

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE
PLANNING COMMISSION
June 4, 2014 @ 7:00 p.m.
City Council Chambers
100 Avenida Presidio
San Clemente, CA**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Darden called the Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission of the City of San Clemente to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Commissioner Kaupp led the Pledge of Allegiance.

3. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Wayne Eggleston, Michael Kaupp, Jim Ruehlin, and Kathleen Ward; Chair pro tem Barton Crandell, Vice Chair Donald Brown and Chair Julia Darden

Commissioners Absent: None

Staff Present: Jim Pechous, City Planner
Sean Nicholas, Associate Planner
John Ciampa, Associate Planner
Adam Atamian, Assistant Planner
Zachary Ponsen, Senior Civil Engineer
Sharon Heider, Beaches, Parks & Recreation Director
Pam Passow, Recreation Manager
Ajit Thind, Assistant City Attorney
Eileen White, Recording Secretary

4. SPECIAL ORDERS OF BUSINESS - None

5. MINUTES

A. Minutes from the Planning Commission Regular Study Session of May 21, 2014

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR BROWN, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED to receive and file the minutes of the Regular Study Session of May 21, 2014, with the following revisions:

Page 4, 3rd paragraph, 1st sentence, delete "blue or"

B. Minutes from the Planning Commission Regular Meeting of May 21, 2014

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER KAUPP, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED to receive and file the minutes of the Regular Meeting of May 21, 2014, with the following revisions:

Page 9, 2nd paragraph, following "established" insert "from staff"

6. **ORAL AND WRITTEN COMMUNICATION - None**

7. **CONSENT CALENDAR - None**

8. **PUBLIC HEARING**

A. 220 West Paseo De Cristobal – Cultural Heritage Permit 14-077 – Harry Residence (Ciampa)

A request to consider an addition, attached patio cover, and new covered entry porch for a legal nonconforming one story house. The property abuts a historic house (217 Esplanade) to the rear. The project site is located at 220 West Paseo De Cristobal, legal description being Lot 10, Block 13, of Tract 822, Assessor's Parcel Number 692-242-20.

John Ciampa, Associate Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Harry Residence, CHP 14-077, dated June 4, 2014;" recommended approval of the request as conditioned.

Iain Buchan, the applicant, was available for questions.

Chair Darden opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

IT WAS MOVED BY VICE CHAIR BROWN, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 14-023, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING CULTURAL HERITAGE PERMIT 14-077, HARRY RESIDENCE, A REQUEST TO ALLOW AN ADDITION, ATTACHED PATIO COVER, AND NEW COVERED ENTRY PORCH FOR A LEGAL NON-CONFORMING HOUSE THAT IS ADJACENT TO A HISTORIC HOUSE, LOCATED AT 220 WEST PASEO DE CRISTOBAL.

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]

Jim Pechous, City Planner, commented that this is the type of project referred to in the study session.

B. 1606 North El Camino Real – Discretionary Sign Permit 14-066/Minor Cultural Heritage Permit 14-067 – Pep Boys Signage (Atamian)

A request to consider a Master Sign Program for an automobile service station, and exterior building and site modifications on a parcel within the Architectural and Pedestrian Overlays. The project is located at 1606 North El Camino Real in the Mixed-Use (MU2-P-A) zoning district. The legal description is Lots 16, 17, and 18, of Block 1, of Tract 821, Assessor's Parcel Number 692-371-11.

Adam Atamian, Assistant Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Pep Boys Signage, DSP 14-066/MCHP 14-067, dated June 4, 2014;" reviewed location map, project description, and required findings; displayed site plans, new paint colors, signage renderings, and new landscaping; advised the project's code enforcement violation has been sorted with no outstanding code enforcement issues at this time; commented that a member of the public asked that the Commission be informed that he is pleased with the project's lighting plans. Staff recommended approval of the request as conditioned.

In response to questions from the Commission, he commented that the height of the proposed blade sign is within code and is located to optimize visibility for southbound traffic; agreed to add a condition of approval requiring regular landscaping maintenance.

Dan Lorenzon, Loren Industries, representing the applicant, commented that the three Pep Boys likenesses on the blade sign, (referred to as the "mugs" in-house) are proposed as an iconic branding that is deemed preferable to small lettering on the sign, which is critical for optimizing visibility for southbound traffic, and located in order to keep light fixtures on the same plane as well as separate it from potential blockage such as landscaping, bus stops, and other types of existing clutter. In response to questions from the Commission, he advised that the proposed rosemary plants and queen palms were on the list of approved species, and his personal choice.

Commissioner Kaupp commended staff for the informative and complete staff report including the landscaping plan; suggested the applicant consider replacing the rosemary plants with ligustrum hedge as it is excellent screening material, hardy, and easy to maintain; recounted a similar situation on a building he owns located on an alley and currently

planted with ficus vines that only needed minimal watering in the beginning and now thrive without being watered.

Commissioner Ward suggested the applicant install vines on the west wall closest to the alley for the benefit of homes across the alley and as a deterrent to graffiti; agreed thicker landscaping appropriate for this site.

Allison Mathern, representing Pep Boys, advised that although installing vines on the west wall was considered, it was decided instead to provide an abundance of landscaping in the front; advised no consideration was given to potted plants between the maintenance bays as they would be impractical and/or likely to be hit by cars; commented that if the Commission requires the landscaping along the alleyway wall, they will comply, but noted there is currently no water source, and the pavement is compacted. It would be a challenge to establish the plants, and additionally a challenge to have the employees provide maintenance.

Chair Darden opened the public hearing, and there being no public testimony, closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Ruehlin suggested the Commission keep Ellie's Table and Bull Taco in mind while considering the quality of the signage and landscaping proposed for this site to ensure it reflects the character of the emerging neighborhood; endorsed smaller, more street oriented signage to enhance the pedestrian environment as well as additional landscaping; suggested the Commission consider bronze lettering, as was suggested at DRSC; cautioned that the proposed master sign program, which features twice the amount of signage allowed by right, would run with the property and therefore allow this much signage for future uses. Additionally, he suggested the applicant contact the North Beach Community Association, as they may be willing to help with beautification efforts.

Assistant Planner Atamian advised that the applicant worked well with staff to add landscaping to the site; noted it was suggested during review that the addition of landscaping in front was preferable to reduced landscaping in front and back; advised staff supported the Discretionary Sign Permit due to the building's siting on the lot; commented that the City's Municipal Code requires businesses to maintain landscaping and suggested adding a condition of approval to address landscaping would reiterate that.

Commissioner Eggleston suggested it is in the applicant's best interest to landscape the alleyway and best for the community and other businesses in the area.

Vice Chair Brown suggested the applicant consider employing landscaping contractors at the onset to ensure the plantings along the alleyway are properly maintained while being established.

Commissioners concurred to support the Master Sign Program as proposed with the addition of a condition of approval to address landscaping maintenance; addition of ficus, or other appropriate planting as approved during the landscaping approval process, to the alleyway; the replacement of the rosemary plants with privet or other type of bush that will provide screening of the parking lot from the street. In addition, they agreed the proposed color scheme was acceptable.

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER KAUPP, SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR BROWN, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 14-024, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING DISCRETIONARY SIGN PERMIT 14-066 AND MINOR CULTURAL HERITAGE PERMIT 14-067, PEP BOYS SIGNAGE, A REQUEST TO ALLOW A NEW MASTER SIGN PROGRAM FOR AN AUTOMOTIVE SERVICE USE, AND EXTERIOR BUILDING AND SITE MODIFICATIONS AT 1606 NORTH EL CAMINO REAL, with the following revisions:

Staff to add standard condition of approval (from the South El Camino Real Ralph's Grocery Store remodel) requiring the applicant to maintain the site landscaping.

Staff to add condition of approval requiring the applicant to add ficus repens vine landscaping to the rear, alley-facing wall of the building.

Staff to revise landscaping plan to replace rosemary plantings with privet style bushes adequately thick and tall enough to screen the parking lot.

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]

C. 987 Avenida Vista Hermosa– Amendment to Conditional Use Permit 10-105/Amendment to Architectural Permit 10-503/Discretionary Sign Permit 14-144 – Aloha Surf Company (Nicholas)

A request to consider amendments to a previously approved miniature golf facility, an illuminated surfing wave pool attraction, restaurant building, and new Master Sign Program for the project, located on the lease area within the Vista Hermosa Sports Park. The Park site is located at the southwest corner of the intersection of Avenida Vista Hermosa and La Pata and is a portion of Assessor's Parcel Number 124-081-64.

Sean Nicholas, Associate Planner, narrated a PowerPoint Presentation entitled, "Aloha Surf Company Amendments, formerly known as 'Surf 'n

Turf, dated June 4, 2014.” He displayed an aerial view of the site, site plans, and elevations; reviewed original approvals of the project; discussed other uses on site including wave pool equipment storage as well as locker and restroom details; described lighting, operations, and parking plans; reviewed restaurant operations including design layout, hours of operation, and second floor equipment requirements. Staff recommended approval of the request as conditioned.

In response to questions, Associate Planner Nicholas advised the restaurant’s alcoholic beverage services will be regulated by Alcoholic Beverage Control (ABC) regulations; noted the site will have occupancy requirements to ensure safety of all attendees; advised the applicant has indicated a willingness to provide bicycle parking; stated the landscaping was conceptual at this time and subject to additional review; advised plans call for the installation of Musco lighting, a company known for its reduction of light trespass and light pollution, as well as its promotion of dark skies lighting plans; noted the applicants assertion the proposed height of the building is necessary to house roof mounted equipment, including required clearances for ventilation purposes; noted the City has the ability to regulate parking needs for special events held at the wave pool; explained that the proposed parking meets code requirements.

City Planner Pechous suggested the Commission consider adding a condition of approval requiring the applicants to coordinate events with Beaches, Parks and Recreation Division staff to decrease potential for the City’s special events to be scheduled at the same time as those for the wave pool; noted special events will require a permit issued by the City at least 30 days in advance of the event.

Sharon Heider, Beaches, Parks & Recreation Director, advised the proposed use is new to the City and will require close coordination to ensure its successful coexistence with the sports park. She anticipates regular meetings for the purpose of calendar coordination and speculated that sincere efforts, shared goals, and open lines of communication would go a long way towards success.

Pam Passow, Recreation Manager, suggested they meet with the applicants once a month to coordinate events.

Derek Wolf, Wolf Designs, described efforts to provide articulation along the roof lines in addition to providing clearance for rooftop equipment and other electrical equipment; agreed to provide bicycle parking on site; noted intent to continue working with staff to refine landscaping plans and parking details; indicated on site plans the area to be used for equipment storage; advised they will make every effort to research and strive for appropriate actions for water conservation in light of the existing drought conditions; noted plans to install lighting with minimal negative impacts to surrounding residences and businesses. In response to questions, he

noted that although the restaurant building's upper windows appear blackened, they actually are louvered vents to match copper details on the building; agreed it is in their best interests to keep the noise levels generated by the wave pool pumps at a minimum.

Jourdan Groves, applicant, described efforts to locate pumps and equipment to reduce noise impacts to participants and adjacent uses; noted the pervasive sound will be gusts of water, similar to rivers or falls, which is soothing; advised sound measurements and studies are required; described the pool operation, which as designed will not pose problems with evaporation and will provide its own heating operation; provided information regarding partnerships, building contractors, professional organizations, investment groups, companies, and equipment providers associated with this project; described the benefits of the wave system chosen for this project over similar systems. He described proposed plans to provide catering style services to other areas at the park, including the community pool and sports fields, and agreed that measures would be taken to ensure trash is properly disposed of. The restaurant provider is using 4,000 square feet of the 5,000 square building; the additional 1,000 square feet is to accommodate changing rooms and lockers associated with the wave pool.

Chair Darden opened the public hearing.

Scott Bowen, resident and Pacific Homeowners Association president, representing homes located directly below the park site, noted the Pacific homeowners are very concerned with negative noise and lighting impacts to their homes caused by the proposed use. He commented that before the sports park was constructed the homeowners were able to view stars and the night sky, whereas now the homes closest to the site are subject to bright lights and noise, as well as loss of privacy due to the popularity of the jogging trail. He noted original plans called for use cutoff at 10:00 p.m. at night, rather than the 11:00 p.m. cutoff proposed as part of this project. City engineers did come to homeowners' backyards to test the light spillage, and deemed that the existing range is acceptable.

Chair Darden closed the public hearing.

Beaches, Parks, and Recreation Director Heider advised she visited many of the homeowners' bedrooms in response to complaints when the sports park was constructed. She noted residents are viewing lights off in the distance, but light levels in their bedrooms are not affected. The existing lights point directly down, and the new ones proposed are similarly designed. These are the first complaints she has heard about light spillage into backyards, and her staff will check the levels. Because the homes are located below the sports park, there is no way to screen the lighting to ensure it is not seen from a distance. In response to questions from the Commission, she speculated as to elements that might be

considered for inclusion when the proposed community center is in its design stage; noted the City is leasing the land for use as the miniature golf range; advised the park currently closes down operations at 10:00 p.m., with security lighting left on until 11:00 p.m. for maintenance and clean-up. In addition, she noted the City Council previously created a lease with the applicants, and a 5,000 square foot building was included.

Mr. Wolf offered to provide decibel levels and noise study to the Commission for better understanding of the noise level generated by the wave pool. He noted the size of the parking lot was reduced, and its use was made more efficient by design. The lighting proposed is the least intrusive available in terms of light pollution and exposure. He noted they are required to return to DRSC for additional review to ensure adequate quality of materials and architectural design, as well as to address massing and other issues.

Associate Planner Nicholas reviewed the condition related to the required light study, which will be performed by the lighting manufacturer, who is dark skies compliant. In addition, the lighting will be fully shielded. He noted that although the existing soccer field lights are 70 feet high, the proposed lighting for the new uses will be below the berm, which will help to camouflage the lighting from the nearby residences. He advised the project heights are in compliance with all applicable guidelines, and the proposed height of the building is equal to or less than the existing heights of the Aquatic Center building.

During the ensuing discussion, the Commissioners, either individually or in agreement, provided the following commentary:

- Requested a sound study as a required condition of approval to ensure sound levels do not exceed the existing sound ordinance and are compliant with the original environmental document associated with the project.
- Requested inclusion of a condition of approval requiring bicycle parking, starting with a base number to be set by Beaches, Parks and Recreation Division staff, with eventual accommodating in phases of up to a maximum of 20 if staff deems necessary.
- Requested a condition of approval requiring special event planning coordination with Beaches, Parks and Recreation staff to ensure minimal impacts related to parking and attendance issues.
- Set the last call for alcohol and food sales at 9:30 at both the wave pool area and restaurant.
- Speculated the project would be hugely successful.
- Commented the success of the project, and resulting heavy use of parking, may impact the size and usage of future amenities planned for the park, such as a gymnasium and community center.

- Commented that the facility may require a greater area of bicycle parking space due to its potential popularity with a younger age group, with young people attaching their surfboards to racks on the bicycles.

IT WAS MOVED BY CHAIR PRO TEM CRANDELL, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER EGGLESTON, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. PC 14-025, A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN CLEMENTE, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING AN AMENDMENT TO CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 10-105, AMENDMENT TO ARCHITECTURAL PERMIT 10-503, AND DISCRETIONARY SIGN PERMIT 14-144, ALOHA SURF COMPANY, A REQUEST TO ESTABLISH A MINIATURE GOLF, WAVE POOL ATTRACTION, AND SINGLE DESTINATION RESTAURANT WITHIN THE VISTA HERMOSA SPORTS PARK LEASE AREA, with the following revisions:

Staff to add condition of approval 28 requiring that, prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall submit a noise study completed by an acoustic professional for the entire lease area to ensure noise levels are compliant with the City's Noise Ordinance and the project's original environmental document.

Staff to add condition of approval 29 requiring that, prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall submit a phasing plan to provide bicycle parking of up to a maximum of 20 spaces to the satisfaction of the Beaches, Parks, and Recreation Director.

Staff to add condition of approval 30 requiring the applicant to get a yearly Special Activities Permit, and shall require a 30 day notification of any special event outside of the normal range of activities in order to be reviewed and coordinated with Beaches, Parks and Recreation staff.

Page 8, condition no. 7, shall be replaced with the following: "Sports lighting shall be turned off at 10:00 pm. Services associated with the lease area shall cease operation at 9:30 pm with all customers off-site by 10:00 pm. All clean-up and staff shall be off-site by 11:00 pm."

Page 10, condition no. 16, add to the end of the condition: "The photometric plan shall ensure that no light spillage or light trespass occurs."

[DECISION FINAL. SUBJECT TO APPEAL OR CALL UP BY COUNCIL]

Chair Darden commended the Commission for its exhaustive review of this project, including looking at it from every angle to ensure its compatibility with the neighborhood. She thanked the applicants and staff for all their efforts.

9. NEW BUSINESS - None

10. OLD BUSINESS – None

11. REPORTS OF COMMISSIONERS/STAFF

- A. Tentative Future Agenda
- B. Minutes from the Zoning Administrator meeting of May 21, 2014
- C. Staff Waiver 14-196, 120 S. El Camino Real
- D. Staff Waiver 14-208, 1640 N. El Camino Real
- E. Staff Waiver 14-216, 101 Via Pico Plaza

Vice Chair Brown announced the next meeting of the Coastal Advisory Committee on June 12, 2014, at 7:00 p.m. in the Ole Hanson Fireside Room at the Community Center.


12. ADJOURNMENT

IT WAS MOVED BY COMMISSIONER RUEHLIN, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER KAUPP, AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED to adjourn at 10:06 p.m. to the Adjourned Regular Meeting on June 18, 2014, at 6:00 p.m. in Council Chambers at City Hall located at 100 Avenida Presidio, San Clemente, CA.

Respectfully submitted,

Julia Darden, Chair

Attest:



Jim Pechous, City Planner