

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE
PLANNING COMMISSION
May 21, 2014 @ 7:00 p.m.
City Council Chambers
100 Avenida Presidio
San Clemente, CA**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Darden called the Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission of the City of San Clemente to order at 7:04 p.m.

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Commissioner Ward led the Pledge of Allegiance.

3. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Wayne Eggleston, Michael Kaupp, Jim Ruehlin, and Kathleen Ward; Chair pro tem Barton Crandell, Vice Chair Donald Brown and Chair Julia Darden

Commissioners Absent: None

Staff Present: Jim Pechous, City Planner
Amber Gregg, Associate Planner
John Ciampa, Associate Planner
Adam Atamian, Assistant Planner
Zachary Ponsen, Senior Civil Engineer
Ken Knatz, Associate Civil Engineer
Eileen White, Recording Secretary

4. SPECIAL ORDERS OF BUSINESS - None

5. MINUTES

A. Minutes from the Planning Commission Regular Meeting of May 7, 2014

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR BROWN, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED to receive and file the minutes of the Regular Meeting of May 7, 2014, with the following revisions:

Page 8, insert after the second paragraph, "Commissioner Ward asked Deputy Bull, 'Did you encounter people that were homeless that you deemed to be new to our town that told you that they were here because of IHope services? Did you ever encounter that, (and how often)?' Deputy Bull responded, 'Yes, when IHope came to town, we did see an influx. I don't have those hard numbers, but in polling my fellow deputies and being approached by them, they told me there is a new one in town, here is his name, date of birth, and he states he was from another location outside the city and he got word of IHope and he wanted to utilize these services that they offered. I've come in contact personally with people who came to our city specifically because they heard of IHope and were also utilizing their address to receive mail.'"

Page 12, 4th paragraph, 3rd sentence, insert, "purchase" between "site" and "costs"

Page 12, last paragraph, add to the end of the 1st sentence, "which states that our number one priority is the 'health and safety of this community' which is my guiding principal."

Page 14, 2nd paragraph, 6th sentence, after "bring this idea to Council" insert "for further discussion and public input"

6. **ORAL AND WRITTEN COMMUNICATION - None**
7. **CONSENT CALENDAR - None**
8. **PUBLIC HEARING**

- A. **415 Avenida Granada – Minor Cultural Heritage Permit 14-114 – Courtyard Lawn Replacement at the Casa Romantica** (Ciampa)
(continued from 04-16-14)

A request to consider modifying the courtyard lawn of the historic property to artificial turf. The subject site is located within the Pier Bowl Specific Plan and is zoned Mixed Use (MU4.3-P-A) at 415 Avenida Granada. The legal description is Lot 27, Block 3, of Tract 784, and Assessor's Parcel Number 692-012-38.

John Ciampa, Associate Planner, announced that the applicant for this project has withdrawn the application.

APPLICATION WITHDRAWN – NO ACTION NECESSARY

- B. **2401.5 Avenida Del Presidente – Amendment to Conditional Use Permit 94-028 – AT&T Right-of-Way** (Ciampa)

A request to consider the installation of new antennas and equipment for an existing AT&T cellular site. The project site is located in the City right-of-way located at 2401.5 Avenida Del Presidente and is to the north of the intersection of Avenida Del Presidente and West Avenida Magdalena.

John Ciampa, Associate Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "AT&T Right of Way, AM CUP 94-028, dated May 21, 2014," including photos and description of the existing site as well as site plans and renderings of the new equipment. Staff recommended approval of the request as conditioned.

In response to questions from the Commissioners, Associate Planner Ciampa advised that this facility is temporary for AT&T and will expire in 2017. At that time, he anticipates AT&T will relocate elsewhere for improved coverage. With regard to potential for increased stealthing of the utility boxes, he noted there is no room for additional screening, and staff is not recommending additional screening be required; advised staff has included condition of approval to require increased maintenance of landscaping; agreed to add to Condition no. 10 to reflect applicant's agreement to refresh the existing painted surfaces.

Michael Mitchell, representing AT&T, advised that the phone carrier has serious issues with this site as it currently features no LTE coverage, slow service, and many dropped calls. He agreed with conditions of approval requiring cosmetic improvements such as new paint and manicured landscaping. With regard to potential to add some sort of structure around the existing utility boxes, he noted that not only is there no room, but additional enclosure will interfere with technician access and equipment ventilation. Although this proposal will substantially improve service, it is only a temporary solution until the lease for the site expires. At that time, the antennas and equipment will move to a new site that will provide excellent service. The new site will be located on the roof of a tall building and comply with all new standards. On a coverage map, he indicated existing and proposed coverage; noted this site is for AT&T use only; discussed issues associated with potential use of drones in the future; discussed general coverage issues related to this area of town.

Chair Darden opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER KAUPP, SECONDED BY CHAIR PRO TEM CRANDELL AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 14-015, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING AN AMENDMENT TO CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT (AM CUP) 94-028, ALLOWING THE INSTALLATION OF NEW ANTENNAS AND EQUIPMENT FOR AN EXISTING AT&T CELLULAR SITE AT 2401 ½ AVENIDA DEL PRESIDENTE, with the following revisions:

Page 6, condition no. 10, replace "antenna and the conduit" with "antenna, conduit, and utility boxes"

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]

C. 122 Avenida Cabrillo – Cultural Heritage Permit 14-034 – Ritzau Addition (Jones)

A request to consider a 409 square foot addition to an existing commercial building located at 122 Avenida Cabrillo within the Mixed Use zone and Architectural Overlay (MU3.1-A). The legal description of the property is Lot 30, Block 4 of Tract 779, Assessor's Parcel Number 058-073-30.

Commissioner Kaupp recused himself from considering this item due to nearby property ownership and left the meeting room.

Jim Pechous, City Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Cultural Heritage Permit 14-034, Ritzau Addition, dated May 21, 2014," including location map, project description, photo of existing site, and proposed front elevation. Staff recommended approval as conditioned.

In response to questions, City Planner Pechous noted staff will work with the applicant to ensure the lighting proposed meets the City's dark skies requirements.

Cory Ritzau, applicant, indicated proposed improvements on the site plans; described landscaping improvements; noted improvements will allow additional dental chairs to be installed as well as provide outdoor amenities for the dental office staff. He stated that a revised landscaping plan will be submitted for staff review later this week.

Chair Darden opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR BROWN, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, AND CARRIED 6-0-1, WITH COMMISSIONER KAUPP ABSTAINING, TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 14-013 A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING CULTURAL HERITAGE PERMIT 140-034, RITZAU ADDITION, A REQUEST TO CONSIDER A 409 SQUARE FOOT ADDITION TO A COMMERCIAL BUILDING LOCATED AT 122 AVENIDA CABRILLO.

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]

Commissioner Kaupp returned to the meeting room.

D. Capital Improvement Program General Plan Consistency Finding (Atamian)

A request for review of projects for the Fiscal Year 2014-15 Capital Improvement Program for consistency with the San Clemente General Plan.

Adam Atamian, Assistant Planner, reviewed the staff report, and recommended that the Commission find the projects for the Fiscal Year 2014-2015 Capital Improvement Program consistent with the San Clemente General Plan.

Commissioners thanked Assistant Planner Atamian for his quick responses to questions submitted in advance of tonight's meeting.

Chair Darden opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR BROWN, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 14-014, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, FINDING THE FISCAL YEAR 2014-2015 CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM CONSISTENT WITH THE SAN CLEMENTE GENERAL PLAN.

[ACTION SUBJECT TO CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL]

E. Lots 25-28, 43, 44, 48, 49, 54-57, and 71-75 of Tract 16336 – Amendment to Site Plan Permit 02-093 – Carillon at Talega (Gregg)

A request to consider modified floor plans and architecture for the remaining 17 of the 84 lot development. The project is located in the Residential Low density area of the Talega Specific Plan. The legal description is Lots 25-28, 43, 44, 48, 49, 54-57, and 71-75 of Tract 16336, and Assessor's Parcel Numbers 708-052-10-14, -28-31, -57-60, -36, -37, -41, and -42.

Chair pro tem Crandell recused himself from considering this item because Standard Pacific is one of his clients and removed himself from the meeting room.

Amber Gregg, Associate Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Carillon Architecture, AM SPP 02-093, dated May 21, 2014." She displayed a map indicating location of the subject lots, provided background of the project, reviewed the process summary, and displayed colored front elevations and color pallet of the new product. Staff recommended approval of the request as conditioned. She described

some of the proposed revisions to the home interiors, detailed changes made since the last project submittal, and noted the revised product reflects current buying trends. Staff recommended approval of the request as conditioned.

Crystal Burckle, representing Standard Pacific, thanked Amber Gregg, staff and Design Review Subcommittee (DRSC) members for their assistance with this project throughout the review process. She noted the proposed park will be installed with the first phase of this project, and described it as passive with irrigated landscaping, walkways, and benches. Following installation, it will be handed over to the homeowners association, which will maintain it in perpetuity. In addition, the builder will seek permission from the homeowners association to improve other median and landscaped areas throughout the tract. She pointed out home sites with prominent side elevations and described details added to those elevations to improve the appeal of the overall tract.

Chair Darden opened the public hearing.

Joseph Valenta and wife Betty, residents, opposed the proposed revised architecture as it is not in harmony with existing homes. They believe the new product will distract from the uniqueness of the existing homes and destroy the value of the neighborhood.

Rachel Struglia, resident, opposed the proposed revised architecture. She suggested the applicant be allowed to change the interior layout but retain the existing home exteriors, and noted disappointment that the colored renderings displayed did not feature the rear elevations. Her suggestions to improve the proposed architecture include wood beaming on the balconies, replacement of stuccoed rear support beam with a wood beam, addition of shutters to rear elevations, and addition of wood pop-outs and other design details for rear elevations, especially on those lots with rear elevations fronting Avenida Talega as it is considered a view corridor. In addition, she requested the applicants be required to re-landscape the street median.

Associate Planner Gregg noted in the original product the balconies were cantilevered whereas the new product features balconies on top of rooms, eliminating the need for support beams; pointed out shutters featured on the corner elevations.

Commissioner Kaupp commented that as DRSC member, he strives to incorporate five-sided architecture with each project; commented that the rear and side elevations as proposed will suffice and feature movement once landscaping is added; commended the applicant for extended outreach and frequent revisions to plans in response to comments from the area residents, DRSC, and staff.

Commissioner Ward supported the project with the condition that the stucco on the Spanish architecture homes match the existing Spanish product.

Vice Chair Brown commented that with the CC&R contract, the builder has the ability to change product; thanked the applicant for their efforts to accommodate the desires of existing residents.

Commissioner Ruehlin commended Ms. Struglia for her involvement and efforts on behalf of the neighborhood.

Chair Darden commended Associate Planner Gregg for her efforts to coordinate community meetings, as well as her work with the applicants and residents to resolve the issues at hand.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER WARD, AND CARRIED 6-0-1, WITH CHAIR PRO TEM CRANDELL ABSTAINING, TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 14-016, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING AMENDMENT TO SITE PLAN PERMIT 02-093, A REQUEST TO CONSIDER REVISED ARCHITECTURE AND FLOOR PLANS FOR 17 VACANT LOTS IN TRACT 16336 ALSO KNOWN AS "CARILLON," with the following revision:

Staff to add condition of approval requiring that the stucco treatment on all new Spanish plans match the stucco on the existing Spanish plans within the existing tract.

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]

Chair pro tem Crandell returned to the meeting room.

F. **2721 and 2723 South El Camino Real – Conditional Use Permit 14-084/Minor Exception Permit 14-085 – Koastal Duplex**

2725 and 2727 South El Camino Real – Conditional Use Permit 14-086/Minor Exception Permit 14-087 – Resmkv Duplex

2737 and 2739 South El Camino Real – Conditional Use Permit 14-088/Minor Exception Permit 14-089 – Cade Duplex

2729 and 2731 South El Camino Real – Conditional Use Permit 14-090/Minor Exception Permit 14-091 – Bellers Duplex

2733 and 2735 South El Camino Real – Conditional Use Permit 14-092/Minor Exception Permit 14-093 – SClementem Duplex (Gregg)

A request to consider five separate projects, each consisting of two duplexes to be built on ten separate, but contiguous lots. A Minor Exception Permit is requested for each project to consider walls exceeding 42 inches high in the front yard setback up to five feet, and MEP 14-093, Lot 114 requests a reduced side yard setback on the corner lot. The legal descriptions are Lots 114-122, of Block 938.

Amber Gregg, Associate Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "South El Camino Real Duplexes, dated May 21, 2014." She noted all the duplexes feature garages accessible from Calle Del Comercio and feature tandem parking and five-yard side yard setbacks. She displayed site plans, elevations, partial and full street scenes, and color boards. She reviewed each elevation in detail, including additional landscaping proposed to soften the corner lot, and described the Polynesian/Hawaiian architecture, bright color schemes, and design details meant to reflect the "surf culture" consistent with the design guidelines for this area. Staff recommended approval of the request as conditioned.

Michael Luna, architect representing the various property owners, commented that the proposed architecture brings a little bit of Hawaii to the City and reflects the City's long association with surfing. This is a contemporary interpretation of Polynesian style architecture, which is exciting, fun, and embraces color. The landscaped walls along the front elevation block noise from the freeway and provide privacy for tenants. Due to the 40 foot wide narrow lots, the corner lot needs a Minor Exception Permit in order to be consistent and complementary with the entire project. The project will define the City's surf zone, feature quality materials, and greatly improve the area.

Commissioner Ward established from Mr. Luna that in addition to the block walls, the project will feature triple glazed windows to help block freeway noise. Depending on the results of a study to be performed by a noise consultant, Mr. Luna advised that additional insulation may be added on the outside walls to ensure the comfort and quietness of the units. He agreed to add another tree to the corner lot landscaping that was unintentionally left off the drawing.

Chair Darden opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Crandell speculated that the walls and other measures should be able to handle the freeway noise; stated for the record that due to special circumstances the higher walls should be allowed for this location only and not set precedence for other properties along El Camino Real; requested this project come back for additional review if the noise

consultant recommends higher front walls; opposed enclosing the upstairs balconies for sound attenuation.

Commissioner Ruehlin agreed the proposed higher walls were appropriate for this site; supported the architectural style and color palette; commended the "surf zone" style launch for this area as proposed in GPAC and set forth in the General Plan; established that the wall along Avenida San Luis Rey was necessary to block noise traveling up the street.

Vice Chair Brown supported the project as proposed; commended Mr. Luna for this vision and efforts; commented the project will decrease the violations and complaints about these lots.

Commissioner Eggleston established from DRSC members that the blue color and entire color palette was honed and supported at the DRSC meeting; commended the property owners for their wisdom in banding together and hiring a premier architect such as Michael Luna; supported project details such as no curb cuts along El Camino Real; supported development of the property as solution to code enforcement actions and Sheriff Department activities.

Commissioner Ward supported the project for its high level of quality and architectural style in accordance with Design Guidelines and the General Plan. She supported adequate noise mitigation measures and agreed the project should come back for review if additional measures are proposed.

Vice Chair Brown suggested mobility and complete streets review for the area as well as traffic calming measures that will also serve to reduce noise levels.

Commissioner Kaupp commended the applicants for their efforts to improve a blighted area; supported the project as proposed; stated no problem with setting precedence due to unique situation.

Chair Darden thanked the applicants for making an investment in the City; commented that homes up the hill will also benefit from the improvement to the area; supported the "surf zone" vibe and colors of the project.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER KAUPP, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 14-017, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 14-084 AND MINOR EXCEPTION PERMIT 14-085, KOASTAL DUPLEXES, FOR TWO DUPLEXES LOCATED IN THE MIXED USE ZONING DISTRICT AT 2721 AND 2723 SOUTH EL CAMINO REAL.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR BROWN AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 14-018, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 14-086 AND MINOR EXCEPTION PERMIT 14-087, RESMKV DUPLEXES, FOR TWO DUPLEXES LOCATED IN THE MIXED USE ZONING DISTRICT AT 2725 AND 2727 SOUTH EL CAMINO REAL.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER WARD, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 14-019, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 14-088 AND MINOR EXCEPTION PERMIT 14-089, CADE DUPLEXES, FOR TWO DUPLEXES LOCATED IN THE MIXED USE ZONING DISTRICT AT 2729 AND 2731 SOUTH EL CAMINO REAL.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER KAUPP, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 14-020, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 14-090 AND MINOR EXCEPTION PERMIT 14-091, BELLERS DUPLEXES, FOR TWO DUPLEXES LOCATED IN THE MIXED USE ZONING DISTRICT AT 2733 AND 2735 SOUTH EL CAMINO REAL.

IT WAS MOVED BY CHAIR PRO TEM CRANDELL, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 14-021, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 14-092 AND MINOR EXCEPTION PERMIT 14-093, SCLEMENTEM DUPLEXES, FOR TWO DUPLEXES LOCATED IN THE MIXED USE ZONING DISTRICT AT 2737 AND 2739 SOUTH EL CAMINO REAL.

[DECISIONS FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]

9. **NEW BUSINESS** - None
10. **OLD BUSINESS** – None
11. **REPORTS OF COMMISSIONERS/STAFF**
 - A. Tentative Future Agenda
 - B. Minutes from the Zoning Administrator meeting of May 7, 2014
 - C. Staff Waiver 14-180, 261 W. Avenida Marquita

- D. Staff Waiver 14-181, 221 Avenida Fabricante
- E. Staff Waiver 14-182, 147 W. Avenida Ramona
- F. Staff Waiver 14-185, 147 W. Avenida Ramona
- G. Staff Waiver 14-191, 319 W. Avenida Palizada

Vice Chair Brown commented that at their last meeting, the Coastal Advisory Committee (CAC) received an update on the Poche Beach Action Plan and were notified that the State has approved funding for the Army Corps of Engineers Sand Replenishment Project slated to start in 2017.

Chair Darden commented that Commissioners that attended the recent Planners Institute will soon be presenting pertinent information at a Study Session.

City Planner Pechous reported that he met with consultants on the Local Coastal Plan and will be meeting with California Coastal Commission staff on Friday, May 30th at 1:00 p.m. in Conference Room A at Community Development. He invited Vice Chair Brown, who has been selected to represent the Planning Commission at the meetings.


12. ADJOURNMENT

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER KAUPP, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED to adjourn at 9:01 p.m. to the Adjourned Regular Meeting on May 28, 2014, at 6:00 p.m. in Council Chambers at City Hall located at 100 Avenida Presidio, San Clemente, CA.

Respectfully submitted,

Julia Darden, Chair

Attest:



Jim Pechous, City Planner