Heritage Permit (MCHP); staff waivers may be requested and shall be reviewed as described in Section 17.16.110 of the Municipal Code.
- Sensitive areas, including but not limited to, Avenida Del Mar, El Camino Real, and the MU4 zones within the Pier Bowl Specific Plan, shall have wood framed windows on the ground floor and/or pedestrian level of a structure.

Exceptions may be allowed for the use of non-wood framed windows within the Architectural Overlay in the following cases:

- Alternative paintable materials such as aluminum and fiberglass may be considered on non-Spanish buildings provided they are painted on site (no factory painted finish), have a similar look as wood and are approved in accordance with the MCHP or staff waiver process described above.

- Windows located on the second story or higher and/or not visible from the public right-of-way may be steel or aluminum framed windows provided they are approved in accordance with the MCHP or staff waiver process described above.
- Residential properties not within sensitive areas may use aluminum, vinyl, fiberglass, or wood framed windows when replacing existing windows at the discretion of the City Planner provided they are approved in accordance with the MCHP or staff waiver process described above.

∂ DESIGN STANDARDS

- Windows shall be true divided lite.
- Design shall be traditional in style.
- The window surround, or flange, shall be constructed and may not be a plant on detail.
- Plant-on mullions are not permitted.

The interpretation was originally established in Planning Commission Study Sessions on August 16, 2006, September 6, 2006, and October 4, 2006.

Modifications to the interpretation to allow aluminum windows were discussed during a Planning Commission Study Sessions of May 18, 2011 and was revised at the November 2, 2011 Planning Commission Study Session.

O. Contract Award - Via Alegre Storm Drain Rehabilitation

MOTION BY MAYOR PRO TEM BROWN, SECOND BY COUNCILMEMBER DAHL, CARRIED 4-0, to:

1. Approve the plans and specifications for the Via Alegre Storm Drain Rehabilitation, Project No. 23002.
2. Approve, and authorize the Mayor to execute, Contract C12-49, by and between the City of San Clemente and Sancon Engineering, Inc., providing for the rehabilitation of the Via Alegre Storm Drain, Project No. 23002, in the amount of \$29,900.

ITEMS REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR FOR DISCUSSION**B(2). Design Review Subcommittee Meeting Minutes of September 12, 2012, September 26, 2012 and October 10, 2012**

Following discussion, Council directed the City Planner to take a report to the Planning Commission relative to its interpretation of historic property window material selection.

MOTION BY COUNCILMEMBER BAKER, SECOND BY COUNCILMEMBER DAHL, CARRIED 4-0, to receive and file the Design Review Subcommittee Meeting minutes of September 12, 2012, September 26, 2012 and October 10, 2012.

D. Communications Site Lease Agreements - New Crown Castle NG West, Inc. (South El Camino Real at West Avenida Cadiz and North El Camino Real at Boca De La Playa)

MOTION BY COUNCILMEMBER DAHL, SECOND BY COUNCILMEMBER BAKER, CARRIED 4-0, to delete this item from the agenda at the request of Staff.

Associated with signage, the following were the DRSC discussion points on staff's recommendations:

- 1) The applicant agreed to modify the monument sign to be consistent with the design of the building. DRSC concurred with the recommendation.
- 2) The applicant clarified that they are proposing to utilize individual metal letter signs, pin-mounted and halo lit. DRSC agreed with the sign type.
- 3) The applicant agreed to remove the signage on the back of the carwash, and to modify the front carwash signage to hand painted with decorative goose neck lighting. DRSC liked the change and thanked the applicant for modifying the design.
- 4) The applicant is still requesting to maintain the pole sign. DRSC commented that this issue will be addressed at Planning Commission and potentially, at City Council.

DRSC had no other comments, complimented the applicant on the improvements and modifications they had made to the building, and recommended the project move forward to Planning Commission. The applicant thanked DRSC for its comments and time.

F. Anderson Windows Product Demonstration (Jones)

A presentation by Mark R. Sabre from Anderson Corporation.

Mark Sabre presented two Anderson window products for DRSC consideration, aluminum and fiberglass clad wood windows, which he felt would work within the City's historical Architectural Overlay. Mr. Sabre indicated that Anderson no longer manufactures an all wood window because customers prefer the lower maintenance alternatives, which look like painted wood windows, that their company provides such as aluminum and fiberglass clad wood windows. The difference between the aluminum and fiberglass clad wood windows are summarized below:

Fiberglass clad wood window:

- Comes in 11 colors. No custom color options.
- Color protruded into fiberglass.
- Factory finish is paintable.
- No coastal exclusions that would void warranty along the coast.

Aluminum clad wood window:

- Comes in 60 colors. Custom colors available.
- Color not protruded but rather electrostatically applied.
- Factory finish is not recommended to be painted.
- Coastal exclusions could void warranty along the coast.

The DRSC thanked Mr. Sabre for presenting the aluminum and fiberglass wood window products and indicated perhaps the products can be considered within the Architectural Overlays on non-historic buildings.

The City Planner Jim Pechous made the observation that the quality of window being manufactured in aluminum and fiberglass has greatly improved since the 1980's. When the Design Guidelines were written aluminum windows were prohibited because they did not look anything like a wood window. With the improvement in window design in recent years the window material less of an issue and the new focus should be on the quality and design of the windows.

G. Window Materials in the Architectural and Pedestrian Overlay (Jones)

City staff requests DRSC input on the Planning Commission policy related to window materials in the Architectural and Pedestrian Overlay for non-historic properties.

Associate Planner Jones summarized the staff report. Mr. Jones indicated that the City Council has directed staff to allow windows with factory finishes within the Architectural Overlays. DRSC input related to the Planning Commission window material policy will be forwarded to the Planning Commission for their consideration on the Policy amendment.

DRSC members expressed that when allowing alternative window materials such as, high quality fiberglass and aluminum clad wood, manufactured paint application (factory finish) is acceptable.

3. ORAL AND WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS - None

4. ADJOURNMENT

Adjourn to the Design Review Subcommittee meeting of March 13, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. in Conference Room A, Community Development Department, 910 Calle Negocio, Suite 100, San Clemente, CA 92673.

Respectfully submitted,

Michael Kaupp, Chair

Attest:

Cliff Jones

Examples of Fiberglass and Aluminum Windows

SPANISH COLONIAL



CASEMENT WINDOW

- Brick mould exterior trim: Dove Gray
- Frame exterior: Forest Green
- Sash exterior: Forest Green
- Specified equal light grille pattern

